

Interactions between demersal fish body condition and density during the regime shift of the Gulf of Lions

C. M. Bensebaini ^{1,*}, G. Certain¹, N. Billet¹, A. Jadaud¹, S. Gourguet ², T. Hattab¹ and J. M. Fromentin¹

¹UMR 9190 MARBEC, University of Montpellier-IRD-Ifremer-CNRS, Av. Jean Monnet, CS 30171, Sète Cedex 34203, France ²UMR 6308 AMURE, University of Brest-Ifremer, CNRS-IUEM, Rue Dumont d'Urville 29280 Plouzané, France

* Corresponding author: tel: +33 767162285; e-mail:bensebaini.cyria@gmail.com

Environmentally driven changes in small pelagic fish condition and size have been observed in the Gulf of Lions (GOL) since 2008, leading to a significant fishery crisis. However, the effect of changes in environment and/or in the small pelagic community on the demersal community remain unknown. For the first time, this study examines the body condition (bc) and population density of 22 demersal species since 1994, using dynamic factor analysis (DFA). Most (but not all) of demersal species have shown a common shift between 2006 and 2009, which is synchronous with that observed in small pelagic species and the environmental conditions in the GOL. It had been concluded that the environmentally driven changes detected in the pelagic fish community also affected the demersal fish community, but with less drastic and lasting consequences. As the DFA revealed that the b displayed important variations for several species, notably hake (*Merlucius merluccius*), the interaction between the bc and population density was investigated using the Multivariate Autoregressive (MAR) model on hake population at three life stages (recruits, juveniles, and adults). Results showed that adult bc, while negatively affected by density, had a positive effect on recruitment. So hake bc could have affected population dynamics by promoting higher recruitment at low densities. Further work is needed to ascertain whether such effects exist in other demersal species.

Keywords: body condition, demersal fish, dynamic factor analysis, Gulf of Lions, Merluccius merluccius, multivariate autoregressive models.

Introduction

The Gulf of Lions (GOL) is one of the most productive regions of the Mediterranean Sea, due to its wide continental shelf and a combination of large inflows from the Rhone River and small-scale coastal upwelling (Millot, 1982, 1990). This area has been intensively exploited for decades, with total landings reaching 30 000 to 50 000 tonnes from the 1970s to the 1990s, but only amounting to 13 604 tonnes (tuna excluded) in 2018 (STECF, 2019a, 2019b). Today, fish stocks of commercial interest are heavily overfished, according to the report of the State of Mediterranean and Black Sea Fisheries (SoMFi) (FAO, 2018a). It is therefore a high-stakes sector from an ecological, social and economic perspective, where the consequences of unexpected changes could be considerable (Barange *et al.*, 2018).

Around 2008, the pelagic ecosystem of the GOL had shown signs of disruption, characterized by the drastic changes in size, age, and condition of its two main small commercial pelagic fish stocks (European sardine, *Sardina pilchardus*; European anchovy, *Engraulis encrasicolus*). This "small pelagic crisis" in the GOL was attributed to slower growth and higher natural mortality in the older age groups (Van Beveren *et al.*, 2014). Different hypotheses about the causes of such changes have been tested and finally seemed to result from a bottom-up control induced by a change in plankton composition and/or density (Brosset *et al.*, 2015; Saraux *et al.*, 2019). Subsequent studies indicated that environmental conditions in the GOL broadly changed in the mid-2000s (Feuilloley *et al.*, 2020). These types of large-scale disturbances are known for their effects on fish species biology,

directly-physiological threshold-or indirectly-by modifying the food resource (plankton), thereby affecting bottom-up mechanisms (Jørgensen, 1992). This has consequences on the energy storage dynamics of individuals (Jakob et al., 1996), reflected in their body condition (BC), and ultimately in their natural mortality and growth, affecting population dynamics. Fluctuations in population density and BC therefore provide information on population health. The small pelagic crisis first induced a crash in landings, followed by a historic collapse of the fishing activity in the area (Van Beveren et al., 2016) and the shift of fishing efforts towards demersal stocks, which increased an already unsustainable fishing pressure on the demersal species. As such, the demersal stocks became crucial for the survival of the trawl and small-scale fisheries in the region. The captures during the decade preceding the crisis (outside of tuna catches) were composed of around 3/4 of small pelagic species, mainly sardine and anchovy, and around 1/4 of demersal species, while post-crisis (after 2008) the pattern reversed to 1/3 of small pelagic species and almost 2/3 of demersal species (FAO, 2018b).

While the small-pelagic shift of the GOL has been the center of an intense research activity (summarized in Saraux *et al.*, 2019), not much has been done to discover whether demersal stocks have also been affected, since studies on demersal species' BC in the GOL are over a decade old (Lloret *et al.*, 2002, 2008; Ferraton *et al.*, 2007). Similar changes in BC are likely to be observed in the demersal community, especially since many demersal species depend on environmental conditions when they are in a larval or juvenile stage, and, once adult, certain demersal species feed mainly on small pelagic

Received: August 26, 2021. Revised: April 22, 2022. Accepted: May 15, 2022

[©] The Author(s) 2022. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of International Council for the Exploration of the Sea. All rights reserved. For permissions, please e-mail: journals.permissions@oup.com





Figure 1. Map of the sampling stations of the MEDITS survey in the Gulf of Lions.

fishes (Banaru *et al.*, 2013; Mellon-Duval *et al.*, 2017). BC can have a strong impact on growth (Ratz and Lloret, 2003) and natural mortality, as fish in poor condition are more susceptible to disease, predation, and fishery (Martinez *et al.*, 2003). BC can also affect reproduction or reproductive potential, which is crucial for the recovery of a declining stock. Some fish populations in poor condition invest their energy in growth rather than reproduction, reducing fecundity and the quality of the eggs, or leading to delayed maturation (Lambert and Dutil, 2000; Lloret *et al.*, 2008), while others, such as small pelagic fish in the GOL, continue their energy investment in reproduction, whatever their BC, leading to an increased mortality after spawning (Brosset *et al.*, 2016). The search for possible links between BC and population dynamics is therefore interesting.

This paper has two goals. First, we explore the demersal species' response to an ecosystem shift detected in the GOL around 2008. Then, we investigate the population dynamics of a highly documented species, the European hake (Merluccius merluccius), to better understand how BC and density interact at a population level. Hence, the first part of the paper is dedicated to determining whether the BC and/or density of demersal species has changed over time. More precisely, we have looked for common trends between 22 demersal species (in terms of BC and density) and investigated if these common trends match those already detected by Feuilloley et al. (2020) in the environmental conditions and small pelagic fish species of the GOL. In the second section, we use the European hake as a study model to examine to what extent changes in BC and/or density could affect one another, using Multivariate Autoregressive (MAR) models. The choice of hake was mostly

motivated by its central role in the demersal fishery (Mellon-Duval *et al.*, 2017) and by data availability. Hake was the only species which had enough information available to set up a three-stage population dynamics model suitable for searching for interactions between BC and the density of hake at various stages (recruits, juveniles, and adults).

With this study, we hope to uncover crucial information that helps provide a better understanding of the dynamics of the demersal stocks in the GOL, and ultimately contribute to the establishment of a more ecosystem-oriented approach to fisheries management in this area.

Materials and methods

Data description: The MEDITS survey

Data used in the analyses were collected from annual international bottom trawl surveys performed in May-July since 1994 over the continental shelf (10 m to 200 m depth) and the continental slope (200 m to 800 m) of the Mediterranean Sea through the MEDITS scientific program (Bertrand et al., 2002). The sampling procedures were standardized according to a common protocol over countries and years. The MEDITS survey (Jadaud, 1994) aims to annually estimate and monitor the demersal fish stocks in the GOL and east of Corsica. The current study focuses on the GOL (Figure 1). The fishing gear used is a bottom trawl GOC-73 with 20 mm of stretched cod-end mesh size. The average vertical and wing opening of the gear are around 2 m and 18 m, respectively. All the tows were performed during daylight hours, 30 min for shelf stations, and 60 min for the continental slope. The MEDITS database documents the distribution and density of roughly 400 Mediterranean species collected over 25 years of sampling. However, for many reasons such as a lack of data or appropriate biological measurements throughout the whole time series (see e.g. Morfin et al., 2012), we restricted our analvsis to 22 species that were regularly caught (i.e. there were no missing values in the time series) during the survey and for which length measurements were consistently taken during the whole time period (see Table 1). The survey provides the population density for each species, obtained by dividing the number of individuals of each species obtained in any given trawl by the trawled surface (the annual densities being the average of all densities obtained in any given year for each species, see Supplementary Figure S1). Density is here used as a proxy of abundance in the GOL relative to the trawl catchability, which is assumed to be constant through time, since the fishing protocol has carefully been kept constant since 1994 (Morfin *et al.*, 2012).

Body condition index

To measure the BC, the residual index (Gould, 1975) was used, which is the residual of the length-weight log-linear relationship. Positive residuals indicate the BC is above average, while negative residuals indicate the BC is below average. This index is convenient as it allows to separate the BC from the body size effect (Jakob *et al.*, 1996).

The MEDITS protocol includes systematic measurements of individual size for the 22 selected species, but few of them are individually weighed. In the absence of individual weights for each species and in each haul sample, the data available consists of a total biomass and an associated size spectrum. However, it is still possible to estimate a length-weight relationship from these data. The classical length-weight relationship is written as follows:

$$w_{s,i} = a_s \ l_{s,i}^{b_s} \tag{1}$$

The $w_{s,i}$ and $l_{s,i}$ are the weight and length of individual *i* of species *s*, respectively. The total biomass in one haul *h* of a given species *s*, thereafter denoted $B_{h,s}$, is equal to the sum of the *n* individuals' weight (w_i) contained in the haul *h*, as described in Equation (2).

$$B_{b,s} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} w_{b,s,i} = a_s \sum_{i=1}^{n} l_{b,s,i}^{b_s}$$
(2)

Where $B_{b,s}$ is the observed biomass of species *s* in the *h*th haul and a_s and b_s are the typical constants of the lengthweight relationship of the given species *s*, and $l_{b,s,i}$ is the length of the *i*th fish in the *h*th haul of the species *s*.

The number of hauls varies slightly from year to year (the average number being 65). To calculate the residual index based on the same number of hauls each year and produce confidence intervals, the residual index time series were extracted using 100 non-parametric bootstraps. For each species and bootstrap, 40 hauls were randomly selected each year, resulting in a 1000-point data set (40 haul * 25 years). Then the estimates of parameters a_s and b_s were obtained by fitting the Equation (2) to the 1000 pairs of $B_{b,s}$ and their corresponding sum of sizes, then finally, residuals were calculated from the fit of the Equation (2). Averaging these residuals per year for each bootstrap sample resulted in 100 time series of 25 years, from which the median—and 2.5% and 97.5% quantiles for confidence intervals—were extracted to

build the BC index series for each species. These steps are described graphically in Figure 2 and the BC time series can be consulted in Supplementary Figure S2. Furthermore, to check for consistency, bootstrapped estimates of a_s and b_s parameters were compared to parameters from the bibliography, and the obtained results were satisfactory (Supplementary Table S1).

Dynamic Factor Analysis (DFA)

DFA is a dimension reduction technique specifically designed for time series since it takes into account the time factor, unlike other dimension reduction techniques like principal component analysis (PCA) or canonical correspondence analysis (CCA). DFA aims to identify common trends between different time series and relationships between these series (Zuur *et al.*, 2003). It fits linear multivariate autoregressive state-space models with Gaussian errors (Holmes *et al.*, 2018). The model is written as follows:

$$y_t = Zx_t + v_t \text{ where} v_t \sim MVN(0, R)$$
 (3a)

$$x_t = x_{t-1} + w_t$$
 where $w_t \sim MVN(0, Q)$ (3b)

The y Equation (3a) represents the observation process, and the x Equation (3b) is termed the state process. The vector y_t of n time series (corresponding to the number of analyzed species, n = 22) is modeled as a linear combination of m hidden common trends (x_t vector) and the factor loadings matrix Z, and observation errors vector v_t , which were distributed as a multivariate normal distribution with mean vector 0 and variance-covariance matrix R. The m hidden common trends at time $t(x_t)$ follow random walks with process error vector w_t , which was distributed as a multivariate normal distribution with mean vector 0 and variancecovariance matrix Q (Holmes *et al.*, 2018). For any given time t and species s, the linear form of the model can be written as follows:

$$y_{st} = z_{s1} x_{1t} + z_{s2} x_{2t} + \dots + z_{sm} x_{mt} + v_{st}$$
 (4)

Two DFA were carried out, one for the BC time series and another for the density time series. In both cases, several models were fitted, which had from m = 1 to m = 3 latent variables, and a covariance matrix R starting from its simplest form "diagonal and equal" (i.e. the same variance and no covariance) to a more complex form "equalvarcov" (i.e. one value for the variance and one for the covariance). Model selection was based on Akaike's information criterion for small samples (AICc; Burnham and Anderson, 2002) to identify the most parsimonious model containing the least number of common trends without experiencing much information loss. The Multivariate Autoregressive State-Space (MARSS) package developed in *R* (Holmes *et al.*, 2018; R Core Team, 2020) was used to perform these analyses. As input data for the DFA, we used log-transformed and centered density, and standardized BC time series.

Trends identified by this DFA analysis were then compared to the time series retrieved from the study by Feuilloley *et al.* (2020). These authors investigated whether an environmental change could have triggered the small pelagic crisis based on two DFA analyses, one including the time series of 10 biological variables (biomass, condition and size for sardine, anchovy and sprat plus abundance for sardine) and one including the time series of 10 environmental variables (chlorophyll-a (Chla) concentration, Rhone flow, thermal

Species	Scientific name	Density (%)	Density (individuals)	Commercial landings (%)
Horned octopus	Eledone cirrhosa	1,38	15263	16.81
Shortfin squid	Illex coindetii	1,54	17010	4.23
Common octopus	Octopus vulgaris	0,19	2109	8.96
Norway lobster	Nephrops norvegicus	0,65	7145	0.13
European hake	Merluccius merluccius	5,62	61943	18.13
Blue whiting	Micromesistius poutassou	2,69	29698	0.11
Greater forkbeard	Phycis blennoides	0,83	9123	0.43
Capelan	Trisopterus capelanus	22,88	252325	10.7
Blackbellied angler	Lophius budegassa	0,72	7970	11.1
Angler	Lophius piscatorius	0,07	746	1.94
Red mullet	Mullus barbatus barbatus	4,78	52751	7.11
Surmullet	Mullus surmuletus	0,09	1038	1.93
Axillary seabream	Pagellus acarne	0,05	502	3.95
Blackspot seabream	Pagellus bogaraveo	0,43	4722	0.7
Common pandora	Pagellus erythrinus	0,37	4103	3.6
Mediterranean horse mackerel	Trachurus mediterraneus	0,35	3905	
Atlantic horse mackerel	Trachurus trachurus	50,63	558400	9.03
Spotted flounder	Citharus linguatula	0,20	2233	0.09
Four-spot megrim	Lepidorhombus boscii	0,32	3522	0.04
Grey gurnard	Eutrigla gurnardus	5,84	64402	0.73
Blackbelly rosefish	Helicolenus dactylopterus	0,35	3861	0.04
John dory	Zeus faber	0,01	103	0.24

Table 1. List of 22 species selected for the DFA analyses with their contribution to the commercial landings, as well as their estimated density (in number and percentage) in the MEDITS survey catches of 2018 (study area: Gulf of Lions).

fronts, Sea Surface Temperature (SST), Western Mediterranean Oscillation Index, convection, upwelling, stratification index, N and P nutrient concentration). These two DFA analyses revealed common trends with a shift in the mid-2000's, which led the authors to suggest that changes in environmental conditions could have affected plankton production and hence the small pelagic fish community (Feuilloley *et al.*, 2020). Those two common trends have been thus retrieved and compared with the results of the DFA analyses carried out in this study on the demersal community to investigate a potential match between trends in environment, small pelagic and demersal fish communities in the GOL.

Multivariate Autoregressive (MAR) Model

This part of the study looks for interaction between BC and density, using the Granger causality (GC) concept (Granger, 1969). The basic idea of GC is that a variable x impacts a variable y if it improves the prediction of the latter. This concept can be based on the fitted interaction matrix obtained from a MAR model (Ives *et al.*, 2003; Certain *et al.*, 2018). MAR(p) models, in their linear formula, have demonstrated a particular efficiency in detecting interactions in nonlinear systems (Barraquand *et al.*, 2021). This analysis was based on a conditional GC (Geweke, 1984; Barnett and Seth, 2014), in which, when focusing on the causal relationship between two variables, the confounding relationships are accounted for due to the remaining variables.

We focused on European hake because: (i) it is a wellsampled species and the most documented of the MEDITS survey; (ii) its life cycle is well known and the timing of the MEDITS survey (late spring) has been designed to capture hake recruitment; (iii) it is one of the most important and abundant species of the demersal community in the GOL; (iv) it is a major commercial species; and (v) its BC increased significantly through the study period. European hake is widely distributed in the GOL, with juvenile and young adults concentrated mainly on the continental shelf, and the largest individuals deeper on the slope and canyons (Maynou *et al.*, 2003). Hake is a key predator in this area, feeding mainly on crustaceans and small benthic fish when juvenile, then switching to a more piscivorous diet at 15 cm (small pelagics and blue whiting representing 40% to 80% of its diet, Mellon-Duval *et al.*, 2017). It is a highly mobile species, with long lifespan and slow growth (Mellon-Duval *et al.*, 2010). The European hake is a batch spawner that spawns throughout the year with a peak in winter (Ferrer-Maza *et al.*, 2014), and recruitment also happens throughout the year with a peak in late spring. Juveniles are fished as soon as they reach a catchable size (i.e. in their first year of life).

A MAR(1) analysis was done using density and BC as variables. Both the BC and density were split into three stages using an age-length key (Bensebaini et al., 2019): juveniles (or recruits) age 0-1; juveniles age 1-2; and adults age 2+ (Supplementary Figure S3). Separating adults from juveniles permits the verification of whether maturation and modifications in physiological processes, leading to changes in the body's energy resources management (Kooijman, 2009), affects the BCdensity relationship. In addition, natural mortality is higher in juveniles-which are more vulnerable to predation compared to adults (Vetter, 1988)—and possibly act as a confounding factor. Recruits (juveniles age 0-1) were separated from other juveniles (juveniles age 1-2) in an attempt to acquire recruitment dynamics. The MAR analysis was restricted to a oneyear lag due to the shortness of the time series (i.e. 25 points), as increasing the lag also greatly increases model dimensionality.

In matrix form, MAR models with one time lag (MAR (1) models) are written as follows:

$$x_t = Bx_{t-1} + w_t \text{ where } w_t \sim MVN(0, Q)$$
(5)

with x_t a vector whose elements corresponds to the response variables of the model; either total log-density or BC, each being divided by three stages. *B* is the 6*6 interaction matrix,



Figure 2. Process diagram of bc time series extraction.

with b_{ij} the effect of variable *j* on variable *i*. The diagonal of the matrix *B* represents the effect of the variables on themselves. w_t is a multivariate normally distributed error vector with mean 0 and variance-covariance matrix *Q*. Matrix *B* parameters were estimated by a maximum likelihood estimation using a Kalman filter (Harvey, 1989). Each parameter was considered significant with a p-value lower than a significance level of 5% and was associated with a 95% confidence interval.

Considering the high number of parameters to be estimated in the full model and the relatively short length of the available time series, we designed a specific approach to avoid a potential overfitting issue. To do so, we first set all parameters that had no biological meaning (see Supplementary Table S2) to 0, such as b_{14} , because the BC of the recruits at time t cannot affect the density of recruits at time t + 1 (since the latter are not yet born, see Supplementary Table S3). Then, backward elimination was based on the AICc to keep the most relevant coefficients and to penalize overly complex models. However, some coefficients related to the population dynamics have not been included in the backward elimination because of their key biological meaning: b_{21} and b_{32} (i.e. the growth in density of recruits age 0–1 and of juveniles age 1–2, respectively) as juveniles age from one year to the next; b_{13} (i.e. the adults reproductive output) because adults reproduce and give birth to recruits; and b_{33} (i.e. density-dependent effects within the adult density) because adult density cannot grow indefinitely.

Because the aim of this study is to determine whether recruit density is better predicted with an adult BC effect, The sum of squares of residuals (SSR) of recruit density were computed and compared for the models with and without the effect of adult BC on recruit density.

Results

DFA

For the BC, the AICc (Supplementary Table S4) selected two models as the most parsimonious ($\Delta AICc = 1.9$). One



Figure 3. Common trends (top part of the figure) for the residual index series obtained by the model with two common trends and an "equalvarcov" covariance matrix R, and the factor loadings on these trends (bottom part of the figure). The dashed grey lines show the threshold -/+ 0.2 (Zuur *et al.*, 2003), above which factor loadings will be interpreted.

contained one common trend and an "equalvarcov" covariance matrix R (i.e. a common variance for all series and common covariance between them), and the other contained two common trends, and an "equalvarcov" covariance matrix R. Both models were tested and showed similar results. However, the model with a common trend (Supplementary Figure S4) had lower factor loadings, probably because a single common trend was insufficient to properly describe the common dynamics of demersal fish BC, which forms the rationale for the selection of the model with two common trends (Figure 3). The first common trend showed a sharp drop in 1994, then a gradual increase from 2006 to 2016. The second common trend displayed a typical regime shift pattern: it dropped sharply between 2006 and 2009, after which it remained below zero until the end of the series. Species with factor loadings (Figure 3) smaller than a threshold of 0.2, in absolute values, have not been included in the interpretation of results (Zuur et al., 2003), as they did not have a particular trend over time. Factor loadings resulting from the DFA on BC (Figure 3) seemed clustered by taxonomic categories, suggesting that the BC of species within a taxonomic group followed a similar temporal dynamics. Cephalopods (three species) mainly displayed negative loadings on trend 2, while perciforms (five species) and John dory displayed positive loadings on trend 2. Pleuronectiforms (two species) were mostly positively associated with trend 1, while gadiforms (four species) and scorpaeniforms (two species) were positively associated with both trends 1 and 2, except hake, which only displayed positive loadings on trend 1. Lophilforms (two species) were poorly associated with both trends.

When looking at the overall model fits for each BC time series (Supplementary Figure S5), most species showed a good fit with the observations, except for a few species (Norway lobster, blackbellied angler, red mullet, and blackspot seabream series). As several species were associated with both common trends, the contribution of each BC time series to the two common trends was plotted in different colors (Figure 4) to determine at which point in the series the model was more driven by trend 1 or 2. In the shift period (2006–2009), almost all species were driven by trend 2 (i.e. blue points) except for European hake, spotted flounder, and angler, whose BCs were only associated with trend 1 (Figure 3).



Figure 4. Contribution of the two common trends represented in Figure 2 to the fitted series of bc of each species. The dotted line represents the effect of the first common trend on each bc time series ($z_{s1}x_{1t}$). The dashed line represents the effect of the second common trend ($z_{s2}x_{2t}$). And the solid line is the model fit ($z_{s1}x_{1t} + z_{s2}x_{2t}$). Colored points represent the proportion of contributions from each trend (example for species *s* and trend 1: $p_{1t} = z_{s1}x_{1t}/(z_{s1}x_{1t} + z_{s2}x_{2t})$) to the fit of the models (red for trend 1, and blue for trend 2). (a) is the "shift" phase (2006–2009).

For density, the AICc (Supplementary Table S5) selected the model containing one common trend, and an "equalvarcov" covariance matrix R. This common trend (Figure 5) showed low values until 2006, then values quickly increased until 2010, and finally the increase slowed until it reached what appears to be a plateau in 2014. Again, species with factor loadings smaller than 0.2 were not included in the interpretation of results (bottom part of Figure 5 for factor loading; and Supplementary Figure S6 for density model fits versus observed time series), leaving only shortfin squid and three perciforms

(blackspot seabream, common pandora, and Mediterranean horse mackerel), which were positively associated with this trend, while blue whiting was negatively associated with it.

The common trend from DFA on demersal fish densities, the trend 2 from the DFA on demersal fish BC and the common trends of the DFA analyses on environmental conditions and small pelagic fishes in the GOL performed by Feuilloley *et al.* (2020) are displayed in Figure 6. This figure highlights a strikingly concomitant period of shift (2006–2009), when the strongest changes in these four trends occurred.



Figure 5. Common trend (top part of the figure) for the density time series obtained by the model with one common trend and an "equalvarcov" covariance matrix R, and the factor loadings on this trend (bottom part of the figure). The dashed grey lines show the threshold -/+ 0.2 (Zuur *et al.*, 2003), above which factor loadings will be interpreted.

Multivariate Autoregressive (MAR) Model

The model selected by backward elimination is illustrated in Figure 7. Results show that coefficients that have not been included in the backward elimination ($b_{21} = 0.01 \pm 0.32$, $b_{32} = 0.12 \pm 0.40$, $b_{33} = 0.1 \pm 0.48$) were low and not statistically significant, except b_{13} , which revealed the strong positive effect of the density of adults age 2 + at time t on recruits age 0–1 at time t + 1 ($b_{13} = 0.90 \pm 0.46$). The density of adults age 2 + at time t also had a negative effect on the BC of juveniles age 1–2 ($b_{53} = -0.22 \pm 0.14$), and adults age 2+ ($b_{63} = -0.33 \pm 0.2$) at time t + 1. Finally, the BC of adults age 2 + had a positive effect ($b_{16} = 0.83 \pm 0.69$) on the density of recruits age 0–1 at time t + 1 and was negatively autocorrelated ($b_{66} = -0.36 \pm 0.29$). The calculation of the SSR shows that there was a reduction of the SSR in the model with the effect of the BC, as compared with the model without this effect (a reduction of 17.20%). This means that juvenile density was better predicted when accounting for the BC.

Discussion

One of the first goals of this study was to explore whether the environmentally driven changes in small pelagic fish BC could also be detected in the demersal fish community of the GOL. DFA performed on the BC and density time series of 22 demersal species tended to confirm this impact. This was documented by a common shift between 2006 and 2009 for most (but not all) demersal fishes and a striking synchrony between the common trends extracted from the DFA of this study (on demersal fish) and those performed on the small pelagic fishes



Figure 6. Comparison of all common trends obtained by DFA from the current study and the study of Feuilloley *et al.* (2020). The dashed line in blue represents bc trend 2 and dotted line in green represents density common trend. The brown line with points represents the common trend of small pelagics, while the yellow line with diamonds represents the common trend of environmental factors from the study of Feuilloley *et al.* (2020). The shaded area of the graph delimits the period for the shift between 2006 and 2009.



European hake

Figure 7. Schematic view of the model selected for European hake *M. merluccius.* Red arrows represent negative effects, green arrows represent positive effects, arrows with non-significant p-value were grayed out. x_1 : recruits age 0–1 log density, x_2 : juveniles age 1–2 log density, x_3 : adults age 2 + log density, x_4 : recruits age 0–1 bc, x_5 : juveniles age 1–2 bc, x_6 : adults age 2 + bc.

and environmental conditions in the GOL (Feuilloley et al., 2020). The authors have clearly depicted an overall change in the environmental conditions of the GOL over the last 30 years, characterized by a rapid decline in Chla concentration in the mid-2000s, a continuous increase in SST, an intensification of coastal upwellings and frontal activities, a decrease in the nutrient inputs from the Rhone river as well as in the deep winter convection and modifications in the regional atmospheric conditions (as described by the Western Mediterranean Oscillation Index). Those environmental changes have probably affected the lower trophic levels (plankton) of the GOL ecosystem, and consequently the small pelagic fish compartment, as already stressed by previous studies (see Brosset et al., 2015; Saraux et al., 2019). The present study shows that these environmental changes may also have affected the demersal fish community. However, the exact cause and pathways of these changes are yet to be discovered. Hence, the processes through which environmental changes might have affected energy storage and fish BC will probably remain a challenging research topic for the next decade, requiring more theoretical approaches before it is solved.

The BC of many demersal species were both positively correlated with trend 1 (a continuous BC improvement) and with trend 2 (the shift in the mid-2000s). For these species, the contribution of trend 2 is substantial during the shift period (blue points in Figure 4), while the contribution of trend 1 is more significant at the end of the time series. Hence the BC of these species (blue whiting, greater forkbeard, capelan, Mediterranean and Atlantic horse mackerel, grey gunnard, blackbelly rosefish and John dory), while momentarily altered during the shift, saw an improvement in recent years, contrary to the small pelagic fishes whose BC has still not recovered up to this day (Saraux et al., 2019). This study therefore confirms that, as revealed by BC-DFA in trend 2, the impacts of the shift experienced by the small pelagics in the GOL also affected the demersal system, but without triggering the same drastic and long-lasting consequences at the biological (for most species), ecological and economic level.

The pelagic community (3 major species of small pelagics) appears to have a strong and lasting response to the shift, while the demersal community appears to have more diverse responses in both direction and intensity. Depending on their turnover rates, species respond differently to changes in the abiotic environment, for example, small pelagic fish that have fast turnover rates react quickly to an abrupt change (Stenseth et al., 2002). Small pelagic fish communities have lower species diversity (Angel, 1993) and are known to have short trophic chains, a short lifespan, and an explosive demography, making them very sensitive to environmental fluctuations (Alheit and Hagen, 2001). Regime shifts were often observed in these communities, like sardines in the California Current (Hill et al., 2015), or anchovies in the Humboldt Current (Guiñez et al., 2014). Conversely, demersal communities often have a greater species diversity (Angel, 1993), live longer and tend to grow slower (Pauly, 1998). They usually display longer trophic chains and are capable of feeding on both benthic and pelagic resources (Garrison and Link, 2000; Bulman et al., 2001). The demersal community food web is therefore generally characterized by higher complexity and modularity, numerous interactions, and these elements are thought to provide a greater stability and inertia to their dynamics (MacArthur, 1955; Paine, 1969; Möllmann and Diekmann, 2012). The difference in responsiveness between small

pelagic and demersal systems may explain why the demersal one is usually less affected by environmental changes than the pelagic (Tian *et al.*, 2008; Moyano *et al.*, 2021). It is therefore not surprising that the strong shift signature observed in the small pelagic species of the GOL is only partly mirrored within the demersal community.

The shift period seems to be rather advantageous to cephalopods in terms of their BC. This is particularly interesting as cephalopods are species with a short lifespan that respond very quickly to changing environmental conditions compared to other demersal species (Rodhouse et al., 2014). It has been demonstrated that the increase of water temperature (Mangold, 1983), and the intensification of coastal upwelling (Otero et al., 2016) may have a positive impact on the density and growth of cephalopods and especially the common octopus, as this has been shown in the GOL by Feuillolev et al. (2020). During the shift, a significant and sudden increase in density was noticed for shortfin squid. Again, the increase of shortfin squid density can be explained by the availability of a favorable environment for the development of cephalopods, such as the rise in the SST (Mangold, 1983) and the intensification of upwellings (Otero et al., 2016) during the mid-2000's.

Identifying the precise drivers of BC changes for each species is beyond the scope of the present study, as it requires further species-centered analyses, that would account for both the effects of fishing and the environment. Depending on the species, these drivers are most likely multiple, and our analysis revealed some degree of inter-specific variability in the temporal patterns, but species of the same taxonomic group tended to exhibit similar patterns. In the absence of knowing what triggered the shift in the GOL, it is difficult to provide a clear explanation for this clustering beyond the fact that taxonomically related species may have more similar physiology, diet and behaviour, and so are more likely to be affected in a similar way by any given change.

On a more general note, the results of the two DFA show that BC time series have more patterns in common across species than density time series. Such an outcome can emerge from a greater sensitivity of BC to common environmental drivers. If the trend 2 on BC time series displays the same patterns of variations as the small pelagic fish and environmental conditions in the GOL, the gradual increase observed in BC (trend 1), to which most species—except cephalopods and anglers-are positively associated, may result from reduced competition among fishes due to increased fishing pressure. Indeed, it is worth pointing out that the drastic response of the small pelagics to the shift led to a collapse of the fishery, the effort of which has been redirected to the demersal stocks. So increased fishing pressure, due to relaxing (perhaps mostly intra-specific) competition, could be one explanation for improved BC in species positively correlated to trend 1.

The objective of the MAR analysis on the hake case study was to determine whether changes in BC may impact population density or vice versa. This analysis displayed the negative effect of the adult density on adult BC, possibly due to intra-specific competition (Hixon and Jones, 2005; Hixon *et al.*, 2012), while adult BC positively affected recruitment, most likely through higher reproductive investment, a better quality of eggs and thus higher recruitment success (Booth and Beretta, 2004; Grote *et al.*, 2011). The search for prey by fish larvae and early fish juveniles, as well as predatory escape, is more efficient in developed individuals (with better BC), assuring that they can overcome the critical larval stage with a better survival rate (Brown and Taylor, 1992; Morgan, 2004). Lloret *et al.* (2008) also confirmed that maternal condition may affect the reproductive potential of hake in the north-western Mediterranean. Interestingly, hake responded positively to trend 1 of the DFA performed on the BC time series and displayed a continuous positive increase in BC while showing a decrease in density. So, the positive link between BC and recruitment suggests that recruitment of the depleted hake population in the GOL can be enhanced through a higher BC in adults, which may be a mechanism that would partly compensate for population decline due to overfishing (GFCM, 2018). The case study of hake clearly demonstrated the importance of investigating the relationship between BC and density for the other species when information is available.

In the MAR analysis on hake, the model was unable to detect the growth of recruits age 0-1 to juveniles age 1-2, and then to adult. This lack of apparent connection between ages 0-1 and 1-2, and ages 1-2 and 2+ has multiple explanations. First, natural mortality in the first year is known to be high and variable (because of changes in environmental conditions) for Teleosts, masking cohort tracking from ages 0-1 (Cushing, 1990). Secondly, the area of distribution of the hake population is wider than the GOL (WGSAD, 2019), so immigration/emigration processes with neighboring areas might be another confounding factor. Thirdly, adult hake are known to take refuge in marine canvons (at the shelf break) and are hence more difficult to track by the MEDITS survey. Still, the model was able to recover a strong positive link between adults' (2+) density and recruits, illustrating that spawning stock density affects to some extent the recruitment in the following year. Such relationships are often difficult to observe in fish populations, mostly because recruitment density is more strongly influenced by environmental variations than spawning biomass (Cury et al., 2014) and because the low survival rate of recruits is unrelated to the fishing activity. But in cases when the fishing effort on adults increased beyond a certain threshold (termed recruitment-overfishing by Pauly, 1984; Sparre and Venema, 1992), stock-recruitment relationships can become more visible in the data, which is precisely the case for hake in GSA 7 (GFCM, 2018).

To summarize, we detected some changes in the BC and density of the demersal species in the GOL that appeared synchronous with those observed in small pelagic fish populations and in the environmental conditions of the GOL, but to a lesser extent. We also highlighted strong interactions between the BC and density in the European hake population, which could partly explain the rather high resilience of this population to high fishing pressure. This is a good reason to scrutinize relationships between BC and density for commercial fish stocks.

Supplementary Data

Supplementary material is available at the *ICESJMS* online version of the manuscript.

Data availability statement

The data underlying this article will be shared on reasonable request to the corresponding author or to the second author G. Certain (gregoire.certain@ifremer.fr).

Conflicts of interest

The authors declare that they have no known financial interests or personal relationships that could have influenced the work reported in this article.

Funding

This study was funded by France Filiere Pêche (FFP) as part of the DEMERSCAN project.

Author's contributions

Bensebaini and Certain: conceptualization, methodology, formal analysis, writing and reviewing. Billet, Jadaud and Hattab: data providing and reviewing. Fromentin and Gourguet: conceptualization and reviewing.

Acknowledgements

We thank Dr M. Hunsicker, and the anonymous reviewers for their helpful suggestions for improving this manuscript. We also thank Saskia Hampton for her proofreading of this paper. The authors would like to thank the France Filière Pêche association (FFP) for the financial support of the DEMER-SCAN project. Our gratitude is extended to the AMOP, OP du SUD, and IFREMER members for ensuring the successful completion of this project.

References

- Alheit, J., and Hagen, E. 2001. The Effect of Climatic Variation on Pelagic Fish and Fisheries. In History and Climate: Memories of the Future?, pp. 247–265. Ed. by P. D. Jones, A. E. J. Ogilvie, T. D. Davies, and K. R. Briffa. Springer US, Boston, MA.
- Angel, M. V. 1993. Biodiversity of the pelagic ocean. Conservation Biology, 7: 760–772.
- Banaru, D., Mellon-Duval, C., Roos, D., Bigot, J.-L., Souplet, A., Jadaud, A., Beaubrun, P. *et al.* 2013. Trophic structure in the gulf of lions marine ecosystem (north-western mediterranean sea) and fishing impacts. Journal of Marine Systems, 111–112: 45–68.
- Barange, M., Bahri, T., Beveridge, M. C. M., Cochrane, K. L., Funge-Smith, S., and Poulain, F. 2018. Impacts of climate change on fisheries and aquaculture: synthesis of current knowledge, adaptation and mitigation options. FAO Fisheries an Aquaculture Technical Paper No, Rome. 628pp.
- Barnett, L., and Seth, A. K. 2014. The MVGC multivariate granger causality toolbox: a new approach to Granger-causal inference. Journal of Neuroscience Methods, 223: 50–68.
- Barraquand, F., Picoche, C., Detto, M., and Hartig, F. 2021. Inferring species interactions using granger causality and convergent cross mapping. Theoretical Ecology, 14: 87–105.
- Bensebaini, C. M., Billet, N., Certain, G., Jadaud, A., and Le Roy, E. 2019. Growth parameters data (size and weight) and sexual maturity considering fish, cephalopods and crustaceans of the Gulf of Lions. SEANOE.
- Bertrand, J. A., Gil de Sola, L., Papaconstantinou, C., Relini, G., and Souplet, A. 2002. The general specifications of MEDITS surveys. Scientia Marina, 66.
- Booth, D. J., and Beretta, G. A. 2004. Influence of recruit condition on food competition and predation risk in a coral reef fish. Oecologia, 140: 289–294.
- Brosset, P., Menard, F., Fromentin, J.-M., Bonhommeau, S., Ulses, C., Bourdeix, J.-H., Bigot, J.-L. *et al.* 2015. Influence of environmental variability and age on the body condition of small pelagic fish in the gulf of lions. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 529: 219–231.

- Brosset, P., Lloret, J., Munoz, M., Fauvel, C., Van Beveren, E., Marques, V., Fromentin, J.-M. *et al.* 2016. Body reserves mediate trade-offs between life-history traits: new insights from small pelagic fish reproduction. Royal Society Open Science, 3: 160202.
- Brown, R. W., and Taylor, W. W. 1992. Effects of egg composition and prey density on the larval growth and survival of lake whitefish (*Coregonus clupeaformis mitch ill*). Journal of Fish Biology, 40: 381–394.
- Bulman, C., Althaus, F., He, X., Bax, N. J., and Williams, A. 2001. Diets and trophic guilds of demersal fishes of the south-eastern australian shelf. Marine and Freshwater Research, 52: 537–548.
- Burnham, K. P., and Anderson, D. R. 2002. Model selection and multimodel inference: a practical information-theoretic approach. Springer, New York. 488pp.
- Certain, G., Barraquand, F., and Gårdmark, A. 2018. How do MAR(1) models cope with hidden nonlinearities in ecological dynamics? Methods in Ecology and Evolution, 9: 1975–1995.
- Cury, P. M., Fromentin, J.-M., Figuet, S., and Bonhommeau, S. 2014. Resolving hjort's dilemma: how is recruitment related to spawning stock biomass in marine fish? Oceanography, 27: 42–47.
- Cushing, D. H. 1990. Plankton production and Year-class strength in fish populations: an update of the match/mismatch hypothesis. In Advances in Marine Biology, pp. 249–293. Ed. by J. H. S. Blaxter, and A. J. Southward. Academic Press.
- FAO. 2018a. FISHSTAT database. http://www.fao.org/fishery/statistics/ software/fishstatj/fr.
- FAO. 2018b. State of Mediterranean And Black Sea Fisheries 2018. General Fisheries Commission for the Mediterranean, Rome. 172pp.
- Ferraton, F., Harmelin-Vivien, M., Mellon-Duval, C., and Souplet, A. 2007. Spatio-temporal variation in diet may affect condition and abundance of juvenile european hake in the gulf of lions (NW mediterranean). Marine Ecology Progress Series, 337: 197–208.
- Ferrer-Maza, D., Lloret, J., Munoz, M., Faliex, E., Vila, S., and Sasal, P. 2014. Parasitism, condition and reproduction of the european hake (*Merluccius merluccius*) in the northwestern mediterranean sea. ICES Journal of Marine Science, 71: 1088–1099.
- Feuilloley, G., Fromentin, J.-M., Stemmann, L., Demarcq, H., Estournel, C., and Saraux, C. 2020. Concomitant changes in the environment and small pelagic fish community of the gulf of lions. Progress in Oceanography, 186: 102375.
- Garrison, L. P., and Link, J. S. 2000. Dietary guild structure of the fish community in the northeast united states continental shelf ecosystem. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 202: 231–240.
- Geweke, J. F. 1984. Measures of conditional linear dependence and feedback between time series. Journal of the American Statistical Association, 79: 907–915.
- GFCM. 2018. Working Group on Stock Assessment of Demersal Species (WGSAD). FAO, Rome.
- Gould, S. J. 1975. Allometry in primates, with emphasis on scaling and the evolution of the brain. Contributions to Primatology, *5*: 244–292.
- Granger, C. W. J. 1969. Investigating causal relations by econometric models and Cross-spectral methods. EconometricaEconometrica, 37: 424–438.
- Grote, B., Hagen, W., Lipinski, M. R., Verheye, H. M., Stenevik, E. K., and Ekau, W. 2011. Lipids and fatty acids as indicators of egg condition, larval feeding and maternal effects in cape hakes (*Merluccius paradoxus* and *m*. *capensis*). Marine Biology, 158: 1005–1017.
- Guiñez, M., Valdés, J., Sifeddine, A., Boussafir, M., and Dávila, P. M. 2014. Anchovy population and ocean-climatic fluctuations in the humboldt current system during the last 700years and their implications. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 415: 210–224.
- Harvey, A. C. 1989. Forecasting, Structural Time Series Models and the Kalman Filter. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge. 574pp.
- Hill, K. T., Crone, P. R., Dorval, E., and Macewicz, B. J. 2015. Assessment of the Pacific sardine resource in 2015 for U.S.A. management in 2015-16.

- Hixon, M. A., and Jones, G. P. 2005. Competition, predation, and density-dependent mortality in demersal marine fishes. Ecology, 86: 2847–2859.
- Hixon, M. A., Anderson, T. W., Buch, K. L., Johnson, D. W., McLeod, J. B., and Stallings, C. D. 2012. Density dependence and population regulation in marine fish: a large-scale, long-term field manipulation. Ecological Monographs, 82: 467–489.
- Holmes, E. E., Ward, E. J., and Scheuerell, M. D. 2018. Analysis of multivariate time- series using the MARSS package. Technical report, version 3.10.12. Northwest Fisheries Science Center, NOAA, Seattle, WA, USA.
- Ives, A. R., Dennis, B., Cottingham, K. L., and Carpenter, S. R. 2003. Estimating community stability and ecological interactions from timeseries data. Ecological Monographs, 73: 301–330.
- Jadaud, A. 1994. MEDITS. https://doi.org/10.18142/7.
- Jakob, E. M., Marshall, S. D., and Uetz, G. W. 1996. Estimating fitness: a comparison of body condition indices. Oikos, 77: 61–67.
- Jørgensen, T. 1992. Long-term changes in growth of North-east arctic cod (*Gadus morhua*) and some environmental influences. ICES Journal of Marine Science, 49: 263–278.
- B. Kooijman (Ed). 2009. Basic concepts. In Dynamic Energy Budget Theory for Metabolic Organisation, 3rd edn, pp. 1–23. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Lambert, Y., and Dutil, J. D. 2000. Energetic consequences of reproduction in atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*) in relation to spawning level of somatic energy reserves. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences, 57: 815–825.
- Lloret, J., Gil de Sola, L., Souplet, A., and Galzin, R. 2002. Effects of large-scale habitat variability on condition of demersal exploited fish in the north-western mediterranean. ICES Journal of Marine Science, 59: 1215–1227.
- Lloret, J., Demestre, M., and Sanchez, J. 2008. Lipid (energy) reserves of european hake (*Merluccius merluccius*) in the north-western mediterranean. Vie Et Milieu-Life and Environment, 58: 77–85.
- MacArthur, R. 1955. Fluctuations of animal populations and a measure of community stability. Ecology, 36: 533–536.
- Mangold, K. 1983. Cephalopod life cycles. Academic Press, London.
- Martinez, M., Guderley, H., Dutil, J. D., Winger, P. D., He, P., and Walsh, S. J. 2003. Condition, prolonged swimming performance and muscle metabolic capacities of cod gadus morhua. Journal of Experimental Biology, 206: 503–511.
- Maynou, F., Lleonart, J., and Cartes, J. 2003. Seasonal and spatial variability of hake (*Merluccius merluccius*) recruitment in the NW mediterranean. Fisheries Research, 60: 65–78.
- Mellon-Duval, C., De Pontual, H., Metral, L., and Quemener, L. 2010. Growth of european hake (*Merluccius merluccius*) in the gulf of lions based on conventional tagging. Ices Journal Of Marine Science, 67: 62–70.
- Mellon-Duval, C., Harmelin-Vivien, M., Métral, L., Loizeau, V., Mortreux, S., Roos, D., and Fromentin, J. M. 2017. Trophic ecology of the european hake in the gulf of lions, northwestern mediterranean sea. Scientia Marina, 81: 7–18.
- Millot, C. 1982. Analysis of upwelling in the gulf of lions. Elsevier Oceanography Series, 34: 143–153.
- Millot, C. 1990. The gulf of lions' hydrodynamics. Continental Shelf Research, 10: 885–894.
- Möllmann, C., and Diekmann, R. 2012. Chapter 4 Marine Ecosystem regime shifts induced by climate and overfishing: a review for the northern hemisphere. In Advances in Ecological Research, pp. 303– 347. Ed. by G. Woodward, U. Jacob, and E. J. O'Gorman. Academic Press, London.
- Morfin, M., Fromentin, J.-M., Jadaud, A., and Bez, N. 2012. Spatio-Temporal patterns of key exploited marine species in the northwestern mediterranean sea. Plos One, 7: e37907.

- Morgan, M. J. 2004. The relationship between fish condition and the probability of being mature in american plaice (*Hippoglossoides platessoides*). ICES Journal of Marine Science, 61: 64–70.
- Moyano, G., Plaza, G., Cerna, F., and Munoz, A. A. 2021. Local and global environmental drivers of growth chronologies in a demersal fish in the south-eastern pacific ocean. Ecological Indicators, 131: 108151. Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- Otero, J., Álvarez-Salgado, X., González, Á. F., Souto, C., Gilcoto, M., and Guerra, Á. 2016. Wind-driven upwelling effects on cephalopod paralarvae: Octopus vulgaris and Loliginidae off the Galician coast (NE Atlantic).
- Paine, R. T. 1969. A note on trophic complexity and community stability. The American Naturalist, 103: 91–93.
- Pauly, D. 1984. Fish population dynamics in tropical waters: a manual for use with programmable calculators. ICLARM Studies and Reviews. 325pp.
- Pauly, D. 1998. Tropical fishes: patterns and propensities*. Journal of Fish Biology, 53: 1–17.
- R Core Team. 2020. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. https://www.R-project.org/.
- Ratz, H. J., and Lloret, J. 2003. Variation in fish condition between atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*) stocks, the effect on their productivity and management implications. Fisheries Research, 60: 369–380.
- Rodhouse, P. G. K., Pierce, G. J., Nichols, O. C., Sauer, W. H. H., Arkhipkin, A. I., Laptikhovsky, V. V., Lipiński, M. R. et al. 2014. Environmental effects on cephalopod population dynamics: implications for management of fisheries. Advances in Marine Biology, 67: 99–233.
- Saraux, C., Van Beveren, E., Brosset, P., Queiros, Q., Bourdeix, J.-H., Dutto, G., Gasset, E. *et al.* 2019. Small pelagic fish dynamics: a review of mechanisms in the gulf of lions. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography, 159: 52–61.
- Sparre, P., and Venema, S. C. 1992. Introduction to tropical fish stock assessment. FAO, Rome. 514pp.
- STECF. 2019a. EWG 19-10: Stock assessments in the Mediterranean Sea 2019 Part 1. European Union, Italy.
- STECF. 2019b. EWG 19-16: Stock assessments in the Mediterranean Sea 2019 Part 2. European Union, Italy.
- Stenseth, N. C., Mysterud, A., Ottersen, G., Hurrell, J. W., Chan, K.-S., and Lima, M. 2002. Ecological effects of climate fluctuations. Science, 297: 1292–1296.
- Tian, Y., Kidokoro, H., Watanabe, T., and Iguchi, N. 2008. The late 1980s regime shift in the ecosystem of tsushima warm current in the japan/east sea: evidence from historical data and possible mechanisms. Progress In Oceanography, 77: 127–145.
- Van Beveren, E., Bonhommeau, S., Fromentin, J.-M., Bigot, J.-L., Bourdeix, J.-H., Brosset, P., Roos, D. *et al.* 2014. Rapid changes in growth, condition, size and age of small pelagic fish in the mediterranean. Marine Biology, 161: 1809–1822.
- Van Beveren, E., Fromentin, J.-M., Rouyer, T., Bonhommeau, S., Brosset, P., and Saraux, C. 2016. The fisheries history of small pelagics in the northern mediterranean. ICES Journal of Marine Science, 73: 1474– 1484.
- Vetter, E. F. 1988. Estimation of natural mortality in fish stocks: a review. Fishery Bulletin, 86: 25–43.
- WGSAD. 2019. Working Group on Stock Assessment of Demersal Species (WGSAD) Benchmark session for the assessment of European hake in GSAs 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 19, 20, 22, 23 and 26 | General Fisheries Commission for the Mediterranean (GFCM) Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. GFCM.
- Zuur, A. F., Tuck, I. D., and Bailey, N. 2003. Dynamic factor analysis to estimate common trends in fisheries time series. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences, 60: 542–552.