Mesophotic reefs are not refugia for neither taxonomic nor functional diversity of reef fishes

Loiseau Nicolas ^{1,*}, Villéger Sébastien ¹, Le Bozec Charles ², Gimenez Marie ², Kawahara Seiji Léo ², Claverie Thomas ^{1, 2}

¹ MARBEC, Univ Montpellier, CNRS, IFREMER, IRD, Montpellier, France ² CUFR of Mayotte, Dembeni, France

* Corresponding author : Nicolas Loiseau, email address : nicolas.loiseau@cnrs.fr

<u>sebastier.villeger@cnrs.fr</u>; <u>charles.lebozec1@gmail.com</u>; <u>mariegimenez34@yahoo.fr</u>; <u>leo.kawahara@gmail.com</u>; <u>tclaverie@gmail.com</u>

Abstract :

Mesophotic reefs, defined as reefs between 30 m and 150 m, have been less investigated than their shallower counterparts. Yet, more protected from human activities and bleaching events, they could be refuge zones allowing the resilience of shallow reefs. However, it is currently unknown if their role as refugia for species diversity also extends to functional diversity and thus potentially ecosystem functioning. Using an extensive video field surveys from Mayotte Island in the Western Indian Ocean, we analyzed how taxonomic diversity and functional diversity of coral reef fishes changed along a depth gradient from 10 to 100 m. We found that shallow and mesophotic reefs host different species, but that these dissimilar assemblages share similar richness combinations of traits values. However, when accounting for biomass of species, it appears that functional structure of assemblages differs along the depth gradient, with, for instance, herbivorous fishes being very scarce in deep reefs while large-bodied carnivorous are more abundant. Therefore, surveys of mesophotic fishes should assess not only species, but also trait composition, abundance and biomass. Overall, our results support the claim that extending marine protected areas to mesophotic reefs is required to maximize the protection of both species and functional diversities to eventually maintain coral reef ecosystem functioning and associated services across the broader seascape.

Keywords : Coral reef, Functional traits, Beta diversity, Video surveys, Western Indian Ocean

50 **INTRODUCTION**

51 Coral reefs cover close to 300,000 km², which is just under 0.1% of the oceans' surface area 52 (Spalding et al. 2001). Despite this restricted cover, coral reefs are one of the world's most diverse 53 and productive ecosystems, supporting prodigious biodiversity and providing important ecosystem 54 services to many millions of people. In fact, over 4,000 species of teleost fishes are associated with 55 coral reefs (Sale 2013). Fishes are central to reef ecosystems, providing essential ecological 56 functions such as biomass production, regulation of foodwebs, nutrient cycling and sand formation 57 among others (Villéger et al. 2017; Brandl et al. 2019). Fishes also provide food security to 58 hundreds of millions of people (Sala et al. 2021). However, coral reef fishes are severely affected 59 by overexploitation, habitat loss and climate change, especially through marine heatwayes (Eddy et al. 2021). In response to this "coral reef crisis," studies around the world have examined the 60 61 social, institutional, and environmental conditions that influence fish biodiversity and ecosystem 62 functions (Cinner et al. 2016, 2020). However, most of these studies focused on shallow (< 30m) 63 reef communities (Rocha et al. 2018). As a result, the distribution, abundance and function of fish 64 assemblages that occupy the deeper range of reefs are less known compared to shallow reefs. In 65 other words, variation of the large diversity of biological traits (e.g. size, diet, mobility, behavior; 66 (Villéger et al. 2017), and their participation in core processes (Brandl et al. 2019) along depth 67 gradients remains largely unknown (see however Cure et al. 2021 and Carrington et al. 2021). Yet, unraveling the distribution of fishes and of their traits across depth is critical for effective 68 69 ecosystem-based fisheries management (Lindfield et al. 2016).

70

Mesophotic coral ecosystems occur in the deeper parts of the ocean's photic zone, with depth ranging from 30 to 150 m (Eyal et al. 2021), experience reduced temperatures and light, and may be protected from localized anthropogenic stressors such as pollution and fishing. This suggests that cooler conditions in deeper coral reefs could buffer the impacts of the strongest stressors affecting fishes in shallow water. The deep reef refugia hypothesis emerged from genetic connectivity research (Lesser et al. 2009; Bongaerts et al. 2010; Assis et al. 2016) and was reinforced by the fact that many coral reef species occur across a wide depth range (Rocha et al. 2018; Medeiros et al. 2021). However, the increasing frequency and severity of marine heatwaves (Oliver et al. 2018; Venegas et al. 2019), and accumulating reports of impacts reaching mesophotic depths (Jackson et al. 2001), cast doubt on the ability of depth refuges to provide protection to fish

81 communities over the long-term (Rocha et al. 2018).

82

83 A refugium is defined as an "habitat where some components of biodiversity retreat to, persist in 84 and can potentially expand from under changing environmental conditions" (sensu, Keppel et al. 2012). The role of refugia to protect species from extinction has been assessed worldwide for 85 86 different taxa (Pellissier et al. 2014; Brown et al. 2020). However, biodiversity is multifaceted and 87 includes other components in addition to the number of species. A largely unexplored dimension 88 of the role of refugia is their effects on functional diversity, despite the importance of functional 89 diversity for community and ecosystem functioning. In other words, the ability of refugia to fully 90 encapsulate diversity has been poorly investigated, especially as it relates to their capacity to 91 reduce the loss of ecological function (Ordonez and Svenning 2015). This is particularly true for 92 mesophotic reefs. Indeed, despite the hypothesis suggesting that mesophotic reefs could be refugia 93 for reef biodiversity (Jankowski et al. 2015; Lindfield et al. 2016; Coleman et al. 2018; Rocha et 94 al. 2018; Stefanoudis et al. 2019), there is still a critical lack of evaluation of their role as refugia 95 for species and trait diversity of fishes (Carrington et al. 2021; Cure et al. 2021).

96

97 Thus, considering the multifaceted definition of biodiversity, the mesophotic reef refugia 98 hypothesis could follow several expectations, depending on similarity in species and trait diversity 99 between shallow and mesophotic reefs (Figure 1): (1) Enriched full refugia: mesophotic reefs host 100 the same species and trait composition as shallow reefs, plus host unique species and traits not 101 observed in shallow reefs; (2) Full refugia: mesophotic reefs host the same species and traits 102 composition than shallow reef while maintaining the same biomass distribution among species; 103 (3) Functional refugia: mesophotic reefs host different species than shallow reefs but these distinct 104 species have the same trait values; (4) Not refugia: mesophotic and shallow reefs host distinct 105 species and traits composition.

106

Here, we tested the potential refugia role of mesophotic ecosystems for multiple facets of fish diversity using a video-based survey in coral reefs from Mayotte (an island in the Western Indian Ocean), along a depth gradient from 7.8 to 99.7 m. More specifically, we analyzed how taxonomic and functional diversity and composition of coral reef fishes changed along the depth gradient.



112

113 Figure 1: A multifaceted approach to test whether deep reefs are refugia for taxonomic (circle) 114 and functional (square) facets of biodiversity. The size of a circle or square represents the 115 taxonomic or functional richness of an assemblage while overlapping represents similarity in 116 species or functional composition between assemblages from mesophotic and shallow reefs. The associated table shows the expected value of four diversity metrics for each scenario. ΔR ichness 117 118 is the difference in richness between mesophotic and shallow and dissimilarity is the proportion 119 of richness not shared by shallow and mesophotic reefs. A: No refugia, mesophotic and shallow 120 reefs host highly distinct species and trait combinations. B & C: Partial refugia, shallow and

121 mesophotic reefs share a subset of species and traits but also a proportion of unique species and

- 122 traits, in B, shallow reefs host more species and trait combinations than mesophotic reef. D:
- Functional refugia, mesophotic reef host dissimilar species communities from shallow reefs, but similar traits composition. E: Full refugia, mesophotic reefs host the same composition of species
- and hence of traits as shallow reefs. F: Enriched full refugia, mesophotic reefs host all the species
- and trait combinations present in shallow reefs, plus host unique species which have unique traits
- 127 *(absent in shallow reefs).*
- 128

129 MATERIALS AND METHODS

130 Underwater video surveys of coral reef fishes

Mayotte is a volcanic island (360 km²) in the northern Mozambique Channel and is surrounded by one of the world's largest lagoons (area of ~1500 km² surface). The coral reefs of Mayotte hosts more than 700 fish species (Wickel et al. 2014), but recent and rapid human development (annual growth rate higher than 4%, Marie et al. 2018) is driving fast-paced change across the coral reef communities.

136 The choice of study sites was made using two complementary tools: observation of the 137 habitat using rosette cameras and a 3D reconstruction of the site using data collected by the boat's 138 sounder. The rosette camera system consisted of four cameras oriented in four different directions. 139 This system was manually lowered to the bottom over the point of interest using a rope and the 140 videos were viewed afterwards. For the 3D reconstruction, latitude, longitude and depth 141 coordinates were recorded every second using a GPS plotter sonar (Lowrance, HDS10). These 142 traces were then used to reconstruct the 3D profile of the substrate using the *raster* (Hijmans et al. 143 2015), gstat (Pebesma and Heuvelink 2016) and sp (Bivand et al. 2008) R packages (Figure 2). 144 Using to this information, we selected six sites along the west coral reef barrier of the island with 145 as much similarity as possible in coral cover and complexity within each four different depths, 146 ranging from 7.8 to 99.7 m deep (Figure 2).

147 Fish communities were surveyed using a non-baited remote underwater stereovideo 148 system, which is a cost-effective technique for surveying reef fish across a range of depths and 149 habitats and beyond the limits of regular scientific diving (Mallet and Pelletier 2014). We chose 150 non-baited video systems to avoid over-representation of piscivore species. The stereovideo 151 system consisted of two digital cameras (GoPro Hero 4+ and Hero 3+) inside 150m-rated housings 152 mounted on an aluminum bar, 80 cm apart and each oriented 8° inward using 3D printed mounts to maximize pictures overlap 5 m away (Letessier et al. 2015). Four PVC legs (length 60 cm), each 153 154 weighted with 1 kg, were attached under the bar to make a quadripod system. The recording was 155 made using the cameras' medium view setting (84° of horizontal field of view in water) and at full HD definition (1080p) with a frame rate of 30 fps. Calibration of the system was performed using 156 157 a 2x2x1 m black cubic frame with white dots of known coordinates situated 4 m from the system 158 underwater. Distortion of the cameras was calibrated with an 80x50 cm chessboard situated 1 m 159 from the cameras underwater (Neuswanger et al. 2016). Measurement accuracy was verified by 160 filming a graduated ruler underwater with each system.

Each of the 6 sites was surveyed several times (between 9 and 64 times, 20.2 ± 21.6 , mean \pm sd) from 26-Feb to 23-Mar 2019. All surveys were performed between 9:00 and 17:00. Weather ranged from warm and calm sunny days to rainy and windy days with as much as 1.5 m waves in that period. Current did not exceed 0.8 knots. To minimize fishes moving between drops, and potential spatial pseudo-replication, the four depths within a site were simultaneously surveyed, and video systems within a depth level were dropped at least 100m apart from each other (Langlois et al. 2020). Videos recording lasted from 55 minutes to 171 minutes (98.9 ± 36.3).



168
169 Figure 2: Location of surveyed sites around Mayotte Island in the SW Indian Ocean. On the left,
170 the 3D reconstruction of each site and on the right each red dot represents a drop of a remote
171 underwater camera.

172

173 Video analyses

174 We analyzed data from 121 drops (i.e., assemblages with fewer than five species were not 175 included). For each video, the first two minutes were not analyzed to limit disturbance due to the 176 video system deployment. As the total duration of video recorded varied among sites and depth 177 level, and as analyzing strereovideos is a demanding task we analyzed five, one-minute non-178 overlapping sequences randomly selected within each recording. Hence, we keep a constant 179 sampling effort across all replicates for estimating abundance of fish species, even if this sampling 180 effort did not allow to reach the asymptote of the species accumulation curve (Supplementary 181 materials, Figure S1). For each of these sequences, all fishes up to 5 m from the camera were 182 counted and identified to the lowest possible taxonomic level. Abundance of each species was estimated as the maximum number of individuals of each species observed in a single frame during 183 184 each one-minute sequence (MaxN; Ellis 1995). A total of 12,891 individuals (50%) belonging to 185 182 species were identified. 2206 individuals were identified at the genus level (44 genera) and 186 10,382 (40%) at the family level (26 families). We also did not consider cryptobenthic species 187 (Apogonidae [7 individuals], Gobiidae [33 individuals] and Chondrichthyans [30 individuals]). 188 Because a high proportion of individuals were not identified at the species levels, we also tested 189 the sensitivity of our analyses to the taxonomic resolution by rerunning our analyses at the genus 190 level. Size calibration calculation and 3D fish measurements were all performed using the open-191 source software VidSync (www.vidsync.org).

192

Biomass estimation

Measuring manually each individual for the 121 videos was impractical given their number. Thus, we measured all individuals for 45 videos (for a total of 7h18min) at one of the six sites. Then, for each individual in the present study, we assigned the measured average size at the lowest taxonomic level (species, genus, family) possible according to available data. This process may reduce the dissimilarity in species size between shallow and mesophotic reefs. However, comparison of the distribution in size between shallow reef (from 0 to 30m) and mesophotic reef

200 (from 30 to 99m) for the most measured common species (37) show that body size did not

significantly vary across the depth gradient (Supplementary materials, Figure S2). Some species or genera were not observed at the selected site for fish measurement (59%). Thus, we associated the average size for the given taxonomic level from the Reef Life Survey database (highly correlated with the average size from our dataset, cor = 0.78, p-value < 0.001, <u>https://reeflifesurvey.com/</u>, Edgar et al. 2020).

206207 Functional traits

208 Five traits linked to the key functions performed by fishes were selected: Diet, Position in 209 the water column, Gregariousness, Activity, Mobility, Size. These traits linked to food acquisition, 210 locomotion and behaviour are a proxy of the ability of each species to impact ecosystem processes. Values were taken from the dataset used by (Mouillot et al. 2014). Diet characterized each species' 211 212 main food source and was coded using seven categories: herbivore and detritivore, macro-algae 213 herbivore, sessile invertebrate feeder, mobile invertebrate feeder, planktonivore, piscivore and 214 omnivore. Position in the water column was coded using four ordered categories: benthic 215 (sedentary on the bottom), demersal (swimming near the bottom), pelagic site-attached (swimming 216 off the bottom within a reef), and pelagic mobile (swimming off the bottom between reefs). 217 Mobility was coded using three ordered categories: sedentary, mobile within a reef, and mobile 218 between reefs. Active period was coded as either diurnal (active during the day), nocturnal (active 219 during the night) or both. Gregariousness was coded using five ordered categories from solitary to 220 large schooling. Body size was coded using six ordered categories: 0-7 cm, 7.1-15 cm, 15.1-30 221 cm, 30.1–50 cm, 50.1–80 cm, and >80 cm. For individuals identified at the genus or family level, 222 we used the average modality of each trait for the given genus or family. Functional distance between all pairs of species was computed using Gower's metric (Gower and Legendre 1986). 223 224

225 **Taxonomic and functional diversity**

To evaluate the influence of depth on reef fish diversity of each assemblage we applied a framework based on a generalization of Hill numbers to measure taxonomic and functional diversity in all assemblages (Chao et al. 2019). Hill numbers provide a parametric family of diversity indices, differing by a parameter "q" that determines their sensitivity to species relative abundances, all expressed in the same unit as "equivalent number of species" (*sensu* species with even dominance and even functional distance).

232

Taxonomic diversity was described using two indices: species richness (i.e., q = 0 indicates that all species have equal weight) and taxonomic entropy (i.e., q=1, as exponential of the Shannon index):

$$TD = e^{-\sum_{i=1}^{S} p_i \log \log p_i} \qquad Eq(1)$$

237

where *i* is the number of species in an assemblage and pi is the relative dominance (abundance or biomass) of the *i*th species.

240

241 To estimate functional diversity, we also used the framework from Chao et al. (2019) 242 setting the parameter τ to the mean functional distance over all pairs of species:

243

244
$$FD = \left(\sum_{i=1}^{S} p_i \left(\sum_{j=1}^{S} \left[1 - f(d_{ij}(\tau))\right] p_j\right)^{q-1}\right)^{1/(1-q)} \qquad Eq(2)$$

245

Functional richness (q = 0) was computed with species presence/absence (i.e., all p_i equals to 1/S):

248 249 $FD = \sum_{i=1}^{S} \left(\sum_{j=1}^{S} \left[1 - f\left(d_{ij}(\tau) \right) \right] \right)^{-1} \quad Eq(3)$

250 Functional entropy (q = 1) was computed on species biomass:

251 252

253

 $FD = e^{-\sum_{i=1}^{S} p_i \log (\sum_{j=1}^{S} [1 - f(d_{ij}(\tau))] p_j)} Eq (4)$

This metric is a generalization of the Shannon entropy with functional distance having equal importance as species dominance.

256

257 Taxonomic and functional dissimilarities

258 The dissimilarity in species and functional entities among assemblages was also computed 259 using the framework of Chao et al. (2019) with, as for alpha-diversity, q=0 (i.e., dissimilarity in composition of species or functional entities) and q=1 (i.e., dissimilarity in dominance of species 260 or functional entities). The dissimilarity indices are bounded between 0 and 1, with 0 indicating 261 262 identical assemblages (in terms of species or trait values) and values close to 1 indicating a strong dissimilarity in species or functional entities. We applied a depth decay analysis (similar to the 263 264 distance decay in biogeography, Nekola and White 1999) by comparing the dissimilarity between 265 0-20m assemblages and each of all other deeper assemblages.

266

Changes in functional richness and structure through depth were illustrated in a functional space built using Principal Coordinates Analysis (PCoA) computed on functional distances between species. Indices and functional space were computed and drawn using the *mFD* package (Magneville et al. 2022).

271

272 Habitat predictors

273 To include the environment of each assemblage as covariate, we measured variables related to 274 abiotic and biotic habitat recorded by the video systems. It is however important to note that hard 275 substrate was mainly targeted and any results on variation among habitat should be interpreted 276 with caution. For the abiotic variables, we recorded the substrate type (soft, mix, hard), 277 topography, habitat complexity (from 0 to 3), temperature and depth. For temperature and depth 278 measurements, we used a custom-made data logger built by the company Syera 279 (https://syera.fr/wp/glog/) and using the Bar30 temperature-depth sensor from the company blue 280 robotics (https://bluerobotics.com/). Moreover, categorical abundance of dominant coral biota, 281 sponge, non-scleractinian coral and scleractinian coral were recorded. We performed a principal 282 component analysis of a mixture of numerical and categorical variables (Factor analysis of mixed 283 data, FAMD, using FactoMineR). Depth was not included in this analysis. The first four 284 orthogonal PCA axes explained 62% of the total variance in habitat predictors among assemblages 285 and were retained as explanatory variables in the analyses to test environmental influence on fish 286 assemblages (Supplementary materials, Figure S3).

287

288 Determinants of fish diversity

We used generalized linear mixed models (GLMMs) to investigate the effect of depth while controlling for environmental differences in the four diversity indices and biomass hypothesized 291 to influence composition, entropy and traits of reef fish communities. Variables included the first

four axes of the environmental FAMD and depth while accounting for the site and date of the

sampling as random effects. For each model, we computed marginal R^2 providing the variance

explained only by fixed effects and conditional R^2 providing the variance explained by the entire model, i.e., both fixed effects and random effects. Finally, we performed visreg analyses (Breheny

and Burchett 2017) to isolate the exclusive effect of depth on diversity after accounting for

- 297 environmental confounding factors.
- 298

299 Determinants of fish dissimilarity

300 To test if depth was the best predictor of taxonomic and functional dissimilarities, we applied 301 generalized dissimilarity modelling (GDM, Ferrier et al. 2007). GDM examines the dissimilarities 302 among pairs of assemblages as a non-linear multivariate function of the depth and environment of 303 those assemblages. GDM thus overcomes two potential problems: non-linearity in dissimilarity 304 between assemblages and environmental dissimilarities, and uneven rates of dissimilarities along 305 environmental gradients (Ferrier et al. 2007; Manion et al. 2016). We selected the three I-spline 306 basis function options and accounted for spatial autocorrelation by including the geographic 307 distance between pairs of assemblages as a predictor variable. To assess the impact of each 308 environmental variable, multiple GDMs were run by removing one variable at a time. Percentage 309 contribution of each variable was determined by comparing deviance of the full model to deviance 310 of models without the variable of interest. Variables included the first four axes of the 311 environmental PCA and depth.

312

313 **RESULTS**

314

315 Diversity of fishes along depth gradient

Total fish biomass and taxonomic richness (q = 0) significantly decreased with depth (Figure 3 & 4, p-value < 0.001, Table S1). On average, 29.3 (\pm 10.7 sd) species were observed between 0-20 m, and 8.4 (\pm 3.6 sd) beyond 80 m. Taxonomic entropy (q = 0) also decreased with depth, but less steeply than taxonomic richness, indicating that decreasing species richness was associated with an increase in species dominance (p-value = 0.002).

Functional richness values varied from 1.7 to 6.2 among assemblages $(4.3 \pm 1.0, \text{Figure 4})$. Functional entropy varied from 1.1 to 4.8 among assemblages $(2.8 \pm 0.7, \text{Figure 4})$. Unlike taxonomic diversity, functional richness and functional entropy were not significantly influenced by depth (p-value = 0.134, 0.498, respectively, Table S1).



Figure 3 Partial regression plot showing changes in biomass of fish along the depth gradient

- 327 while accounting for environmental variables. Statistical analyses were carried out using
- 328 generalized linear mixed models and related statistics are reported in the Results.
- 329



330 331

Figure 4: Partial regression plot showing changes in taxonomic richness (q=0, A) and entropy

333 (q=1, B) and functional richness $(q=0, \tau = mean functional distance, C)$ and entropy $(q=1, \tau = 334 mean functional distance, D)$ of fish communities along the depth gradient, while accounting for

environmental variables. Statistical analyses were carried out using generalized linear mixed
 models and related statistics are reported in the Results.

337

338 Dissimilarity of fish assemblages along depth gradient

339 The dissimilarity in taxonomic composition and structure between assemblages was high overall, ranging from 0.4 to 1 (0.86 ± 0.09) and 0.1 to 1 (0.77 ± 0.2), respectively. The highest dissimilarity 340 values were observed between shallow (0-20 m) and deep assemblages (>60 m) (i.e., high value 341 342 in the difference in depth axis, Figure 5). Limited dissimilarity in functional composition was 343 observed between assemblages (0.13 ± 0.13) . The dissimilarity in functional structure was higher 344 than functional composition (0.46 ± 0.25) , highlighting an important change in the distribution of biomass between functional entities. Both taxonomic and functional dissimilarities increased with 345 346 an increase in depth difference (all p-values < 0.001 and R² ranged between 0.30 and 0.47; Figure 347 5).

The diversity patterns described above were very similar to those computed only with the genus presence and dominance (Supplementary materials, Figure S4 and S5).



350

Figure 5: Depth decay of fish diversity, mean dissimilarity (whiskers representing sd) in taxonomic and functional composition and structure between 0-20m assemblages (coded as being at 0m) and each all other deeper assemblages. The first row shows dissimilarity in species composition (q=0) and structure (q=1). The second row dissimilarity in functional composition (q=0, $\tau =$ mean

functional distance) and structure (q = 0, $\tau = mean$ functional distance). Yellow lines are linear

regressions (with associated statistics) between the difference in depth and beta diversity indices.
Shaded areas represent the 95% confidence interval of the regression.

358

Finally, the projection of all species along the first two axes of the PCoA confirmed that mesophotic and shallow reefs mostly overlap in functional space but distribution of biomass within this shared functional volume markedly changed (Figure 6).

362



363

Figure 6: Changes in functional composition and structure along the depth gradient. The traits space represented is made of the first two axes (Principal Components of a PCoA, relative importance: 32 and 30%, respectively). Species are represented by circles whose size is proportional to the biomass of the species. The gray area represents the portion of the trait space filled by all species present across all depths and colored areas represented the functional richness, i.e., trait space filled by species present in each depth range. Vertical and horizontal lines illustrate the biomass-weighted average position of species from each depth range.

371

³⁷² Environmental drivers of taxonomic and functional diversity

373 Despite differences in habitat among sites, depth was the most important variable in 374 explaining biomass, number of species and taxonomic entropy, followed by PC1 of the habitat 375 data (Table S1). This axis is driven by the shift from scleractinian corals to non-scleractinian corals 376 with depth (Supplementary materials, Figure S3). For taxonomic richness and taxonomic entropy, the models explain 66% (conditional $R^2 = 0.66$ and marginal $R^2 = 0.45$) and 22% (conditional R^2 377 = 0.22 and marginal $R^2 = 0.19$) of the variance, respectively. Visreg confirmed that depth, after 378 379 controlling for environmental conditions, significantly explained the biomass, species richness and 380 entropy pattern between assemblages (Figure 3 and 4). Conversely, environmental conditions and 381 depth poorly explain variation of functional richness and entropy (25 and 12%, respectively; 382 conditional $R^2 = 0.25$, 0.12 and marginal $R^2 = 0.21$ and 0.09, respectively).

383 The GDM explained 41 and 44% of the variation in species composition and structure, 384 respectively. Depth was the most important explanatory variable for changes in species 385 composition (Supplementary materials, Figure S6), contributing to 16% and 21% of the explained deviance, respectively, with a lower effect of environmental PC1 (11% of the deviance explained 386 387 for both models). Variation in functional composition was poorly explained by differences in 388 environmental variables and depth (9% of deviance explained). The GDM explained 41% of the 389 variation in functional structure, and depth was the greatest driver, contributing to 23% of the 390 deviance explained. 391

392 DISCUSSION

393 Here, thanks to a video survey, we documented how taxonomic and trait diversity of reef 394 fishes changed along a depth gradient from 7.8 to 99.7m around Mayotte Island. Deeper 395 ecosystems exhibit reduced species richness as already reported (Piacenza et al. 2015). However, 396 our results demonstrate that shallow reefs and mesophotic reefs contain similar levels of functional 397 richness with a partial overlap in trait space despite the difference in species composition. While 398 such convergence has been observed at biogeographic scale (Loiseau et al. 2017; Olivier et al. 399 2018; McLean et al. 2021), ours is a novel example showing trait convergence in marine fish 400 communities driven by taxonomically different species.

401 Thus, while the taxonomic composition of the fish fauna varied over depth, species were 402 often replaced by another with similar functional roles such that only minor differences in 403 functional entities occurred across depth ranges. For instance, small planktivorous *Chromis* spp. 404 were progressively replaced by *Pseudanthias* spp. another small planktivorous species, with a ratio 405 of two *Pseudanthias* spp. per 100 *Chromis* spp. between 0 and 20 m versus a ratio of 49 per 100 406 beyond 60 m. This trait similarity across the depth gradient could limit the competition between 407 species that have different distributions along the depth gradient and thus promote coexistence of 408 fishes on the seascape (Goetze et al. 2021; Bosch et al. 2021).

409 Thus, functional space remains relatively constant over the entire water column. This 410 finding is similar to Carrington et al.'s (2021) findings that temperate shallow-water and deep-sea 411 ecosystems have similar functional composition. The limited shift in trait composition could be 412 explained by the relative homogeneity in the temperature of the water column from our sampling 413 area, ranging only from 24.6 to 31°C. Even if biologically significant, this 6°C degree difference 414 may not be strong enough to limite the establishment of adapted shallow reef functional entities at 415 greater depths. For instance, in the Bay of La Paz, across the same range of depth temperature 416 decreased by 11°C (Hollarsmith et al. 2020). However, conversely to our study Medeiros et al. 417 (2021) found a divergence in both species and functional composition with depth along the 418 Northeastern Brazilian subprovince characterized by a temperature range similar to ours (7°C).

419 However, despite the functional richness of shallow and mesophotic reefs remaining 420 relatively similar, traits dependent on light energy, like herbivory, do not occur beyond 60m depth 421 (Supplementary materials, Figure S7). Such a decrease is expected to be due to harsher 422 environmental conditions in deep habitat that filter out some species present on shallow reefs (Price et al. 1999; Costello and Chaudhary 2017). Moreover, the overlap in trait space (i.e., 423 424 functional similarity) is accompanied by changes in the structure of the traits with a significant 425 shift in biomass between functional entities. Indeed, the increase in the dissimilarity of functional 426 structure with depth highlights the fact that dominant and rare functional entities are different 427 between shallow reefs and deep reefs (Figure 5). For instance, 75% of Chaetodontidae, 428 corallivores, were observed between 0 and 34 m and only 5% were observed beyond 48 m. 429 Conversely, 50% of Carangidae, which are highly mobile and piscivorous, were recorded beyond 430 48 m. Overall, variation in trait structure was characterized by a greater relative biomass and 431 abundance of piscivores on deep reefs, while herbivorous fishes were relatively more abundant on 432 shallow reefs (Supplementary materials, Figure S7). In fact, piscivorous species represent 8% of 433 the total biomass in shallow reefs (0-20m), but represent 48% of the biomass beyond 60 m. The 434 biomass of piscivorous and mobile fishes within reefs, such as grouper, is even higher beyond 435 $60 \text{ m} (538 \text{g} \pm 859, \text{mean} \pm \text{sd})$ than between 0 and 20 m (191 g ± 222).

436 Coral reef ecosystems have been heavily impacted by temperature rise over the last few 437 decades, with documented increases in intense heatwaves leading to massive bleaching events 438 (Genevier et al. 2019). Synergistically, fisheries strongly impact coral reef fish communities 439 (MacNeil et al. 2015). Deep-sea ecosystems have been described as stable, with the incidence and 440 intensity of heatwaves, occurrence of storms and fishing activities lower in mesophotic depths than in shallow water (Kahng et al. 2017). This "stability" suggests that mesophotic reefs could provide 441 442 protection to fish communities (Bongaerts et al. 2010). In the same vein, we found that the upper 443 mesophotic (30-60 m) zone holds the greatest potential to aid in reef recovery following 444 disturbance due to the functional overlap with the shallow reef, suggesting that the upper mesophotic could be a "functional refugia". However, the limited similarity in species composition 445 446 between mesophotic assemblages and shallow reef assemblages suggests that only a relatively 447 small number of deeper species may be able to live on shallow reefs. Moreover, the strong decrease 448 in biomass with depth supports the hypothesis that mesophotic reefs are a limited functional 449 refugia in the face of climate change (i.e. they host dissimilar species, but similar traits while 450 exhibiting a decrease and a shift in biomass distribution across traits). Lastly, despite the minimal 451 shift in functional trait composition, there is a marked shift from dominance of herbivorous fishes 452 to piscivorous fishes with increasing depth. Herbivorous species can have positive effects on coral 453 cover by controlling macroalgae populations, which can prevent coral mortality and promoting 454 resilience of coral reefs in the face of anthropogenic disturbance and heatwaves (Burkepile and 455 Hay 2008). Maintaining high herbivore biomass and diversity is an important goal for sustaining 456 coral reef functioning (Lefcheck et al. 2019) that cannot be supported by mesophotic reefs deeper 457 than 60m. However, our results demonstrate the importance of mesophotic reefs to fishery-targeted species, since the biomass of some piscivorous fishes that are targets of fisheries increase with 458 459 depth (Lindfield et al. 2016; Weijerman et al. 2019; Bosch et al. 2021). Even low fishing pressure 460 on shallow reefs of Mayotte could also create a decreasing gradient of biomass of targeted 461 piscivorous (Doherty et al. 2015).

While we documented the convergence of trait diversity over depth, we are unable to explain the potential consequences for the ecosystem functioning, since studies linking fish traits to ecosystem functioning are still lacking (Villéger et al. 2017; Bellwood et al. 2018; Bosch et al.

465 2021b). However, since biomass distribution across traits determines the influence of fish on 466 ecosystems functioning, we can easily assume that shallow and mesophotic reef fish communities do not have the same influence of reef ecosystems. As with all traits-based studies, trait choices 467 468 ultimately influence research conclusions. Our results are limited to the set of traits used and to 469 the depth range scales examined. Future studies should therefore attempt to identify the influence 470 of depth on physiologic traits such as reproduction and direct functions such as nutrient cycling 471 (Allgeier et al. 2016) and productivity (Morais and Bellwood 2020) to better understand the 472 functional complementarity of mesophotic and shallow reefs. Understanding how these functions 473 vary along depth gradients is critically important to predict how mesophotic reefs may respond to 474 future environmental change and for their management and conservation. Finally, fishes associated 475 with mesophotic reefs may perform vertical movements over seasonal and diel time frames 476 (Bacheler et al. 2021; Brazo et al. 2021). This behavior could increase the similarity between 477 shallow and mesophotic reefs.

478

479 Preserving marine ecosystems is a crucial priority, as they support the livelihood and well-being 480 of millions of citizens (human food provisioning, water purification, disease regulation, cultural 481 values, etc.) (Cabral et al. 2020). Despite their importance, and although the percentage of the coral 482 reef surface devoted to protected areas has markedly increased globally (Maxwell et al. 2020), 483 deep reefs are rarely the focus of conservation strategies. Fishing has historically impacted shallow 484 coral reefs more than the mesophotic part, but as technology continues to improve, the exploitation 485 of the deeper areas has been increasing (Audzijonyte and Pecl 2018). Thus, in the context of the 486 ongoing rise in the severity of threats, mesophotic reefs are an important habitat for conserving 487 coral reef fish diversity. The unique species composition hosted by mesophotic reefs supports the recommendation that protected areas should be representative of a broad range of habitats across 488 489 depths. Expanding marine protected areas to adjacent mesophotic reefs is required to protect a 490 mosaic of habitat, maximising the number of species and functional entities protected, critical to 491 prevent future local population extirpations and maintain coral reef ecosystem functioning and 492 associated services at all depths. Sustainable management of deep reef ecosystems will also have 493 strong impacts on the management of fishery resources by providing shelters for targeted species. 494

495 Acknowledgement

This research was funded by the CUFR of Mayotte, by the second Research Consortium Iles eparse
 2017-2020 (project MAPOR), by the French Foundation for Research on Biodiversity and its
 partners (FRB - www.fondationbiodiversite.fr) and by ANR (The French National Research

Agency) under the "investissement d'avenir" program with the reference ANR-16-IDEX-0006.

- 500 The authors thank Priscilla Dupont and Julien Wikel for helping with fish ID on videos and Yann
- 501 Mercky and Elliott Sucre for their help on field operation.

502 **REFERENCES**

- 503
- Allgeier JE, Valdivia A, Cox C, Layman CA (2016) Fishing down nutrients on coral reefs. Nat
 Commun 7:12461
- Assis J, Coelho NC, Lamy T, Valero M, Alberto F, Serrão EÁ (2016) Deep reefs are climatic
 refugia for genetic diversity of marine forests. Journal of biogeography 43:833-844
- Audzijonyte A, Pecl GT (2018) Deep impact of fisheries. Nature ecology & evolution 2:1348 1349
- Bacheler NM, Shertzer KW, Runde BJ, Rudershausen PJ, Buckel JA (2021) Environmental
 conditions, diel period, and fish size influence the horizontal and vertical movements of
 red snapper. Scientific Reports 11:1-16
- Bellwood DR, Streit RP, Brandl SJ, Tebbett SB (2019) The meaning of the term 'function' in
 ecology: A coral reef perspective. Functional Ecology, 33:948-961.
- Bivand RS, Pebesma EJ, Gómez-Rubio V, Pebesma EJ (2008) Applied spatial data analysis with
 R. Springer
- 517 Bongaerts P, Ridgway T, Sampayo E, Hoegh-Guldberg O (2010) Assessing the 'deep reef 518 refugia'hypothesis: focus on Caribbean reefs. Coral reefs 29:309-327
- Bosch NE, Monk J, Goetze J, Wilson S, Babcock RC, Barrett N, ... & Langlois, TJ (2022) Effects
 of human footprint and biophysical factors on the body-size structure of fished marine
 species. Conservation Biology, 36(2), e13807.
- Bosch NE, McLean M, Zarco-Perello S, Bennett S, Stuart-Smith RD, Vergés A, ... & Wernberg,
 T (2022) Persistent thermally driven shift in the functional trait structure of herbivorous
 fishes: Evidence of top-down control on the rebound potential of temperate seaweed
 forests?. Global Change Biology, 28:2296-2311.
- Brandl SJ, Rasher DB, Côté IM, Casey JM, Darling ES, Lefcheck JS, Duffy JE (2019) Coral reef
 ecosystem functioning: eight core processes and the role of biodiversity. Frontiers in
 Ecology and the Environment 17:445-454
- Brazo A, Marques R, Zimmermann M, Aspillaga E, Hereu B, Saragoni G, Mercière A, Crec'Hriou
 R, Mercader M, Verdoit-Jarraya M (2021) Seasonal influence on the bathymetric
 distribution of an endangered fish within a marine protected area. Scientific Reports 11:116
- 533 Breheny P, Burchett W (2017) Visualization of regression models using visreg. R J 9:56
- Brown SC, Wigley TM, Otto-Bliesner BL, Rahbek C, Fordham DA (2020) Persistent Quaternary
 climate refugia are hospices for biodiversity in the Anthropocene. Nature Climate Change
 10:244-248
- Burkepile DE, Hay ME (2008) Herbivore species richness and feeding complementarity affect
 community structure and function on a coral reef. Proceedings of the National Academy of
 Sciences 105:16201-16206
- Cabral RB, Bradley D, Mayorga J, Goodell W, Friedlander AM, Sala E, Costello C, Gaines SD
 (2020) A global network of marine protected areas for food. Proceedings of the National
 Academy of Sciences 117:28134-28139
- 543 Carrington VG, Papa Y, Beese CM, Hall J, Covain R, Horn P, Ladds MA, Rogers A, Yeo D (2021)
 544 How functionally diverse are fish in the deep? A comparison of fish communities in deep
 545 and shallow-water systems. Diversity and Distributions

- Chao A, Chiu CH, Villéger S, Sun IF, Thorn S, Lin YC, Chiang JM, Sherwin WB (2019) An
 attribute-diversity approach to functional diversity, functional beta diversity, and related
 (dis) similarity measures. Ecological Monographs 89:e01343
- Cinner JE, Huchery C, MacNeil MA, Graham NA, McClanahan TR, Maina J, Maire E, Kittinger
 JN, Hicks CC, Mora C (2016) Bright spots among the world's coral reefs. Nature 535:416 419
- Cinner JE, Zamborain-Mason J, Gurney GG, Graham NA, MacNeil MA, Hoey AS, ... & Mouillot
 D. (2020). Meeting fisheries, ecosystem function, and biodiversity goals in a human dominated world. Science, 368(6488), 307-311.
- Coleman RR, Copus JM, Coffey DM, Whitton RK, Bowen BW (2018) Shifting reef fish
 assemblages along a depth gradient in Pohnpei, Micronesia. PeerJ 6:e4650
- Costello MJ, Chaudhary C (2017) Marine biodiversity, biogeography, deep-sea gradients, and
 conservation. Current Biology 27:R511-R527
- Cure K, Currey-Randall L, Galaiduk R, Radford B, Wakeford M, Heyward A (2021) Depth
 gradients in abundance and functional roles suggest limited depth refuges for herbivorous
 fishes. Coral Reefs 40:365-379
- Doherty B, Herfaut J, Le Manach F, Harper S, Zeller D (2015) Reconstructing domestic marine
 fisheries in Mayotte from 1950–2010. Fisheries Catch Reconstructions in the Western
 Indian Ocean, eds F Le Manach and D Pauly (Vancouver: University of British
 Columbia):53-65
- Eddy TD, Lam VW, Reygondeau G, Cisneros-Montemayor AM, Greer K, Palomares MLD, Bruno
 JF, Ota Y, Cheung WW (2021) Global decline in capacity of coral reefs to provide
 ecosystem services. One Earth 4:1278-1285
- Edgar GJ, Cooper A, Baker SC, Barker W, Barrett NS, Becerro MA, Bates AE, Brock D,
 Ceccarelli DM, Clausius E (2020) Reef Life Survey: Establishing the ecological basis for
 conservation of shallow marine life. Biological Conservation 252:1-14
- Ellis D (1995) Evaluation of video camera technique for indexing abundances of juvenile pink
 snapper Pristipomoides filamentosus, and other Hawaiian insular shelf fishes. Fishery
 Bulletin 93:67-77
- Eyal G, Laverick JH, Bongaerts P, Levy O, Pandolfi JM (2021) Mesophotic coral ecosystems of
 the Great Barrier Reef are understudied and underexplored. Frontiers in Marine Science
 8:83
- Ferrier S, Manion G, Elith J, Richardson K (2007) Using generalized dissimilarity modelling to
 analyse and predict patterns of beta diversity in regional biodiversity assessment. Diversity
 and distributions 13:252-264
- Genevier LG, Jamil T, Raitsos DE, Krokos G, Hoteit I (2019) Marine heatwaves reveal coral reef
 zones susceptible to bleaching in the Red Sea. Global change biology 25:2338-2351
- Goetze JS, Wilson S, Radford B, Fisher R, Langlois TJ, Monk J, Knott NA, Malcolm H, Currey Randall LM, Ierodiaconou D (2021) Increased connectivity and depth improve the
 effectiveness of marine reserves. Global Change Biology
- Gower JC, Legendre P (1986) Metric and Euclidean properties of dissimilarity coefficients.
 Journal of classification 3:5-48
- Hijmans RJ, Van Etten J, Cheng J, Mattiuzzi M, Sumner M, Greenberg JA, Lamigueiro OP, Bevan
 A, Racine EB, Shortridge A (2015) Package 'raster'. R package 734

- Jackson JB, Kirby MX, Berger WH, Bjorndal KA, Botsford LW, Bourque BJ, Bradbury RH,
 Cooke R, Erlandson J, Estes JA (2001) Historical overfishing and the recent collapse of
 coastal ecosystems. science 293:629-637
- Hollarsmith JA, Ramirez-Ortiz G. Winquist T, Velasco-Lozano M, DuBois K, Reyes-Bonilla H,
 Neumann KC, Grosholz ED (2020) Habitats and fish communities at mesophotic depths in
 the Mexican Pacific. Journal of Biogeography, 47:1552-1563.
- Jankowski M, Graham N, Jones G (2015) Depth gradients in diversity, distribution and habitat
 specialisation in coral reef fishes: implications for the depth-refuge hypothesis. Marine
 Ecology Progress Series 540:203-215
- Kahng S, Copus JM, Wagner D (2017) Mesophotic coral ecosystems. Marine animal forests: the
 ecology of benthic biodiversity hotspots:185-206
- Keppel G, Van Niel KP, Wardell-Johnson GW, Yates CJ, Byrne M, Mucina L, Schut AG, Hopper
 SD, Franklin SE (2012) Refugia: identifying and understanding safe havens for
 biodiversity under climate change. Global Ecology and Biogeography 21:393-404
- Langlois T, Goetze J, Bond T, Monk J, Abesamis RA, Asher J, ... & Harvey ES (2020) A field and
 video annotation guide for baited remote underwater stereo-video surveys of demersal fish
 assemblages. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 11: 1401-1409.
- Lefcheck JS, Innes-Gold AA, Brandl SJ, Steneck RS, Torres RE, Rasher DB (2019) Tropical fish
 diversity enhances coral reef functioning across multiple scales. Science advances
 5:eaav6420
- Lesser MP, Slattery M, Leichter JJ (2009) Ecology of mesophotic coral reefs. Journal of
 Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 375:1-8
- Letessier TB, Juhel J-B, Vigliola L, Meeuwig JJ (2015) Low-cost small action cameras in stereo
 generates accurate underwater measurements of fish. Journal of Experimental Marine
 Biology and Ecology 466:120-126
- Lindfield SJ, Harvey ES, Halford AR, McIlwain JL (2016) Mesophotic depths as refuge areas for
 fishery-targeted species on coral reefs. Coral Reefs 35:125-137
- 617 Loiseau N, Legras G, Kulbicki M, Mérigot B, Harmelin-Vivien M, Mazouni N, Galzin R, Gaertner
 618 J-C (2017) Multi-component β-diversity approach reveals conservation dilemma between
 619 species and functions of coral reef fishes. Journal of Biogeography 44:537-547
- MacNeil MA, Graham NA, Cinner JE, Wilson SK, Williams ID, Maina J, Newman S, Friedlander
 AM, Jupiter S, Polunin NV (2015) Recovery potential of the world's coral reef fishes.
 Nature 520:341-344
- Magneville C, Loiseau N, Albouy C, Casajus N, Claverie T, Escalas A, Leprieur F, Maire E,
 Mouillot D, Villéger S (2022) mFD: an R package to compute and illustrate the multiple
 facets of functional diversity. Ecography 2022
- Mallet D, Pelletier D (2014) Underwater video techniques for observing coastal marine
 biodiversity: a review of sixty years of publications (1952–2012). Fisheries Research
 154:44-62
- Manion G, Lisk M, Ferrier S, Nieto-Lugilde D, Fitzpatrick M (2016) gdm: Functions for
 generalized dissimilarity modeling. Rpackage version 1
- Marie C-V, Breton D, Crouzet M (2018) More than half of all adults living in Mayotte were born
 elsewhere. Population Societies:1-4
- Maxwell SL, Cazalis V, Dudley N, Hoffmann M, Rodrigues AS, Stolton S, Visconti P, Woodley
 S, Kingston N, Lewis E (2020) Area-based conservation in the twenty-first century. Nature
 586:217-227

- Medeiros APM, Ferreira BP, Alvarado F, Betancur RR, Soares MO, Santos BA (2021) Deep reefs
 are not refugium for shallow-water fish communities in the southwestern Atlantic. Ecol
 Evol 11:4413-4427
- Morais RA, Bellwood DR (2020) Principles for estimating fish productivity on coral reefs. Coral
 Reefs 39:1221-1231
- Mouillot D, Villéger S, Parravicini V, Kulbicki M, Arias-González JE, Bender M, Chabanet P,
 Floeter SR, Friedlander A, Vigliola L (2014) Functional over-redundancy and high
 functional vulnerability in global fish faunas on tropical reefs. Proceedings of the National
 Academy of Sciences 111:13757-13762
- Nekola JC, White PS (1999) The distance decay of similarity in biogeography and ecology. Journal
 of biogeography 26:867-878
- Neuswanger JR, Wipfli MS, Rosenberger AE, Hughes NF (2016) Measuring fish and their
 physical habitats: versatile 2D and 3D video techniques with user-friendly software.
 Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 73:1861-1873
- Olivier D, Loiseau N, Petatán-Ramírez D, Millán OT, Suárez-Castillo AN, Torre J, Munguia-Vega
 A, Reyes-Bonilla H (2018) Functional-biogeography of the reef fishes of the islands of the
 Gulf of California: integrating functional divergence into marine conservation. Global
 Ecology and Conservation 16:e00506
- Ordonez A, Svenning JC (2015) Geographic patterns in functional diversity deficits are linked to
 glacial-interglacial climate stability and accessibility. Global Ecology and Biogeography
 24:826-837
- Oliver EC, Donat MG, Burrows MT, Moore PJ, Smale DA, Alexander LV, Benthuysen JA, Feng
 M, Gupta AS, Hobday AJ, Holbrook NJ, Perkins-Kirkpatrick SE, Scannell HA, Straub SC,
 Wernberg, T. (2018). Longer and more frequent marine heatwaves over the past century.
 Nature communications, 9(1), 1-12.
- Pebesma E, Heuvelink G (2016) Spatio-temporal interpolation using gstat. RFID Journal 8:204 218
- Pellissier L, Leprieur F, Parravicini V, Cowman PF, Kulbicki M, Litsios G, Olsen SM, Wisz MS,
 Bellwood DR, Mouillot D (2014) Quaternary coral reef refugia preserved fish diversity.
 Science 344:1016-1019
- Piacenza SE, Barner AK, Benkwitt CE, Boersma KS, Cerny-Chipman EB, Ingeman KE,
 Kindinger TL, Lee JD, Lindsley AJ, Reimer JN (2015) Patterns and variation in benthic
 biodiversity in a large marine ecosystem. PLoS One 10:e0135135
- Price A, Keeling M, O'callaghan C (1999) Ocean-scale patterns of 'biodiversity' of Atlantic
 asteroids determined from taxonomic distinctness and other measures. Biological Journal
 of the Linnean Society 66:187-203
- Roberts TE, Bridge TC, Caley MJ, Madin JS, Baird AH (2019) Resolving the depth zonation
 paradox in reef-building corals. Ecology 100:e02761
- Rocha LA, Pinheiro HT, Shepherd B, Papastamatiou YP, Luiz OJ, Pyle RL, Bongaerts P (2018)
 Mesophotic coral ecosystems are threatened and ecologically distinct from shallow water
 reefs. Science 361:281-284
- Sala E, Mayorga J, Bradley D, Cabral RB, Atwood TB, Auber A, Cheung W, Costello C, Ferretti
 F, Friedlander AM (2021) Protecting the global ocean for biodiversity, food and climate.
 Nature 592:397-402
- 680 Sale PF (2013) The ecology of fishes on coral reefs. Elsevier

- Spalding M, Spalding MD, Ravilious C, Green EP (2001) World atlas of coral reefs. Univ of
 California Press
- Stefanoudis PV, Gress E, Pitt JM, Smith SR, Kincaid T, Rivers M, Andradi-Brown DA, Rowlands
 G, Woodall LC, Rogers AD (2019) Depth-dependent structuring of reef fish assemblages
 from the shallows to the rariphotic zone. Frontiers in Marine Science 6:307
- Venegas RM, Oliver T, Liu G, Heron SF, Clark SJ, Pomeroy N, Young C, Eakin CM, Brainard
 RE (2019) The rarity of depth refugia from coral bleaching heat stress in the western and
 central Pacific Islands. Scientific reports 9:1-12
- Villéger S, Brosse S, Mouchet M, Mouillot D, Vanni MJ (2017) Functional ecology of fish: current
 approaches and future challenges. Aquatic Sciences 79:783-801
- Weijerman M, Grüss A, Dove D, Asher J, Williams ID, Kelley C, Drazen JC (2019) Shining a
 light on the composition and distribution patterns of mesophotic and subphotic fish
 communities in Hawai 'i. Marine Ecology Progress Series 630:161-182
- 694 Wickel J, Jamon A, Pinault M, Durville P, Chabanet P (2014) Composition et structure des 695 peuplements ichtyologiques marins de l'île de Mayotte (sud-ouest de l'océan Indien).
- 696 Cybium: Revue Internationale d'Ichtyologie 38:179-203