Swimming speeds of Mediterranean settlement-stage fish larvae nuance Hjort's aberrant drift hypothesis

Faillettaz Robin ¹, Durand Elysanne ¹, Paris Claire B. ², Koubbi Philippe ³, Irisson Jean-Olivier ^{1, *}

¹ Univ Paris 06, UPMC, Sorbonne Univ, CNRS,Lab Oceanog Villefranche sur Mer LOV, Villefranche Sur Mer, France.

² Univ Miami, Rosenstiel Sch Marine & Atmospher Sci, Ocean Sci, 4600 Rickenbacker Causeway, Miami, FL 33149 USA.

³ Univ Paris 06, UPMC, Sorbonne Univ, UCBN, CNRS, MNHN, IRD, Biol ORganismes & Ecosyst Aquat BOREA, Paris, France.

* Corresponding author : Jean-Olivier Irisson, email address : irisson@normalesup.org

Abstract :

Historically, the mortality of early-life stages of marine fishes was supposed to be mostly caused by poor feeding during a critical period and aberrant drifting away from favorable recruitment areas. While fish larvae may display remarkable swimming abilities, Hjort's aberrant drift hypothesis has rarely been tested. In this study, we measured critical swimming speed (Ucrit) of settlement-stage larvae of six coastal, warm temperate Mediterranean fish species, for which no data were previously available (Sparidae: Boops boops, Diplodus annularis, Spicara smaris, Spondyliosoma cantharus; Pomacentridae: Chromis chromis; Mugilidae sp.). Their swimming speeds were comparable with those of other temperate species, but also with the speeds of tropical species, which are considered as very fast swimmers. Mugilidae were the fastest (29.2 cm s(-1)), followed by Pomacentridae (22.8 cm s(-1)) and Sparidae (11.6 cm s(-1)). Most larvae swam in an inertial regime (Reynolds number > 1000). Those swimming speeds were then implemented in a Lagrangian model of the competency period of these species, set in the same area (the Ligurian Sea) and at the same time (June 2014) as the observations. In this modeling experiment, directional swimming strongly increased the proportion of successful settlers, independent of mesoscale hydrological structures. Fish larvae could settle on the coast from as far as tens of kilometers offshore, in just 4 d. These findings suggest that aberrant drift is unlikely to occur for strong swimming temperate larvae and show that larval behavior should be considered on equal footing with ocean currents when assessing larval fish dispersal.

39 Introduction

40 Most coastal fish species undergo a pelagic larval phase. Predicting recruitment in adult 41 populations after this larval phase is a major challenge in marine ecology, and remains difficult 42 because the factors determining larval dispersal and survival are not all identified (Cowen et al. 43 2007; Botsford et al. 2009). Over a century ago, in a founding publication, Johan Hjort suggested 44 that survival of early life stages determines the adult fish populations size (Hjort 1914). He 45 postulated two main hypotheses: first, larval fish pools may be depleted by starvation if prey are 46 not available during the "critical period" of first-feeding; second, larvae are transported by 47 currents and may face important mortality if they "aberrant[ly] drift" away from favorable 48 recruitment sites. Built on observations on a few cold-temperate species, those hypotheses had 49 been generalized and now form the basis of the understanding of the fish's larval phase in all 50 oceans (Houde 2008). Most attention has been focused on the critical period, leading to other 51 feeding-related explanations of survival rates such as the "match-mismatch" (Cushing 1973), the 52 "stable ocean" (Lasker 1981), and the "optimal environmental window" hypotheses (Cury and 53 Roy 1989). All three identify favorable environmental conditions for first-feeding by fish larvae 54 that should therefore result in higher recruitment, although survival could also be modulated by 55 predation (Miller et al. 1988). Fewer studies dealt with the "aberrant drift hypothesis" (Houde 56 2008), with the exception of the concept of "larval retention/membership-vagrancy" (Iles and 57 Sinclair 1982; Sinclair 1988; Sinclair and Power 2015). It states that physical retention of early-58 life stages is critical for recruitment and is dependent on adult fishes spawning in appropriate 59 places, when and where conditions are conducive for eggs and larvae retention. While dispersal 60 distances can sometimes reach hundreds of kilometers (Kinlan and Gaines 2003), high self-61 recruitment rates have also been observed (Jones et al. 2005; Cowen et al. 2006; Gerlach et al. 62 2007). These levels of self-recruitment are unlikely to occur only through physical retention of

63 passively drifting particles (Jones et al. 1999). In the meantime, fish larvae have been shown to 64 swim fast and, at least in some perciform species, in an orientated manner over short distances 65 using coast-dependent cues (e.g., sounds, odors; reviewed in Leis 2006). Oriented swimming may 66 not be limited to coastal areas, however, as fish larvae also perceive and use coast-independent 67 cues such as the position of the sun (Mouritsen et al. 2013; Faillettaz et al. 2015). Overall, fish 68 larvae seem to have the potential to influence their dispersal (Fisher 2005; Pattrick and Strydom 69 2009; Faria et al. 2014), but the actual quantitative consequences of this potential remain largely 70 unexplored.

71 Various methods are used to study larval fish dispersal (Cowen et al. 2007), although modeling is 72 the only approach that enables consideration of behavior throughout the pelagic larval phase 73 (Werner et al. 2007; North et al. 2009). In most modeling studies, simulations including 74 swimming behavior resulted in striking differences compared to simulations of passively drifting 75 larvae. For example, vertical swimming was necessary to match observed ichthyoplankton 76 distributions around Barbados (Paris and Cowen 2004); downward vertical swimming of 1 to 3 cm s⁻¹ greatly enhanced larval retention on the shelf in Georges Bank, Newfoundland, and 77 78 Norway (Werner et al. 1993; Pepin and Helbig 1997; Fiksen et al. 2007); horizontal, shoreward 79 swimming during the larval phase resulted in a marked improvement in the recruitment rate in 80 Florida or the Great Barrier Reef (Wolanski et al. 1997; Porch 1998; Wolanski and Kingsford 81 2014); early horizontal swimming and increasing behavioral abilities along ontogeny reduced 82 dispersal distance and improved settlement along the Florida Keys (Staaterman et al. 2012). 83 Studies that included horizontal swimming used theoretical (Wolanski et al. 1997; Porch 1998) or 84 literature-based estimates of average swimming speeds of similar species in other locations 85 (Staaterman et al. 2012; Wolanski and Kingsford 2014). To our knowledge, none parameterized

their model with actual measurements of species' swimming speeds in their study location.

87 Furthermore, those studies are still rare, and most simulate passive or only vertically-migrating

89 Measures of swimming abilities depend on the ecological question addressed (reviewed in Leis 90 2006; Fisher and Leis 2010). For dispersal models, endurance, in situ and critical speed are most 91 relevant. Endurance is measured by making fish larvae swim against a flow of fixed speed 92 (usually 13.5 cm s⁻¹) to estimate the time and distance they could potentially swim in a typical 93 coastal environment. For instance, settlement-stage larvae of 23 pomacentrid species were able to 94 swim for 2 days on average, covering 25 km without feeding or resting; and those were at the 95 lower end of the range of endurance measured (Stobutzki and Bellwood 1997). In most cases, 96 feeding larvae during trials at least doubled, often tripled their endurance while their growth was 97 comparable to individuals not forced to swim (Leis and Clark 2005). This suggests that, in their 98 natural environment, late-stage fish larvae should be able to swim over tens to hundreds of 99 kilometers while maintaining a good body condition. In situ swimming speed is measured by 100 scuba divers following a larva that moves freely in open water. In 60 tropical species, in situ speed was around 15–20 cm s⁻¹ (Fisher and Leis 2010). Larvae have been observed to feed on the 101 102 go during in situ speed measurements (Leis and Carson-Ewart 1998; Leis and Clark 2005; Leis 103 2006) and the recorded speeds average slow downs during foraging events and increases in 104 between. Because larvae are not forced to swim and still feed while swimming, in situ speed is 105 the best available measure of what larvae actually do in the field, and should be maintainable 106 over long periods of time (Leis 2006). Critical speed (U_{crit}) is measured by swimming larvae 107 against a flow of known speed, and regularly increasing the speed until the larva fatigues. It 108 quantifies both forced swimming speed and endurance in a standardized manner (Plaut 2001),

⁸⁸ larvae (Miller 2007; Werner et al. 2007; North et al. 2009).

109 which allows comparisons between species and regions.

110 Based on U_{crit}, larvae of temperate species have been considered mostly passive while tropical 111 species were 'effective swimmers', meaning they can overcome average currents (Stobutzki and 112 Bellwood 1994) at least at the end of their larval stage. For Perciformes however, settlement-113 stage larvae of temperate and warm-temperate species have been observed to swim at speeds 114 comparable to their tropical counterparts, even though size at settlement is often larger in tropical 115 larvae (~30 cm s⁻¹; Clark et al. 2005; Leis 2006; Pattrick and Strydom 2009). Still, such 116 comparisons are scarce because U_{crit} has been measured for only 20 temperate perciform species, 117 including both reared (e.g., Koumoundouros et al. 2009; Faria et al. 2011; Leis et al. 2012) and 118 wild-caught larvae (Dudley et al. 2000; Pattrick and Strydom 2009) — without noticeable difference between reared and wild larvae (Faria et al. 2009) - while Ucrit has been published for 119 120 over 100 perciform coral reef fish species (e.g., Stobutzki and Bellwood 1997; Fisher 2005; Leis et al. 2011). In the tropics, U_{crit} at settlement ranges from 5 to > 60 cm s⁻¹ with a mode around 121 30 cm s⁻¹. Average U_{crit} and in situ speeds correlated at species ($R^2 = 0.32$, p = 0.002) and family 122 $(R^2 = 0.84, p < 0.0001)$ levels based on 36 comparable perciform species, which showed in situ 123 124 speed equals about half U_{crit} (Leis and Fisher 2006). The easy to measure, laboratory-based U_{crit} 125 can therefore be used to estimate the more biologically-meaningful in situ speed.

Most studies which assessed swimming speeds concluded that swimming may significantly influence dispersal (Leis 2007; Pattrick and Strydom 2009; Faria et al. 2014). Yet, none explicitly tested it or only through simple distance-swum computation (Stobutzki and Bellwood 1997). In this study, we measured the critical swimming speed of settlement-stage larvae of coastal temperate fish species for which no data is available. We focused on competent, well-developed fish larvae at the end of their pelagic phase, which may therefore swim fast and need to rapidly find a suitable habitat to settle (Leis 2006). We then used those observed swimming speeds to parameterize the behavioral module of a Lagrangian dispersal model, forced by realistic current fields in our region of study. We used the model to explicitly test the "aberrant drift hypothesis" by determining how far offshore a larva could have drifted, while still being able to swim back to the coast within its short competency period.

137 Materials and methods

138 Study area

139 This study was conducted in the Ligurian Sea, in the Northwestern Mediterranean Sea. The 140 hydrography of the region is dominated by the Ligurian Current present throughout the year 141 (Béthoux and Prieur 1983; Stemmann et al. 2008). It is approximately 25 km wide, flows in a south-westward direction at an average speed of 25-35 cm s⁻¹ and spans from the surface to 142 about 200 m depth (ca. 1.4 Sv, i.e. 1.4×10^6 m³ s⁻¹; Figure 1.a; Stemmann et al. 2008). It creates a 143 144 marked hydrological front that is believed to act as a barrier to the offshore export of coastal 145 particles (Boucher et al. 1987; Pedrotti and Fenaux 1992; Goffart et al. 1995). Settlement-stage fish larvae (hereafter referred as "fish larvae") were caught in the Bay of 146 147 Villefranche-sur-Mer (43.69°N, 7.31°E). It is open to oceanic waters (bottom depth drops to 148 > 300 m at the mouth of the bay; Figure 1.b) and is known to host rich oceanic plankton 149 communities (Vandromme et al. 2011; Dolan 2014). Very little information is available on the 150 reproductive behavior of coastal fish species in the Ligurian Sea (P. Francour and P. Guidetti, 151 pers. comm.), although the bay may act a nursery area due to numerous seagrass beds 152 (Guidetti 2000). Weekly sampling over two years confirmed its suitability for fish settlement, 153 with large catches of larvae throughout spring and early summer (Faillettaz 2015).

154 Swimming speed measurements

155 Fish larvae collection

156 Fish larvae were collected with CARE light traps (Lecaillon 2004). They are composed of a 157 buoyant block with a 55 W LED light and a 2 m conical net made of 2 mm PVC mesh with a 158 funnel in the middle (Figure S1). Settling larvae of many coastal fish species are attracted to light 159 and descend in the net in search of a settlement substrate. This type of traps has proved to be 160 effective at capturing fish larvae in the Mediterranean Sea (Catalán et al. 2014). Moorings were 161 placed at three sites separated by several hundreds of meters, all with bottom depth > 20 m 162 (Figure 1.b), and catches were later pooled to capture recruitment at the scale of the bay. Light 163 traps were set one to two hours before sunset and retrieved one hour after sunrise, four days a 164 week, between May and July 2014. Catches at the three sites were extremely heterogeneous from 165 day to day, probably reflecting the patchiness of fish larvae in open waters (Faillettaz 2015). Fish 166 larvae were sorted visually and kept in 30 L buckets. In the laboratory, buckets were placed in a 167 temperature-controlled room at 19°C (close to or slightly lower than seawater temperature 168 measured in situ). Every effort was made to minimize stress to the specimens: larvae were sorted 169 with small water containers (never hand-nets), fed once a day with living Artemia nauplii, 170 protected from intense light and noise sources. We focused on six common and abundant 171 perciform species. In four other species, only one individual was tested but results were still 172 reported for completeness and because no other data exists (Table 1).

173 Measurement of critical speed

174 Swimming speeds were measured with a swimming chamber (Loligo Systems, #SW10000). It

175 comprises a 30 L ambient tank, a cylindrical swimming tunnel of 26.4 mm diameter \times 100 mm

- 176 length (volume = 170 mL) and a speed controller. The flow speed inside the tunnel was
 - 8

calibrated by filming fluorescent balls of neutral density at 120 frames per second and estimating the time spent to travel a fixed distance from the number of frames. Flow speed was measured 10 times for 12 positions of the speed controller to validate that it increased linearly, as per the manufacturer's specification, and calibrate its intensity (y = 7.4x - 2.9, $F_{(1,123)} = 4333$, $R^2 = 0.97$, $p < 10^{-16}$).

182 To account for the potential influence of temperature, larvae were acclimatized at 19 °C for at

183 least one hour prior to any measurement in the temperature-controlled room, and all

184 measurements were conducted at this same temperature. Critical swimming speed (U_{crit}) was

185 measured by increasing flow speed by 1.9 cm s^{-1} every 5 min until the larva fatigued and could

186 not hold its position in the tunnel. This protocol avoids overestimating U_{crit}, as shorter time-steps

187 would give more importance to maximum swimming speed than endurance (Fisher et al. 2005).

188 U_{crit} was computed using the formula provided by Brett (1964), as $U_{crit} = U + (t/t_i \times U_i)$; where

189 U is the penultimate speed (the last one for which the larva swam the full 5 min), U_i the speed

190 increment (1.9 cm s⁻¹), *t* the time swum at the final speed (in s), and t_i the time increment

191 $(5 \min = 300 \text{ s}).$

A total of 153 larvae were tested; 77% on the day of their capture, 91% within 24 h and all within

193 3 days. After observation, fish larvae were identified to species-level based on Lo Bianco (1931).

194 Their standard length (SL) was measured to the closest 0.1 mm using an image capture software

under a stereomicroscope (NIS Element 4.11 D, Nikon®).

196 Data analysis

197 To determine if the hydrological environment in which larvae swam was inertial or viscous, we

198 computed the Reynolds number (Re) as $Re = U_{crit} \times L_{SL} \times v^{-1}$; where U_{crit} is the measured

199 critical swimming speed, L_{SL} the standard length, and v the kinematic viscosity of sea water (at

 20° C v = 1.03×10^{-6} m² s⁻¹; Fuiman and Batty 1997). For each species, a Kruskal-Wallis test was 200 201 used to check whether the delay between larvae collection and speed measurement influenced 202 U_{crit}, using the number of days since collection as the grouping variable. U_{crit} was also compared 203 among species, sites, and collection dates using non-parametric procedures, because residuals of 204 parametric analyses were never normally distributed. Kruskal-Wallis and pairwise Wilcoxon tests 205 with Benjamini-Hochberg correction for multiple testing (Benjamini and Hochberg 1995) were 206 used to compare medians and Fligner tests to compare variances (Conover et al. 1981). To check 207 for the usual assumption that swimming speed increases with size (Leis 2010), U_{crit} was regressed 208 on standard length; linear, exponential, and logarithmic relationships were assessed and the 209 Shapiro test was applied on residuals to check their normality.

210 Modeling experiment

Back in 1914, Hjort already noted that "It is possible that many individuals perish during [...]
drifting movements: nothing is, however, definitely known as to this. It would be especially
desirable to ascertain the extent of such movement, and how far the young fry are able to return,
of their own volition, to such localities as offer favorable condition; for their further growth".
This was exactly the goal of the modeling experiment presented here: quantifying how directional
swimming during the end of the pelagic life of fish larvae influences their ability to reach coastal
habitats, while fully considering advection by oceanic currents.

218 Hydrodynamic and Lagrangian models

219 Ocean current fields were provided by MARS3DMed (Ifremer). This model is described in detail

in Lazure and Dumas (2008) and has been validated with observations (Pairaud et al. 2011).

- 221 Current fields are available every 3 hours, with a 1/64° grid size (ca. 1.2 km) over 60 sigma
- layers, and cover most of the NW Mediterranean Sea, from 0°E to 15°E and 39.5°N to 44.5°N.

223	We used	current fields	of June 2014.	when larval fi	ish settlement v	was at its peak in 2014

224 (Faillettaz 2015) and when critical speeds were measured in this study.

225 Virtual larvae were simulated using the open-source Connectivity Modeling System (CMS; Paris 226 et al. 2013b). At each time-step, this Lagrangian model couples deterministic physical variables 227 from a hydrodynamic model with probabilistic, individual-based biological characteristics such 228 as spawning (location and date), mortality and vertical migration (diel and ontogenic). Of 229 particular interest here, the CMS is the only full-fledged Lagrangian model that also comprises a biased and correlated random walk sub-model, which controls the swimming speed (in cm s^{-1}) 230 231 and orientation of particles (Staaterman et al. 2012). The precision of orientation is set by the k232 parameter of a Von Mises distribution (the circular equivalent of a Normal distribution), which 233 ranges from 0 (no orientation) to 5 (narrow cone of orientation, high accuracy; Codling et al. 234 2004). Settlement zones are defined as polygons, drawn by adding a spatial buffer around actual 235 settlement habitat. When a competent larva enters a polygon, it is considered as settled and stops 236 moving, assuming that it will successfully reach the closest favorable settlement habitat within 237 the polygon.

Horizontal diffusivity was set to 5.5 cm² s⁻¹ based on diffusion diagrams from Okubo (1971), and
the time-step was set to 900 seconds (1/12th of the hydrodynamic model output time-step).
Maximum current speeds were around 50 cm s⁻¹, which resulted in a maximum passive
displacement of 0.45 km within one time step, well below the 1.2 km grid size, hence avoiding
numerical issues during trajectory computation.

243 Simulations scenarios

244 To determine from how far offshore a larva would be able to return to a favorable settlement

245 habitat on the coast, no matter its previous drift history, virtual larvae were seeded everywhere in 246 the Ligurian Sea at nodes of a regular 10-km grid ranging from 42.5°N to 44.5°N and from 5°E 247 to 9.6°E (647 sites in total; Figure 1.a). To capture temporal and 3-D spatial variability, 50 virtual 248 larvae were released at each node, on three sigma layers (approximately at 1, 5, and 15 m depth), 249 once a day, for 25 days. Larvae were tracked for four days, the average duration of the 250 competency period for the species studied (Raventós and Macpherson 2001). Seven swimming 251 speed scenarios were simulated: passive particles and virtual larvae constantly swimming at half 252 the average U_{crit} measured in this study (i.e. the estimated in situ speed) for four representative 253 species groups and for the overall slowest and fastest larvae (Table 2). The whole coast was considered a potential settlement habitat, divided in $\sim 8 \text{ km}^2$ CMS polygons ($\sim 4 \text{ km}$ of coastline \times 254 2 km offshore, $n_{polygons} = 265$). Swimming was directed towards the closest coastal centroid from 255 256 the larva at each time step, and orientation precision was high (k = 4 in the CMS, estimated by)257 fitting Von Mises distributions to the orientation bearings recorded in Faillettaz et al. 2015). Any 258 larva reaching a polygon within the four simulated days was considered settled. In total, almost 259 2.5 million (n = 2,426,250) larvae were tracked per simulation.

260 Justification of modeling hypotheses

261 We measured critical speed on settlement-stage larvae and speed increases linearly or

262 exponentially with size in perciform species (tropical: Fisher et al. 2000; Leis et al. 2007;

temperate: Clark et al. 2005; Faria et al. 2009). We therefore focused on the short competency

264 period only, when the speeds we measured would still be relevant. Fish larvae can swim and feed

265 efficiently at this stage (Leis 2010). Still, their daytime swimming behavior varies depending on

food density for example (Leis 2006), although these patterns are very under-documented. Here,

swimming speeds were set to the estimated in situ speed $(0.5 \times U_{crit})$ which accounts for these

268 feeding-related changes (Leis and Carson-Ewart 1998; Leis and Clark 2005; Leis 2006). As 269 mentioned in the introduction, in situ speed may be sustainable over very long periods 270 (Leis 2006). Without feeding, endurance was around 2 days (or 25 km) of tropical species 271 morphologically and taxonomically close to those under study (Stobutzki and Bellwood 1997). 272 Fed larvae of tropical Pomacentridae swam 5.5 days on average, at $0.4 \times U_{crit}$ (i.e. over 65 km), 273 and grew as fast as control specimens not forced to swim (Leis and Clark 2005). Therefore, 274 $0.5 \times U_{crit}$ was plausibly sustainable over the four simulated days. In addition, most successful 275 settlers swam less than four days: 50% arrived before the end of day 2 and 75% before day 3. The 276 median distance covered was 32 km and 90% of trajectories were shorter than 55 km, which 277 included the displacement due to advection, so the distance swum was even less. 278 Mediterranean larvae of Sparidae and Mugilidae (9 of the 10 species tested) are mostly 279 concentrated in the upper 10 m of the water column, with very limited to negligible diel vertical 280 migration (Collins and Stender 1989; Olivar and Sabatés 1997). Larvae were therefore simulated 281 on fixed, near-surface sigma levels. 282 Fish larvae are capable of swimming directionally in the ocean over short distances using coastal 283 cues (Simpson et al. 2005; Paris et al. 2013a; Leis et al. 2015) and there is increasing evidence 284 that larvae can sense and orientate relative to coast-independent cues, such as the position of the 285 sun (Berenshtein et al. 2014; Faillettaz et al. 2015) or a magnetic compass (Bottesch et al. 2016). 286 In particular, the orientation abilities of six species tested here (B. boops, C. chromis, D. 287 annularis, O. melanura, S. smaris and S. cantharus) were investigated in the same location and 288 time of the year (Faillettaz et al. 2015). The vast majority of individuals (> 85%) followed a 289 cardinal bearing while in blue waters and most used the sun's azimuth as a compass, suggesting a 290 potential mechanism for large-scale orientation in the open ocean that is particularly relevant for

larval dispersal. Shoreward swimming at the end of the larval phase is a relatively simple
behavior that may be mechanistically possible, would increase survival, and should therefore be
strongly selected for, given the intense mortality experienced by fish larvae (Houde 2008). More
complex behaviors, such as course-corrected orientation, would be even more favorable but the
sensory mechanisms and cognitive requirements involved are still unexplored. Simple shoreward
orientation was implemented to compute a plausible maximum influence of directional
swimming on advection trajectories based on the current state of knowledge.

298 All modeled species live in different coastal habitats (sparids settle in seagrass and rocky or soft 299 bottoms, C. chromis live in rocky reefs and mugilids in shallow nearshore environments; Nelson 300 et al. 2016) but the geomorphology of the study region is homogeneous, with rocky capes and 301 sheltered bays every few kilometers from Genova (Italy) to Toulon (France). Favorable 302 settlement habitats for were therefore assumed to be distributed everywhere along the coast. 303 Given the scale of the study (~500 km of coastline) relative to the size of the settlement polygons 304 (4 km of coastline) and of the grid (1.2 km), the possible small deviations from this assumption 305 would have little influence on the results. In addition, the region is characterized by a narrow 306 continental shelf with bottom depth > 300 m within a kilometer from the coastline. The offshore 307 expansion of coastal habitats, and of the coastal fish populations they support, is therefore limited 308 to nearshore areas (≤ 1 km). To avoid boundary issues in the interpolation scheme, we considered 309 that virtual fish larvae could detect a coastal settlement habitat as far as 2 km (1.5 grid point) 310 from the shore (e.g. using olfaction; Gerlach et al. 2007; Paris et al. 2013a), and quickly reach it 311 by swimming. Such an assumption is common in Lagrangian models (Cowen et al. 2006; 312 Wolanski and Kingsford 2014) because settlement habitats and processes cannot be described at 313 the appropriate scale given the coarseness of the models' grids (~1.2 km here). Finally, mortality

314 would have decreased the observed proportion of settlement but was not considered in the model 315 because only constant mortality rates could have been implemented which would not have altered 316 the relative settlement rates predicted.

Overall, while this model was clearly meant to represent an upper bound for the influence of
directional swimming on dispersal trajectories, to be contrasted with mostly passive simulations,
its configuration was based on realistic assumptions.

320 Data analysis

321 For each simulation, the proportion of successful settlers among the 2.5 million simulated larvae 322 was computed as the number of virtual larvae that entered the coastal polygons within four days 323 of their release. The proportion of settlers was then regressed against swimming speed to quantify 324 the increase in settlement associated with increased swimming abilities. The probability of 325 settlement from any point in the simulation domain was computed and mapped for each release 326 node (integrated over the three depths), and the resulting values were linearly interpolated. To 327 quantify how swimming speed influenced the distance from the coast up to which a significant 328 proportion of larvae could still settle, the distance between the coast and the isoline of 50% 329 settlement probability was computed and averaged over the domain.

330 Results

331 Swimming speed

332 Swimming speed was not significantly different among collection sites or collection dates 333 (Kruskal-Wallis, p > 0.05 for all species; Table S1). The delay between specimen collection and 334 speed measurement did not influence swimming speed either (Kruskal-Wallis, p > 0.05 for all 335 species; Table S1), so all data were pooled.

336	Critical swimming speeds ranged from 5.3 to 37.4 cm s ⁻¹ (Figure 3; Table 2). Pairwise tests
337	highlighted that Mugilidae sp. were significantly faster than all others, followed by C. chromis
338	and then S. cantharus, while S. smaris, D. annularis and B. boops were similar to each other. In
339	four species, a single individual was tested. Dentex dentex, P. pagrus, and P. acarne presented
340	U _{crit} comparable with <i>S. cantharus</i> (Table 2; Figure 3) and were associated with a "large sparids"
341	group because settlement-stage larvae of these four species are large (mean $SL = 14.2 \text{ mm}$),
342	muscular, pigmented, and have well developed fins. <i>Oblada melanura</i> swam at 13.1 cm s ⁻¹ ,
343	which is very close to U _{crit} of <i>B. boops</i> , <i>D. annularis</i> and <i>S. smaris</i> (Table 2; Figure 3). These
344	four species were thus grouped together as "small sparids" because their post-larvae are all
345	smaller (mean $SL = 9.7$ mm), slenderer, less pigmented and seemingly less developed than those
346	of the large sparids group (Figure 2). When swimming speeds were pooled across species within
347	each group, large sparids swam significantly faster than small sparids (Wilcoxon, $p < 0.001$).
348	When swimming speed was standardized by body length to account for large differences in size
349	between species, Mugilidae sp. and C. chromis had similar U _{crit} (ca. 24 BL s ⁻¹ ; pairwise-
350	Wilcoxon, $p = 0.66$). Likewise, the Sparidae S. cantharus, S. smaris and D. annularis shared
351	comparable U_{crit} (14.8 BL s ⁻¹ , 11.5 BL s ⁻¹ and 11.5 BL s ⁻¹ respectively; pairwise-Wilcoxon, all
352	p > 0.05). Other Sparidae in which only one individual was tested presented swimming speeds in
353	the same range: from 10.7 to 14.4 BL s ⁻¹ . Body length seemed to account for some differences
354	between species; however, critical swimming speed was never influenced by body length within
355	species (linear regressions, all $p > 0.05$).

356 Mugilidae sp., *C. chromis*, and large sparids (*S. cantharus* and *P. pagrus*) all swam in a fully

inertial regime, where swimming is easier and more energy efficient (Re > 1000, for fish larvae;

358 McHenry and Lauder 2005; Figure 4). Small sparids (*B. boops*, *D. annularis*, *O. melanura* and *S.*

smaris) were evenly split between Re < 1000 and Re > 1000 and swam in a more viscous regime than large sparids. Within the small sparids group, Re numbers tended to increase with size but not all large individuals (BL > 12 mm) were in the Re > 1000 region.

362 Modeling experiment

The overall proportion of successful settlers almost doubled between passive particles (6.1%) and the slowest virtual larvae, swimming at 2.5 cm s⁻¹ (11.9%; Figure 5). Forty percent of virtual Pomacentridae larvae, swimming at 12 cm s⁻¹, settled successfully. This percentage rose to ~60% for the fastest larvae, swimming at 19 cm s⁻¹. Settlement rate increased linearly with swimming speed ($F_{(1,5)} = 9547$, $R^2_{adj} = 0.999$, p < 0.001; Figure 5).

368 In all simulations, the probability of settling within the four days of simulation was high almost 369 everywhere along the coast and decreased offshore, representing the simple fact that reaching the 370 coast is easier when starting close to it (Figure 6). However, swimming speed influenced the 371 distance from which reaching the coast was possible. For example, no passive larvae starting 372 further than 10 km offshore could settle within four days. In contrast, the fastest larvae could 373 settle from anywhere in the domain (settlement probability always > 0, albeit small in some 374 locations; Figure 6). The isoline of 50% settlement probability was located on average at 5 km 375 from the coast for passive larvae, while it was at 21 km for small sparids (swimming speed: 6 cm s⁻¹), at 43 km for C. chromis (swimming speed: 12 cm s^{-1}) and at 56 km for the fastest 376 Mugilidae sp. (swimming speed: 19 cm s^{-1}). 377

378 Some coastal features such as the Hyères Peninsula, the Bay of St-Tropez and the Cape of
379 Antibes acted as retention areas and displayed higher settlement probability than other coastal
380 areas (Figure 6), in particular for passively drifting particles. At mesoscale, the two main eddies

381 drove similar patterns in all simulations (Figure 6). On the south-western boundary of the 382 (southern) anticyclonic eddy, as well as on the north-eastern boundary of the (northern) cyclonic 383 eddy, water flowed towards the continent hence facilitating the transport of virtual larvae to 384 settlement sites and extending offshore the zones of high settlement probability. Conversely, 385 between the two eddies, water flowed towards Corsica, also offering opportunities for 386 successfully reaching a coast. Finally, a zone of low settlement probability close to the shore (in 387 the northeastern corner of the domain) was created by the northern cyclonic eddy, which quickly 388 carried virtual larvae along and then away from the shore, making it more difficult to come back 389 to the coast and settle within the four days of simulation.

390 Discussion

391 Swimming abilities of Mediterranean settlement-stage larvae

392 Comparison with other studies

393 The critical swimming speeds measured here were surprisingly high for temperate fish larvae, 394 which were usually slower than tropical species (Stobutzki and Bellwood 1997; Leis 2006), Mugilidae sp. and C. chromis swam particularly fast, at more than 20 cm s⁻¹ on average, and 395 Sparidae were slightly slower (ca. 14 cm s⁻¹). Mugilid larvae studied here were the most 396 remarkable (mean SL = 12 mm, U_{crit} = 29.2 cm s⁻¹ or 24 BL s⁻¹) when compared to their juveniles 397 counterparts (SL = 30-40 mm in SL, U_{crit} = 40 cm s⁻¹ or 12.7 BL s⁻¹; Rulifson 1977), and 398 399 confirmed that young Mugilidae are very proficient swimmers around the settlement period. 400 Numerous studies have been focused on tropical pomacentrids, as summarized in Fisher et al. (2005) for 28 species. Here, C. chromis ($U_{crit} = 24 \text{ cm s}^{-1}$ or 24 BL s⁻¹) swam slower than the 401 average tropical pomacentrid ($U_{crit} = 37.6 \text{ cm s}^{-1}$ or 30 BL s⁻¹) but was also slightly smaller 402 (SL = 9.9 mm vs. 12.5 mm). Still, five tropical species swam slower than C. chromis, so the only 403

404 pomacentrid in the Mediterranean is well within the range reported for the family elsewhere.

405 Within the Sparidae tested in our study, two groups seemed to be distinguishable based on their 406 swimming speeds and morphology: small, slender bodied larvae (B. boops, D. annularis, S. 407 smaris and possibly O. melanura) and large, muscular larvae (S. cantharus and possibly P. 408 pagrus, P. acarne and D. dentex). The two groups also have a different pelagic larval duration 409 (30-38 days for large sparids vs. 16-18 days for the small sparids; Raventós and Macpherson 410 2001) and different orientation abilities (Faillettaz et al. 2015), suggesting that morphological 411 differences reflect differences in the advancement of their development. Only one individual was 412 observed in four species and inter-individual variability in performance was high, as expected 413 (see next section); caution should therefore be taken regarding these results. Nevertheless, the 414 morphological/developmental differences noticed here might hold some generality in the family Sparidae. For example, the settlement-stage larvae of Sparus aurata ($U_{crit} = 11.4 \text{ cm s}^{-1}$ for 415 416 SL = 10 mm; Faria et al. 2011) and *Pagrus auratus* (another temperate but non-Mediterranean species; $U_{crit} = 10-15$ cm s⁻¹ for SL = 9-10 mm; Clark et al. 2005) displayed sizes and critical 417 418 speeds at settlement comparable to that of the small sparids group. Larvae of Sarpa salpa in South Africa matched the characteristics of the large sparids group: $U_{crit} = 18.0 \text{ cm s}^{-1}$ for 419 420 SL = 15.6 mm (Pattrick and Strydom 2009) and pelagic larval duration of 29-35 days (Raventós 421 and Macpherson 2001).

Overall, the measured swimming speeds were always comparable to, and often larger than
average coastal currents speed in the region (13 cm s⁻¹ within ~15 km of the coast in the
MARS3DMed model over June 2014). The settlement-stages of these species are therefore
"efficient swimmers" (*sensu* Leis 2006) and should be categorized as nekton rather than plankton.
Efficient swimming can also be defined in terms of energetic expenditure. Here, most larvae

tested actually swam in a fully inertial, energy-efficient environment (Re > 1000 for larval fish;
McHenry and Lauder 2005), and the few small-sparids larvae which displayed Re < 1000 were
still out of the most viscous, energy-inefficient hydrodynamic regime (Re > 300 for larval fish;
Fuiman and Batty 1997).

431 Inter-individual variability

432 In most species, the fastest individual was at least 1.3 times, often 2 times, faster than the average 433 of the species (Table 2). These large inter-individual differences in swimming speed have been 434 observed in many species (Clark et al. 2005; Fisher et al. 2005; Faria et al. 2014). Mortality of 435 fish larvae is selective and ranges from 2% to > 70% per day (Houde 2008); it is therefore 436 possible that only the best performers might survive the larval stage and contribute to the 437 replenishment of adult populations (Johnson et al. 2014). In that context, it would be important to 438 know what drives variations between individuals. Most studies examined size (e.g. Johnson et al. 439 2014), but it never explained differences in swimming speeds within species in the present study. 440 Other factors could be investigated such as body shape, symmetry (as a proxy for the quality of 441 development, possibly assessed on otoliths), muscle mass, or condition (Leis 2006; Gagliano et 442 al. 2008; Faria et al. 2011). This variability puts in perspective the swimming speeds measured on 443 a single individual (Table 2) and, although they allow gauging size orders, replicates are 444 necessary to validate these measurements.

445 Influence of morphology

446 Size did explain differences in swimming speed between species. Critical speeds in BL s⁻¹ were 447 comparable for all Sparidae but speeds in cm s⁻¹ were not, indicating that these species have 448 similar swimming efficiency but different sizes. Mugilidae sp. and *C. chromis* were also 449 comparable to each other and faster than Sparidae. These two species have the most 450 ontogenetically-advanced appearance: very pigmented and muscular body, well defined fin rays, 451 etc. (Figure 2). These observations, together with the differences between the two groups of 452 Sparidae presented earlier, are in accordance with previous observations which suggest that 453 similarities in developmental stage and morphology of fish larvae would be better predictors of 454 swimming abilities than taxonomical relatedness (Fisher and Hogan 2007). For modeling purposes, generalizations based on taxonomy alone, such as using U_{crit} in cm s⁻¹ from a 455 456 confamilial species when data is lacking for the species of interest, should thus be avoided. Estimating swimming speed in BL s^{-1} would lessen some of these concerns. 457

458 Why larval fish swimming abilities nuance Hjort's hypothesis

459 The modeling experiment highlighted that directional swimming, even over just a few days, 460 considerably increased settlement rate and allowed larvae to settle from several dozen of 461 kilometers offshore. Virtual larvae continuously swam towards the coast, at $0.5 \times U_{crit}$, for four 462 days, in a somewhat stochastic but still orientated manner. This experiment therefore represented 463 an upper bound for the influence of directional swimming on dispersal trajectories, albeit with a 464 parameterization based on realistic assumptions. It intended to provide a contrasting view 465 compared to the numerous models that only simulate passive larvae (as reviewed in Miller 2007; 466 Werner et al. 2007; North et al. 2009), while we acknowledge that reality would be somewhere 467 between these two ends of the spectrum, depending on species and location.

468 *Limited influence of hydrological structures*

An important result of this study was the absence of threshold or asymptote in the relationship
between swimming speed and proportion of settlers, at least within the range of tested values. A
substantial change would be expected between purely passive particles and larvae swimming
directionally, at any swimming speed (Staaterman et al. 2012; Wolanski and Kingsford 2014). In

this region in particular, the dominant Ligurian current flows at 25 cm s⁻¹ on average, with peaks 473 474 at 50 cm s⁻¹, and is known to create a barrier to passive coastal particles (Pedrotti and Fenaux 1992). With virtual larvae swimming between 2.5 and 19 cm s⁻¹, i.e. often well below the average 475 476 current speed, it is surprising to notice no influence of the interaction between this mesoscale 477 structure and swimming speed on settlement proportion. For example, we expected that only 478 larvae swimming fast enough, above a threshold speed, would be able to cross the current in 479 numbers large enough to significantly influence settlement proportion. Finally, the relationship 480 may have reached an asymptotic maximum settlement rate much lower than 100%, as some 481 larvae may be lost outside of the domain for example, no matter their swimming speed. The 482 strictly linear relationship observed between swimming speed and proportion of settlers refutes 483 all of these expectations. It suggests that the distance from the coast at the start of the competency 484 period is actually the limiting factor for settlement and that directional swimming at any pace 485 helps to get closer to the shore. It also shows that the effect of the along-shore Ligurian Current 486 as a barrier to passive organisms is negated by shoreward (i.e. cross-current) swimming, even at 487 slow speeds. In the model, we chose to implement in situ swimming speed only because it is 488 conservative. The strong results obtained with just the last 4 days of the pelagic larval phase 489 showcase the importance of considering oriented swimming behavior in dispersal models, but 490 also the need for in situ observation of realistic swimming capabilities.

491 Hjort's hypothesis and larval behavior

While the effect of the Ligurian Current was weak, some retention areas were still present along
the coast. Some mesoscale eddies also significantly contributed to shoreward transport (Figure 6).
Still, larvae drifting passively and ending further than 5-10 km offshore at the start of their
competency period had very low probability to settle. In Hjort's terminology, those larvae would

496 be *aberrant drifters* and would not survive. Such an aberrant drift is likely to occur in many 497 species studied here: most Sparidae and Mugilidae spawn offshore pelagic eggs (Richards 2004) 498 that may drift away during their early pelagic phase. The only limit to their passive offshore 499 dispersal is the Ligurian Current, but the front it creates is farther than 5-10 km from the shore 500 most of the time (Stemmann et al. 2008). Considering larval behavior suggest a very different 501 picture however, with major implications for predicting larval fish settlement. Indeed, those 502 seemingly *aberrant drifters* have a non-negligible probability to settle if they swim actively 503 during their last few days as larvae. This opens the possibility for various trade-offs during the 504 larval phase; for example, young fish larvae may allocate most of their energy to growth, hence 505 diminishing mortality by limiting predation and starvation (Houde 2008), and only start 506 swimming towards the coast once competent and efficient swimmers. Young fish larvae could 507 still have considerable influence over their dispersal trajectories, by actively staying close to the 508 shore (Staaterman et al. 2012) or swimming down to avoid strong surface currents and favor 509 retention (Paris and Cowen 2004). Nevertheless, even if young larvae do drift away, the present 510 model shows that their swimming abilities at a later stage provide them with the means to 511 overcome aberrant drift.

512 **References**

Benjamini, Y., and Y. Hochberg. 1995. Controlling the False Discovery Rate: a Practical and
Powerful Approach to Multiple Testing. J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B 57: 289–300.

- 515 doi:10.2307/2346101
- 516 Berenshtein, I., M. Kiflawi, N. Shashar, U. Wieler, H. Agiv, and C. B. Paris. 2014. Polarized
- 517 light sensitivity and orientation in coral reef fish post-larvae. PLoS One **9**: e88468.
- 518 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0088468

519	Béthoux, JP., and L. Prieur. 1983. Hydrologie et circulation en méditerranée nord-occidentale
520	Pétroles Tech. 299: 25–34.

- 521 Lo Bianco, S. 1931. Fauna e flora del golfo di Napoli. 38 Monografía: Uova, larve e staidi
- 522 giovanili di teleostei. Stn. Zool. di Napoli.
- 523 Botsford, L. W., J. W. White, M. A. Cofforth, C. B. Paris, S. Planes, T. L. Shearer, S. R.
- 524 Thorrold, and G. P. Jones. 2009. Connectivity and resilience of coral reef metapopulations
- 525 in marine protected areas : matching empirical efforts to predictive needs. Coral Reefs 28:
- 526 327–337. doi:10.1007/s00338-009-0466-z
- 527 Bottesch, M., G. Gerlach, M. Halbach, A. Bally, M. J. Kingsford, and H. Mouritsen. 2016. A
- 528 magnetic compass that might help coral reef fish larvae return to their natal reef. Curr. Biol.
- 529 **26**: R1266–R1267. doi:10.1016/j.cub.2016.10.051
- 530 Boucher, J., F. Ibanez, and L. Prieur. 1987. Daily and seasonal variations in the spatial
- distribution of zooplankton populations in relation to the physical structure in the Ligurian
- 532 Sea Front. J. Mar. Res. **45**: 133–173. doi:10.1357/002224087788400891
- 533 Brett, J. R. 1964. The respiratory metabolism and swimming performance of young sockeye

salmon. J. Fish. Res. Board Canada **21**: 1183–1226. doi:10.1139/f64-103

- 535 Catalán, I. A., A. Dunand, I. Álvarez, J. Alós, N. Colinas, and R. D.M. Nash. 2014. An
- evaluation of sampling methodology for assessing settlement of temperate fish in seagrass
 meadows. Mediterr. Mar. Sci. 15: 338–349. doi:10.12681/mms.539
- 538 Clark, D., J. Leis, A. Hay, and T. Trnski. 2005. Swimming ontogeny of larvae of four temperate
- 539 marine fishes. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. **292**: 287–300. doi:10.3354/meps292287
 - 24

540	Codling, E., N. Hill, J. Pitchford, and S. Simpson. 2004. Random walk models for the movement
541	and recruitment of reef fish larvae. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 279: 215-224.
542	doi:10.3354/meps279215
543	Collins, M. R., and B. W. Stender. 1989. Larval stripped mullet (Mugil cephalus) and white
544	mullet (<i>Mugil curema</i>) off the south eastern United States. Bull. Mar. Sci. 45 : 580–589.
545	Conover, W. J., M. E. Johnson, and M. M. Johnson. 1981. A Comparative Study of Tests for
546	Homogeneity of Variances, with Applications to the Outer Continental Shelf Bidding Data.
547	Technometrics 23 : 351. doi:10.2307/1268225
548	Cowen, R., G. Gawarkiewicz, J. Pineda, S. Thorrold, and F. Werner. 2007. Population
549	Connectivity in Marine Systems: An Overview. Oceanography 20: 14–21.
550	doi:10.5670/oceanog.2007.26
551	Cowen, R. K., C. B. Paris, and A. Srinivasan. 2006. Scaling of Connectivity in Marine
552	Populations. Science. 311 : 522–527. doi:10.1126/science.1122039
553	Cury, P., and C. Roy. 1989. Optimal Environmental Window and Pelagic Fish Recruitment
554	Success in Upwelling Areas. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 46: 670–680. doi:10.1139/f89-086
555	Cushing, D. H. 1973. Recruitment and parent stock in fishes, University of Washington Press.
556	Dolan, J. R. 2014. The History of Biological Exploration of the Bay of Villefranche. Protist 165:
557	636-644. doi:10.1016/j.protis.2014.07.005
558	Dudley, B., N. Tolimieri, and J. Montgomery. 2000. Swimming ability of the larvae of some reef
559	fishes from New Zealand waters. Mar. Freshw. Res. 51: 783–787. doi:10.1071/MF00062

560	Faillettaz, R. 2015. Estimation des capacités comportementales des larves de poissons et leurs
561	implications pour la phase larvaire : un cas d'étude d'espèces démersales de Méditerranée
562	Nord-Occidentale. Ph.D thesis. Université Pierre et Marie Curie - Paris 6, Paris, France.
563	HAL: tel-01264531.
564	Faillettaz, R., A. Blandin, C. B. C. B. Paris, P. Koubbi, and JO. JO. Irisson. 2015. Sun-
565	Compass Orientation in Mediterranean Fish Larvae. PLoS One 10: e0135213.
566	doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0135213
567	Faria, A. M., M. A. Chicharo, E. J. Goncalves, M. A. Chícharo, and E. J. E. Gonçalves. 2011.
568	Effects of starvation on swimming performance and body condition of pre-settlement Sparus
569	aurata larvae. Aquat. Biol. 12: 281–289. doi:10.3354/ab00345
570	Faria, A. M., R. Borges, and E. J. Gonçalves. 2014. Critical swimming speeds of wild-caught
571	sand-smelt Atherina presbyter larvae. J. Fish Biol. 1–7. doi:10.1111/jfb.12456
572	Faria, A. M., A. F. Ojanguren, L. A. Fuiman, and E. J. Gonçalves. 2009. Ontogeny of critical
573	swimming speed of wild-caught and laboratory-reared red drum Sciaenops ocellatus larvae.
574	Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 384: 221–230. doi:10.3354/meps08018
575	Fiksen, Ø., C. Jørgensen, T. Kristiansen, F. Vikebø, and G. Huse. 2007. Linking behavioural
576	ecology and oceanography: larval behaviour determines growth, mortality and dispersal.
577	Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 347: 195–205. doi:10.3354/meps06978
578	Fisher, R. 2005. Swimming speeds of larval coral reef fishes: Impacts on self-recruitment and
579	dispersal. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 285: 223-232. doi:10.3354/meps285223
580	Fisher, R., D. R. Bellwood, and S. D. Job. 2000. Development of swimming abilities in reef fish

581	larvae. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 202: 163–173. doi:10.3354/meps202163
582	Fisher, R., and J. D. Hogan. 2007. Morphological predictors of swimming speed: a case study of
583	pre-settlement juvenile coral reef fishes. J. Exp. Biol. 210: 2436. doi:10.1242/jeb.004275
584	Fisher, R., and J. Leis. 2010. Swimming Speeds in Larval Fishes: From Escaping Predators to the
585	Potential for Long Distance Migration, p. 333-373. In P. Domenici and B.G. Kapoor [eds.],
586	Fish Locomotion. Science Publishers.
587	Fisher, R., J. M. Leis, D. L. Clark, and S. K. Wilson. 2005. Critical swimming speeds of late-
588	stage coral reef fish larvae: variation within species, among species and between locations.
589	Mar. Biol. 147: 1201–1212. doi:10.1007/s00227-005-0001-x
590	Fuiman, L., and R. Batty. 1997. What a drag it is getting cold: partitioning the physical and
591	physiological effects of temperature on fish swimming. J. Exp. Biol. 200: 1745–55.
592	Gagliano, M., M. Depczynski, S. D. Simpson, and J. A. Y. Moore. 2008. Dispersal without
593	errors: symmetrical ears tune into the right frequency for survival. Proc. Biol. Sci. 275: 527-
594	534. doi:10.1098/rspb.2007.1388
595	Gerlach, G., J. Atema, M. J. Kingsford, K. P. Black, and V. Miller-Sims. 2007. Smelling home
596	can prevent dispersal of reef fish larvae. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 104: 858-863.
597	doi:10.1073/pnas.0606777104
598	Goffart, A., JH. Hecq, and L. Prieur. 1995. Controle du phytoplancton du bassin Ligure par le
599	front liguro-provencal (secteur Corse). Oceanol. Acta 18: 329–342.
600	Guidetti, P. 2000. Differences Among Fish Assemblages Associated with Nearshore Posidonia

601	oceanica Seagrass Beds, Rocky-algal Reefs and Unvegetated Sand Habitats in the Adriatic
602	Sea. Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci. 50: 515–529. doi:10.1006/ecss.1999.0584
603	Hjort, J. 1914. Fluctuations in the great fisheries of northern Europe viewed in the light of
604	biological research. Cons. Perm. Int. pour l'Exploration la Mer - Rapp. Procès Verbaux XX.
605	Houde, E. D. 2008. Emerging from Hjort's Shadow. J. Northwest Atl. Fish. Sci. 41: 53-70.
606	doi:10.2960/J.v41.m634
607	Iles, T. D., and M. Sinclair. 1982. Atlantic herring: stock discreteness and abundance. Science.
608	215 : 627–33. doi:10.1126/science.215.4533.627
609	Johnson, D. W., K. Grorud-Colvert, S. Sponaugle, and B. X. Semmens. 2014. Phenotypic
610	variation and selective mortality as major drivers of recruitment variability in fishes. Ecol.
611	Lett. 17: 743–55. doi:10.1111/ele.12273
612	Jones, G. P., M. J. Milicich, M. J. Emslie, C. Lunow, J. J. Emslie, and C. Lunow. 1999. Self-
613	recruitment in a coral reef fish population. Nature 402 : 802–804. doi:10.1038/45538
614	Jones, G. P., S. Planes, and S. R. Thorrold. 2005. Coral Reef Fish Larvae Settle Close to Home.
615	Curr. Biol. 15: 1314–1318. doi:10.1016/j.cub.2005.06.061
616	Kinlan, B. P., and S. D. Gaines. 2003. Propagule dispersal in marine and terrestrial environments:
617	A community perspective. Ecology 84: 2007–2020. doi:10.1890/01-0622
618	Koumoundouros, G., C. Ashton, G. Xenikoudakis, I. Giopanou, E. Georgakopoulou, and N.
619	Stickland. 2009. Ontogenetic differentiation of swimming performance in Gilthead
620	seabream (Sparus aurata, Linnaeus 1758) during metamorphosis. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol.

- 621 **370**: 75–81. doi:10.1016/j.jembe.2008.12.001
- 622 Lasker, R. 1981. The role of a stable ocean in larval fish survival and subsequent recruitment, p.
- 623 33–77. In R. Lasker [ed.], Marine Fish Larvae, Morphology, Ecology, and Relation to
- 624 Fisheries. University of Washington Press.
- 625 Lazure, P., and F. Dumas. 2008. An external-internal mode coupling for a 3D hydrodynamical
- model for applications at regional scale (MARS). Adv. Water Resour. **31**: 233–250.
- 627 doi:10.1016/j.advwatres.2007.06.010
- 628 Lecaillon, G. 2004. The "C.A.R.E." (collect by artificial reef eco-friendly) system as a method of
- 629 producing farmed marine animals for the aquarium market: An alternative solution to
- 630 collection in the wild. SPC Live Reef Fish Inf. Bull. **12**: 17–20.
- 631 Leis, J. M. 2006. Are larvae of demersal fishes plankton or nekton? Adv. Mar. Biol. 51: 57–141.
 632 doi:10.1016/S0065-2881(06)51002-8
- 633 Leis, J. M. 2010. Ontogeny of behaviour in larvae of marine demersal fishes. Ichthyol. Res. 57:
- 634 325–342. doi:10.1007/s10228-010-0177-z
- Leis, J. M., P. Balma, R. Ricoux, and R. Galzin. 2012. Ontogeny of swimming ability in the
- 636 European Sea Bass, *Dicentrarchus labrax* (L.) (Teleostei: Moronidae). Mar. Biol. Res. 8:
- 637 265–272. doi:10.1080/17451000.2011.616898
- 638 Leis, J. M., and B. M. Carson-Ewart. 1998. Complex behaviour by coral-reef fish larvae in open-
- 639 water and near-reef pelagic environments. Environ. Biol. Fishes **53**: 259–266.
- 640 doi:10.1023/A:1007424719764

641	Leis, J. M., and D. L. Clark. 2005. Feeding greatly enhances swimming endurance of settlement-
642	stage reef-fish larvae of damselfishes (Pomacentridae). Ichthyol. Res. 52: 185–188.
643	doi:10.1007/s10228-004-0265-z
644	Leis, J. M., and R. Fisher. 2006. Swimming speed of settlement-stage reef-fish larvae measured
645	in the laboratory and in the field: a comparison of critical speed and in situ speed.
646	Proceedings of the 10th International Coral Reef Symposium. Coral Reef Society of Japan
647	Tokyo. 438–445.
648	Leis, J. M., A. C. Hay, and M. R. Gaither. 2011. Swimming ability and its rapid decrease at
649	settlement in wrasse larvae (Teleostei: Labridae). Mar. Biol. 158: 1239-1246.
650	doi:10.1007/s00227-011-1644-4
651	Leis, J. M., A. C. Hay, M. M. Lockett, JP. Chen, and LS. Fang. 2007. Ontogeny of swimming
652	speed in larvae of pelagic-spawning, tropical, marine fishes. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 349: 257-
653	269. doi:10.3354/meps07107
654	Leis, J., U. Siebeck, A. Hay, C. Paris, O. Chateau, and L. Wantiez. 2015. In situ orientation of
655	fish larvae can vary among regions. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 537 : 191–203.
656	doi:10.3354/meps11446
657	McHenry, M. J., and G. V Lauder. 2005. The mechanical scaling of coasting in zebrafish (Danio

- 658 *rerio*). J. Exp. Biol. **208**: 2289–301. doi:10.1242/jeb.01642
- Miller, T. J. 2007. Contribution of individual-based coupled physical-biological models to
 understanding recruitment in marine fish populations. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 347: 127–138.
 doi:10.3354/meps06973

662	Miller, T. J., L. B. Crowder, J. A. Rice, and E. A. Marschall. 1988. Larval Size and Recruitment
663	Mechanisms in Fishes: Toward a Conceptual Framework. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 45:
664	1657–1670. doi:10.1139/f88-197
665	Mouritsen, H., J. Atema, M. J. Kingsford, and G. Gerlach. 2013. Sun Compass Orientation Helps
666	Coral Reef Fish Larvae Return to Their Natal Reef. PLoS One 8: e66039.
667	doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0066039
668	Nelson, J. S., T. C. Grande, and M. V. H. Wilson. 2016. Fishes of the World, John Wiley & Sons.
669	North, E. W., A. Gallego, P. Petitgas, and others. 2009. Manual of recommended practices for
670	modelling physical – biological interactions during fish early life. ICES Coop. Res. Rep.
671	Okubo, A. 1971. Oceanic diffusion diagrams. Deep Sea Res. Oceanogr. Abstr. 18: 789-802.
672	doi:10.1016/0011-7471(71)90046-5
673	Olivar, M. P., and A. Sabatés. 1997. Vertical distribution of fish larvae in the north-west
674	Mediterranean Sea in spring. Mar. Biol. 129: 289–300. doi:10.1007/s002270050169
675	Pairaud, I. L., J. Gatti, N. Bensoussan, R. Verney, and P. Garreau. 2011. Hydrology and
676	circulation in a coastal area off Marseille: Validation of a nested 3D model with
677	observations. J. Mar. Syst. 88: 20-33. doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys.2011.02.010
678	Paris, C. B., J. Atema, JO. Irisson, M. Kingsford, G. Gerlach, and C. M. Guigand. 2013a. Reef
679	odor: a wake up call for navigation in reef fish larvae. PLoS One 8: e72808.
680	doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0072808

681 Paris, C. B., and R. K. Cowen. 2004. Direct evidence of a biophysical retention mechanism for

682	coral reef fish larvae. Limnol. Oceanogr. 49 : 1964–1979. doi:10.4319/lo.2004.49.6.1964
683	Paris, C. B., J. Helgers, E. van Sebille, and A. Srinivasan. 2013b. Connectivity Modeling System:
684	A probabilistic modeling tool for the multi-scale tracking of biotic and abiotic variability in
685	the ocean. Environ. Model. Softw. 42: 47-54. doi:10.1016/j.envsoft.2012.12.006
686	Pattrick, P., and N. Strydom. 2009. Swimming abilities of wild-caught, late-stage larvae of
687	Diplodus capensis and Sarpa salpa (Pisces: Sparidae) from temperate South Africa. Estuar.
688	Coast. Shelf Sci. 85: 547–554. doi:10.1016/j.ecss.2009.09.022
689	Pedrotti, M., and L. Fenaux. 1992. Dispersal of echinoderm larvae in a geographical area marked
690	by upwelling (Ligurian Sea, NW Mediterranean). Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 87: 217–227.
691	doi:10.3354/meps087217
692	Pepin, P., and J. A. Helbig. 1997. Distribution and drift of Atlantic cod (Gadus morhua) eggs and
693	larvae on the northeast Newfoundland Shelf. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 54: 670-685.
694	doi:10.1139/cjfas-54-3-670
695	Plaut, I. 2001. Critical swimming speed: Its ecological relevance. Comp. Biochem. Physiol A
696	Mol. Integr. Physiol. 131: 41-50. doi:10.1016/S1095-6433(01)00462-7
697	Porch, C. E. 1998. A numerical study of larval fish retention along the southeast Florida coast.
698	Ecol. Modell. 109: 35-59. doi:10.1016/S0304-3800(98)00005-2
699	Raventós, N., and E. Macpherson. 2001. Planktonic larval duration and settlement marks on the
700	otoliths of Mediterranean littoral fishes. Mar. Biol. 138: 1115-1120.
701	doi:10.1007/s002270000535

702	Richards, W. J. 2004. Early stages of Atlantic fishes: an identification guide for the western
703	central north Atlantic, Two Volume Set, Taylon & F. W.J. Richards [ed.]. CRC Press.
704	Rulifson, R. A. 1977. Temperature and Water Velocity Effects on the Swimming Performances
705	of Young-of-the-Year Striped Mullet (Mugil cephalus), Spot (Leiostomus xanthurus), and
706	Pinfish (Lagodon rhomboides). J. Fish. Res. Board Canada 34: 2316–2322. doi:10.1139/f77-
707	310
708	Simpson, S. D., M. Meekan, J. Montgomery, R. McCauley, and A. Jeffs. 2005. Homeward
709	sound. Science. 308: 221. doi:10.1126/science.1107406
710	Sinclair, M. 1988. Marine populations: an essay on population regulation and speciation,
711	University of Washington Press.
712	Sinclair, M., and M. Power. 2015. The role of "larval retention" in life-cycle closure of Atlantic
713	herring (Clupea harengus) populations. Fish. Res. 172: 401-414.
714	doi:10.1016/j.fishres.2015.07.026
715	Staaterman, E., C. B. Paris, and J. Helgers. 2012. Orientation behavior in fish larvae: a missing
716	piece to Hjort's critical period hypothesis. J. Theor. Biol. 304 : 188–96.
717	doi:10.1016/j.jtbi.2012.03.016
718	Stemmann, L., L. Prieur, L. Legendre, I. Taupier-Letage, M. Picheral, L. Guidi, and G. Gorsky.
719	2008. Effects of frontal processes on marine aggregate dynamics and fluxes: An interannual
720	study in a permanent geostrophic front (NW Mediterranean). J. Mar. Syst. 70: 1-20.
721	doi:10.1016/j.jmarsys.2007.02.014
722	Stobutzki, I., and D. Bellwood. 1997. Sustained swimming abilities of the late pelagic stages of

723	coral reef fishes. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 149: 35-41. doi:10.3354/meps149035
724	Stobutzki, I. C., and D. R. Bellwood. 1994. An analysis of the sustained swimming abilities of
725	pre- and coral reef fishes. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol. 175: 275–286. doi:10.1016/0022-
726	0981(94)90031-0
727	Vandromme, P., L. Stemmann, L. Berline, and others. 2011. Inter-annual fluctuations of
728	zooplankton communities in the Bay of Villefranche-sur-Mer from 1995 to 2005 (Northern
729	Ligurian Sea, France). Biogeosciences 8: 3143–3158. doi:10.5194/bg-8-3143-2011
730	Werner, F. E., R. K. Cowen, and C. B. Paris. 2007. Coupled Biological and Physical Models.
731	Oceanography 20: 54–69. doi:10.1016/S0967-0645(00)00079-5
732	Werner, F. E., F. H. Page, D. R. Lynch, J. W. Loder, R. G. Lough, R. I. Perry, D. A. Greenberg,
733	and M. Sinclair. 1993. Influences of mean advection and simple behavior on the distribution
734	of cod and haddock early life stages on Georges Bank. Fish. Oceanogr. 2: 43-64.
735	doi:10.1111/j.1365-2419.1993.tb00120.x
736	Wolanski, E., P. Doherty, and J. Carleton. 1997. Directional swimming of fish larvae determines
737	connectivity of fish populations on the great barrier reef. Naturwissenschaften 84: 262–268.
738	doi:10.1007/s001140050394
739	Wolanski, E., and M. J. Kingsford. 2014. Oceanographic and behavioural assumptions in models
740	of the fate of coral and coral reef fish larvae. J. R. Soc. Interface 11: 20140209.
741	doi:10.1098/rsif.2014.0209

742 Acknowledgments

|--|

- vas supported by a grant from the Partner University Fund to JOI and CBP. The CMS code
- 745 development and maintenance is possible with a National Science Foundation award to CBP
- 746 (n°1260424). Institutional support to the Laboratoire d'Océanographie de Villefranche-sur-Mer
- and Observatoire Océanologique de Villefranche-sur-Mer, for JOI and RF, provided light traps
- and ship time. RF's doctoral fellowship is provided by the French Ministry of Education and
- 749 Research (n°247/2012).

750	Figure Legends
751	Figure 1. a) Simulated current field at 5 m depth, averaged over June 2014 (source:
752	MARS3DMed, PREVIMER). The average flow vectors are represented at the 647 release sites
753	of the modeling experiment and are overlaid on top a linearly interpolated map of average current
754	intensity. The typical strong jet along the Northern coast is highlighted, as well as two stable
755	mesoscale eddies: a distinct cyclone (counter-clockwise) centered on 8.5°W, 43.5°N and a weaker
756	anticyclone below. b) Collection sites of fish larvae (dots) in the Bay of Villefranche-sur-Mer,
757	France, which location is indicated by the rectangle in panel a.
758 759	Figure 2. Morphology of the settlement-stage larvae of the six species tested. Species are sorted in decreasing order of swimming speed, from top to bottom.
760	Figure 3. Critical swimming speed in cm s ⁻¹ and in body length per second (BL s ⁻¹). The
761	mean values (empty circle) are overlaid on top of standard boxplots. Two groups of Sparidae
762	species are highlighted: large, fast species and smaller, slenderer, slower species; differences in
763	swimming speed were significant between groups but often not within group. With speeds in
764	BL s ⁻¹ , all Sparidae were similar.
765	Figure 4. Reynolds number (Re) for each larva as a function of standard length (SL).
766	Species are identified within each panel. The hydrodynamic regime would be energy-inefficient
767	below the solid line ($\text{Re} < 300$) and fully inertial above the dotted one ($\text{Re} > 1000$).

768 Figure 5. Relationship between the proportion of settlers and swimming speed of virtual

769 **larvae.** Each point corresponds to one swimming speed scenario and is computed from about 2.5

million virtual larvae. The solid line is the fit and the dotted lines the standard error of a linear

771 regression (
$$F_{(1,5)} = 9547$$
, $R^2_{adj} = 0.999$; $p < 0.001$).

Figure 6. Maps of the probability of settlement on the coast for fish larvae released over the

- 773 whole domain, for the seven simulation scenarios. For each simulation, the swimming speed of
- 174 larvae and the total percentage of successful settlers are indicated above the map. The isoline of
- 50% settlement probability is drawn as a dotted line. Coastal features acting as retention areas are
- indicated on the passive simulation map (Hyeres Peninsula, Gulf of Saint-Tropez, Cape of
- Antibes). The bottom-right panel shows the effect of the two mesoscale eddies on larval
- transport, with arrows representing schematic larval fish trajectories (solid: successfully settled;
- dashed: still offshore at the end of the simulation).

781

Tables

782 Table 1. List of tested species. Taxonomy, the number of individuals tested (n) and standard

⁷⁸³ length (SL) in mm: mean ± standard deviation (SD) and [range], n collected: the total number of

184 larvae collected during the sampling period (not all larvae could be tested).

Family	Species	n	SL (mm) mean ± SD [min-max]	n collected
Mugilidae				
	Mugilidae sp.	10	12.2 ± 1.1 [9.8-13.4]	10
Pomacentridae				
	Chromis chromis Linnaeus, 1758	33	9.9 ± 1.1 [8.3-12.4]	85
Sparidae				
	Boops boops L.	40	10.9 ± 1.2 [8.2-13.8]	337
	<i>Diplodus annularis</i> L.	26	9.0 ± 1.0 [7.8-11.6]	371
	Spicara smaris L.	31	11.8 ± 1.2 [9.0-13.9]	505
	Spondyliosoma cantharus L.	9	13.4 ± 1.7 [11.7-17.3]	12
	Dentex dentex L.	1	$15 < SL < 20^{1}$	1
	<i>Oblada melanura</i> L.	1	9.6	307
	Pagellus acarne Risso, 1827	1	20.6	1
	Pagrus pagrus L.	1	14.9	5

785 ¹The standard length of *Dentex dentex* is reported as an approximate range only because the

specimen was kept alive after the experiment and its exact size could not be measured with

787 certainty.

789 Table 2. A. Sample size (n), critical swimming speed (U_{crit}) in cm s⁻¹ and BL s⁻¹, and

restimated in situ speed. Results are presented per species, for the two morphological groups of

sparids, and for the slowest and fastest individuals overall. In situ speeds used in the model were

- restimated at about half of U_{crit} (Leis 2006). **B. Critical swimming speeds available from the**
- 793 literature for related species/families.

A.			U	crit (cm s ⁻¹)	U _{crit} (BI	⊆ s ⁻¹)	Estimated
Family/Group	Species	n	med±	mad [min-max]	med±mad [min-max]	in situ speed
Mugilidae							
	Mugilidae sp.	10	29.2±	5.1 [21.1-37.4]	24.2 ± 3.7 [2	20.5-30.4]	15 cm s ⁻¹
Pomacentridae							
	C. chromis	33	22.8±	3.0 [19.0-35.6]	24.1±2.4 [1	7.0-30.4]	12 cm s ⁻¹
Sparidae							
Large sparids		12	19.2±	3.8 [12.0-26.6]	14.4 ± 1.7 [9	9.3-17.5]	10 cm s ⁻¹
	P. acarne	1	22.1		10.7		
	P. pagrus	1	21.5		14.4		
	D. dentex	1	17.8				
	S. cantharus	9	17.7±	4.4 [12.0-26.6]	14.8 ± 2.3 [9	9.3-17.5]	
Small sparids		98	11.1±	5.0 [5.3-26.6]	10.0 ± 4.3 [4]	4.5-23.2]	6 cm s ⁻¹
	O. melanura	1	13.1		13.7		
	S. smaris	31	13.1±	6.2 [7.2-26.6]	11.4 ± 4.4 [5	5.5-22.4]	
	D. annularis	26	11.6±	5.1 [6.1-20.9]	11.5 ± 5.4	7.0-23.2]	
	B. boops	40	9.4±	3.2 [5.3-25.3]	8.4 ± 3.1	1.5-22.6]	
Fastest larva	Mugilidae sp.	1	37.4		30.4	-	19 cm s ⁻¹
Slowest larva	B. boops	1	5.3		4.5		2.5 cm s ⁻¹
В.		Regi	on	U _{crit} (cm s ⁻¹)	U _{crit} (BL s ⁻¹)	Re	ference
Mugilidae				· · · ·			
Mı	ugil cephalus ¹	Temp	perate	40	12.7	Rulij	fson, 1977
Pomacentrida	e						
28 species		Trop	ical	37.6	30	Fisher	• et al., 2005
Small sparids							
Sparus aurata		Temp	perate	11.4	11.4	Faria	et al., 2011
Pagrus auratus		Temperate		10-15	11-16.6	Clark et al., 2005	
Large sparids		-					
Sa	Temp	perate	18.0	11.5	Pattrick &	E Strydom, 2009	
¹ Tested individ	luals were juver	niles (3	0-40 m	m).			



Figures





MARS3DMed, PREVIMER). The average flow vectors are represented at the 647 release sites
of the modeling experiment and are overlaid on top a linearly interpolated map of average current
intensity. The typical strong jet along the Northern coast is highlighted, as well as two stable
mesoscale eddies: a distinct cyclone (counter-clockwise) centered on 8.5°W, 43.5°N and a weaker
anticyclone below. b) Collection sites of fish larvae (dots) in the Bay of Villefranche-sur-Mer,
France, which location is indicated by the rectangle in panel a.



- 805 Figure 2. Morphology of the settlement-stage larvae of the six species tested. Species are
- sorted in decreasing order of swimming speed, from top to bottom.



807

Figure 3. Critical swimming speed in cm s⁻¹ and in body length per second (BL s⁻¹). The mean values (empty circle) are overlaid on top of standard boxplots. Two groups of Sparidae species are highlighted: large, fast species and smaller, slenderer, slower species; differences in swimming speed were significant between groups but often not within group. With speeds in BL s⁻¹, all Sparidae were similar.







815 Species are identified within each panel. The hydrodynamic regime would be energy-inefficient

below the solid line (Re < 300) and fully inertial above the dotted one (Re > 1000).





818 Figure 5. Relationship between the proportion of settlers and swimming speed of virtual

819 larvae. Each point corresponds to one swimming speed scenario and is computed from about 2.5

820 million virtual larvae. The solid line is the fit and the dotted lines the standard error of a linear

821 regression (
$$F_{(1,5)} = 9547$$
, $R^2_{adj} = 0.999$; $p < 0.001$).





823 Figure 6. Maps of the probability of settlement on the coast for fish larvae released over the 824 whole domain, for the seven simulation scenarios. For each simulation, the swimming speed of 825 larvae and total percentage of successful settlers are indicated above the map. The isoline of 50% 826 settlement probability is drawn as a dotted line. Coastal features acting as retention areas are 827 indicated on the passive simulation map (Hyeres Peninsula, Gulf of Saint-Tropez, Cape of 828 Antibes). The bottom-right panel shows the effect of the two mesoscale eddies on larval 829 transport, with arrows representing schematic larval fish trajectories (solid: successfully settled; 830 dashed: still offshore at the end of the simulation).