Dual nomenclature in organic-walled dinoflagellate cysts I: concepts, methods and applications

Head Martin J. ^{1, *}, Mertens Kenneth ², Fensome Robert A. ³

¹ Department of Earth Sciences, Brock University, St. Catharines, Ontario, Canada

2 Ifremer, LITTORAL, F‐29900 Concarneau, France

³ Natural Resources Canada, Geological Survey of Canada (Atlantic), Bedford Institute of Oceanography, Dartmouth, Nova Scotia, Canada

* Corresponding author : Martin J. Head, email address : mjhead@brocku.ca

Abstract :

Dual nomenclature in dinoflagellates is supported under the current nomenclatural code for algae, fungi and plants and allows a fossil-defined (usually cyst) species to bear a name other than that of its equivalent non-fossil species, as established for example by incubation experiments. Two names can then apply to the same cyst morphotype, reflecting the separate concepts and criteria used for fossil- and non-fossil taxa. Fossil-species are normally and logically assigned to fossil-genera and non-fossil species to non-fossil genera, a practice that facilitates dual nomenclature. Inconsistencies and ambiguities arise when binomials combine the names of fossil- with non-fossil taxa. Examples of this hybridized nomenclature and its consequences are examined, with problems identified and potential solutions discussed. Accordingly, a new non-fossil genus Lingulaulax is proposed with Lingulaulax polyedra (von Stein 1883) comb. nov. as its type and equivalent to the fossil-species Lingulodinium machaerophorum (Deflandre and Cookson 1955) Wall 1967, along with the new combination Lingulaulax milneri (Murray and Whitting 1899); the genus Lingulodinium Wall 1967 is retained in its exclusively fossil status. The non-fossil name Gonyaulax ellegaardiae Mertens et al. 2015 is validly published herein

Keywords : Dinocyst, taxonomy, dual nomenclature, hybridized names, Lingulodinium, Lingulaulax

1. Introduction

-
- Separate taxonomic and nomenclatural traditions have arisen independently among
	- paleontologists studying fossils and biologists examining the entire life cycle. A fossil-
	- species has a holotype that is a fossil, and a non-fossil species has a holotype that is not a
- fossil (Gravendyck et al. 2021). When a named fossil-species is linked, usually by

Page 3 of 108

Palynology

 germination studies, to a named species defined using non-fossil (living) material, then two names are available for the same cyst morphotype; no formal rules determine which of these name is used. This is dual nomenclature. The International Code of Nomenclature for algae, fungi and plants (ICN, Turland et al. 2018), which governs the naming of dinoflagellate taxa, allows fossil- and non-fossil taxa to have separate names even when they are subsequently demonstrated to be linked (see Section 3 below). The ICN therefore sanctions the use of dual nomenclature. The confirmed fossil record of dinoflagellates (division Dinophyta) extends back to the Middle or Late Triassic (e.g. Mangerud et al. 2019) and has been studied extensively (e.g. Stover et al. 1996). This record is based almost exclusively on the cyst stage of the life cycle, as the motile stage rarely preserves (Head 1996). For most species with a fossil record, the cysts are organic-walled and appear in palynological preparations. This article primarily addresses formally named dinoflagellate taxa that produce organic-walled cysts, although many aspects will be relevant also to dinoflagellate cysts with calcareous walls. Downie et al. (1961) proposed that all dinoflagellates should be treated under the botanical code (now the ICN) rather than the International Code of Zoological Nomenclature (ICZN, Ride et al. 2020) to promote stability and consistency, but also

because the botanical code, unlike the ICZN, provides for the use distinct fossil taxa (the

successor to "form-genera" as referenced by Downie et al. 1961; see Subsection 3.1

below) which allows the use of dual nomenclature. Presently, all fossil dinoflagellate cyst

researchers and nearly all biologists treat dinoflagellates under this code. Nonetheless,

because dinoflagellates as a group include heterotrophs, mixotrophs, symbionts and

Page 5 of 108

Palynology

Page 7 of 108

Palynology

 11.8, with Arts. 13.3 and 52.1 also relevant (Head et al. 2016; Head et al. 2024). The ICN fundamentally distinguishes between non-fossil taxa and fossil-taxa (Art. 1.2), each of which will have its own particular circumscription. Art. 11.1 states that "The use of separate names is allowed for fossil-taxa that represent different parts, life-history stages, or preservational states of what may have been a single organismal taxon or even a single individual." Key developments applicable to fossil and non-fossil dinoflagellate nomenclature are discussed below and summarized in Table 3.

 As an aside, the inadmissibility of dual nomenclature for diatoms under the ICN may seem at odds with its availability for dinoflagellates when both algal groups have a resting stage and a vegetative stage. The difference, however, is that the vegetative stage in diatoms is geologically preservable, and this stage is most commonly studied in the fossil record. Because the taxonomy of living diatoms is also based on the vegetative stage, so extinct fossil-species based on the vegetative stage can be assigned to non-fossil genera using morphological criteria alone. Fossil spores have long been neglected in diatom studies (Suto 2004; Suto and Tanaki 2017) but, in parallel with dinoflagellates, fossil-species based on spores cannot easily be integrated into the generic scheme for non-fossil diatoms.

3.1. Historical development of plant fossil and algal nomenclature

 The naming of plant fossils long predates what was effectively the first botanical code as adopted by the International Biological Congress in Paris in 1867 (the Paris "Lois" or laws or rules; de Candolle 1867). The nomenclature of organs and fossils was subsequently discussed, and a revised edition of the "Lois" (de Candolle 1883) explicitly

Page 9 of 108

Palynology

 accepted that the rules also applied to plant fossils, although the Vienna Rules of 1906 (Briquet et al. 1906) were the first to acknowledge the special needs of fossils; these were addressed in the Brussels Rules of 1912 (Briquet 1912). With the establishment of the International Association of Plant Taxonomy (IAPT) at the 7th International Botanical Congress in Stockholm in 1950 (Cowan and Stafleu 1982), each successive iteration of the "Rules" was thereafter known as the "International Code of Botanical Nomenclature" (ICBN). This was to change only in 2012, with the Melbourne Code (McNeill et al. 2012) adopting the new title "International Code of Nomenclature for algae, fungi, and plants" (ICN) in acknowledgement that the fungi in particular are not considered plants. Of crucial significance was a growing awareness that the fragmentary nature of plant fossils required taxonomic approaches that were different from living plants, and separate nomenclatural rules have therefore evolved to meet these particular needs (Table 3). The Stockholm Code of 1952 (Lanjouw et al. 1952) introduced an Appendix on fossils, which included the concepts of "organ-genera" to reflect the different preserved parts of the plant and their modes of preservation, and "form-genera" as a small subset of organ-genera containing species grouped superficially and not generically related in the ordinary taxonomic sense (Cleal and Thomas 2010). The Montreal Code of 1961 (Lanjouw et al. 1961) defined the organ-genus as a genus assignable to a family, and a form-genus as unassignable to a family and hence "artificial in varying degree". The concept of organ-genus was discontinued in the Leningrad Code of 1978 (Stafleu et al. 1978), and the "morphotaxon" was introduced in the St Louis Code of 2000 (Greuter et al. 2000) as "a fossil taxon which, for nomenclatural purposes, comprises only the parts, life-history stages, or preservational states represented by the corresponding

latter as "non-fossil" plants (Voss et al. 1983), and the Melbourne Code of 2012 saw the

 elimination of "subfossil" which was introduced in the Stockholm Code of 1952 and had never been defined. This unambiguously allowed cysts recovered from modern naturally deposited sediments to be treated as fossils (Head 2003; Head et al. 2024; and Subsection

3.2 below).

Page 11 of 108

Palynology

Page 13 of 108

Palynology

 include motile-stage characteristics in his circumscription. Equivalence refers to "a noted morphological similarity or identicality between a fossil-taxon and a part or life-history stage of a non-fossil taxon at the same rank where the names of these two taxa are not considered synonyms" (Head et al. 2024). A synonym is "one of two or more names that apply to the same taxon" (ICN glossary). The difference between equivalence and synonymy rests upon that between paleontological and biological species concepts. A fossil-species may closely resemble, or appear identical with, the morphology of a resting cyst belonging to a named non-fossil species, thus allowing it to be considered "equivalent" although not taxonomically identical (as required of synonyms). The latter would require assumptions that all parts of the life cycle are the same and have remained so perhaps over tens of millions of years. This issue is common to all plankton groups but is exacerbated in dinoflagellates by the fact that non-fossil nomenclature is traditionally based on the motile cell, which rarely fossilizes (see Section 3, above). According to Principle 4 of the ICN, "Each taxonomic group with a particular circumscription, position, and rank can bear only one correct name, the earliest that is in accordance with the rules, except in specified cases." But this does not apply to a non-fossil species and its equivalent fossil-species as the circumscriptions are different even when the non-fossil species is circumscribed to include a description of the cyst. Accordingly, *Votadinium spinosum* as a fossil-defined species can be used as the correct name for the cyst. However, should *Votadinium spinosum* and *Protoperidinium claudicans* be considered conspecific and therefore synonymous, then *Protoperidinium claudicans* would be the correct name because it is defined by a non-fossil type and so has priority over that of a fossil-species (Art. 11.8). It should be emphasized that *equivalence* expresses a

 relationship between fossil-defined and non-fossil defined taxa, with the fossil (usually cyst) morphology operating as the intermediary.

 Dual and unified nomenclature are equally available under the ICN allowing the practitioner to exercise choice, which reflects separate taxonomic approaches. The purpose of the ICN is not to restrict such approaches but rather to facilitate their nomenclatural expression (Head et al. 2024). The suggestion by Ellegaard et al. (2018 p. 229) that dual nomenclature can be removed from formal nomenclature is not an option while practitioners wish to use it; the decision to use a dual or unified approach is thus a taxonomic rather than a nomenclatural one. Nonetheless, Elbrächter et al. (2023) proposed changes to the ICN that would diminish its support for dual nomenclature. Their proposals have been critiqued by Head et al. (2024). This raises the question of how a fossil- and a non-fossil taxon are distinguished. A fossil-taxon (diatoms excepted) is defined by a fossil nomenclatural type (Art. 1.2), which must be an actual specimen (Art. 8.5). For a fossil dinoflagellate taxon, this is assumed to be a resting cyst in all but a few cases. The ICN distinguishes fossil- from non-fossil material "by stratigraphic relations at the site of original occurrence". Importantly, "in cases of doubtful stratigraphic relations ... provisions for non-fossil taxa apply" (Art. 13.3). Effectively, the principle of superposition should apply, which is indeed the case for most naturally occurring marine sediments. Bioturbation, which is common in most marine sediments, may blur stratigraphic relations but on a broad scale does not completely destroy them. There is a long tradition of treating cysts from surface sediments as fossils, whether these sediments are from nearshore grab samples or from the tops of deep-sea cores. For example, taxa described from surface sediments around

 indeed be desirable for the holotype to have cell contents because these (especially the cellulosic endospore) keep the cyst wall inflated, allowing its morphological details to be studied more easily. The holotypes of *Echinidinium karaense* and *Islandinium brevispinosum* provide examples of this, and a specimen of *Islandinium minutum* with cell contents (pl. 1, figs. d–i of Head et al. 2001) was used to elucidate the unusual archeopyle style in this common arctic species. Dinoflagellate cysts with preserved endospores are known from Middle Pleistocene deposits as old as 767 ka (fig. 7b, g in Balota et al. 2021).

 A non-fossil species is defined by a non-fossil nomenclatural type. The type can be either a specimen or an illustration (Art. 8.1), although for algae from 1 January 2007 an illustration cannot be used (Art. 40.4) unless "there are technical difficulties of specimen preservation or if it is impossible to preserve a specimen that would show the features attributed to the taxon by the author of the name" (Art. 40.5). In the case of a specimen, the organism is not usually living (Art. 8.4), as noted above. Traditionally, non-fossil dinoflagellate species have been typified using an illustration of the motile stage. However, Ellegaard et al. (2002) typified the name *Gonyaulax baltica* using a cyst from culture rather than a motile stage. It is not clear whether the holotype is the cyst itself (a curated dead specimen on a scanning electron microscope [SEM] stub) or the SEM illustration of it (fig. 3A in Ellegaard et al. 2002), but either is acceptable under the ICN because publication predates 1 January 2007. The observations were from a living unialgal culture (one grown from a single wild resting cyst), and this appropriately allowed the protologue (everything associated with a name at its valid publication) to include information on both the cyst and motile stage. In typifying *Gymnodinium nolleri*,

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Palynology

 Ellegaard and Moestrup (1999) used a fixed (dead) and embedded sample of unialgal culture which presumably included cysts as well as motile cells, an acceptable holotype under the ICN (Art. 8.2). Their figure 1 illustrates both cyst and motile stages of *Gymnodinium nolleri* from this unialgal culture which, now preserved, serves as the holotype.

3.3. Problematic cases

 In defining the non-fossil *Gonyaulax ellegaardiae* from Izmir Bay, Turkey, Mertens et al. (2015) attempted to establish a dual nomenclatural relationship between it and the fossil-species *Spiniferites pachydermus*, the latter having been described from the subsurface Pleistocene or Holocene of the coastal plain of Israel (as *Hystrichosphaera furcata* var. *pachyderma* in Rossignol et al. 1964). Mertens et al. (2015) selected two illustrations (their figs. 2 and 5a–i) as the holotype. Their fig. 5a–i illustrates an incubated cyst from which a thecate cell (their fig. 2) emerged. While it is sound biological practice to illustrate both stages of the life cycle, only one illustration can be used as a holotype; moreover, from 1 January 2007 only a specimen can be designated unless there are technical difficulties with specimen preservation (Art. 40.5). The specimens illustrated as types were not preserved (Mertens et al. 2015, p. 564) owing to such difficulties. Here we designate fig. 2 of Mertens et al. (2015) as the holotype of *Gonyaulax ellegaardiae* Mertens, Aydin, Takano, Yamaguchi and Matsuoka in Mertens et al. (2015), completing requirements for valid publication. This illustration is of a specimen of the motile stage. Although Mertens et al. (2015) considered *Gonyaulax ellegaardiae* to be equivalent to *Spiniferites pachydermus*, this relationship appears to be incorrect and a new fossil-

> species will be formally proposed (MJH and KNM in prep.). A dual nomenclatural approach allows both species, each typified by its own holotype, to remain as useful individual concepts despite their problematic relationship.

 Reid (1974, 1977) established numerous fossil-species that were typified using cyst specimens recovered mostly from intertidal surface sediments around the British Isles, as noted in Subsection 3.2 above. The status of these holotypes as fossils is widely accepted on the basis that they were obtained from naturally deposited sediment where the principle of superposition broadly applies. In contrast, the genus *Echinidinium* and its holotype species *Echinidinium granulatum* were typified by a cyst recovered from a sediment trap (Zonneveld 1997) where stratigraphic relations could not be reasonably inferred (Head 2003). The genus and its holotype species were therefore to be treated as non-fossil taxa (Head 2003). The genus and selected species were validated only when Head et al. (2001) provided Latin diagnoses, as then required for non-fossil taxa. Other species were validated by Mertens et al. (2020).

 A similar example involves the genus *Brigantedinium* and its holotype species *Brigantedinium simplex*. The type specimen, known then as *Chytroeisphaeridia simplicia*, was recovered from a settling tray at the bottom of the aquarium at Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution (Wall 1965). This specimen cannot be treated as a fossil because sediments accumulated in such settling trays are prone to disturbance and the trays themselves are periodically emptied. Stratigraphic relations are therefore doubtful at best, and where doubt exists provisions for non-fossil taxa apply (Art. 13.3). However, because these taxa had been proposed as fossil-taxa, no Latin diagnoses were provided.

Palynology

Page 20 of 108

 subgenera proposed by Kofoid (1911; *Gonyaulax*, *Fusigonyaulax*, *Steiniella*, *Acanthogonyaulax*) very complicated. In general, the motile stage of *Gonyaulax* has a more conserved morphology than that of its cyst counterparts, although small differences in motile stage morphology that might allow placement in other genera have been noted in some species, including *Gonyaulax polygramma* and *Gonyaulax geomunensis* (Kim et al. 2023) and *Gonyaulax hyalina* (Escalera et al. 2018; but see Carbonell-Moore and Mertens 2019). A similar number of fossil-defined genera has been assigned to the large non- fossil genus *Protoperidinium*. Harland (1982) attempted to integrate these fossil-genera by reassigning them as sections of the genus *Protoperidinium*. However, the resulting four-element name (genus, subgenus, section, species) while informative was an unwieldy solution not adopted by the community (see Ellegaard et al. 2018 for further discussion). This community includes a large and active group of palynologists/actuopalynologists working on fossil dinoflagellate cysts as well as many working on relationships with motile forms and utilising genetic techniques on cysts and motile forms. The various sections of *Protoperidinium* conform to a certain extent with the molecular phylogenies for this genus, although some are polyphyletic (Mertens et al. 2017b). More data are certainly needed before a thorough revision of the genus

Protoperidinium is possible.

 Another difficulty emerges when a fossil-genus contains both extant and extinct species. For example, the fossil-genus *Bitectatodinium* is typified by the holotype, a fossil, of the extant *Bitectatodinium tepikiense*. This species had been linked by incubation studies (Lewis et al. 2001) to the non-fossil *Gonyaulax digitale*. This

Page 21 of 108

Palynology

 long history extending into the 19th century (e.g. Ehrenberg 1837; Mantell 1850, p.191). Although most fossil dinoflagellate cyst genera are now extinct, a few extend back tens, or even hundreds of millions of years. An example is *Spiniferites*, which, through its perhaps 120-million-year history, has accommodated more than 100 species (Fensome et al. 2019): it is unknowable whether the motile equivalent of most of these species would be assignable to *Gonyaulax*.

 There may also be uncertainty in cyst-motile equivalencies, as with *Gonyaulax digitale*, which has been linked both to *Spiniferites bentorii* by Wall (1965), Wall and Dale (1967, p. 352) and Dodge (1989, p. 283) and to *Bitectatodinium tepikiense* by Lewis et al. (2001); it is now known to be linked to neither (Gu et al. 2021; Table 2). While such ambiguities are usually the result of uncertainty in the identification of the non-fossil species, they are avoided by continuing to use fossil-defined names for the cysts. However, the obstacle of uncertain cyst-motile equivalence is diminishing. Molecular genetics now provides an excellent and increasingly affordable tool for identifying species with greater certainty than by relying exclusively on morphological characters. Molecular approaches can be used to link the motile stage definitively with the cyst. Establishing correct equivalencies in combination with ribotyping is important as these 500 approaches are intrinsic to DNA databases used in metabarcoding such as PR² (Guillou et al. 2013) and SILVA (Quast et al. 2013). Cultures of *Gonyaulax*, for instance, display enormous variations and aberrations that make unambiguous identification of species often difficult without such genetic characterization. Fossil-defined taxonomies therefore should adapt where practicable to incorporate these new advances. In some cases, however, neither cyst nor thecal morphology adequately reflect the diversity revealed in

Page 23 of 108

Palynology

 presently circumscribed might therefore be polyphyletic, raising the question of whether *Multispinula* and *Selenopemphix* should be treated as separate fossil-genera (Mertens et al. 2017b). If such separation were justified, attention could focus on the offset of the archeopyle (epicystal asymmetry) and details of ornamentation. Molecular phylogeny therefore allows new questions to be asked with respect to morphology-based cyst taxonomy. The cyst-defined non-fossil genus *Brigantedinium* is certainly polyphyletic, and potential solutions are discussed below.

 Nonetheless, an extinct fossil-species, with rare exception, can only be defined by the morphological features of a single stage in the life cycle. There is no certainty that an extant fossil-species in the geological past produced a motile stage identical to its modern counterpart. This is especially true of extant fossil-species with long stratigraphic ranges, such as *Tectatodinium pellitum* and *Lingulodinium machaerophorum*, both of which evolved in the Paleocene (Head and Nøhr-Hansen 1999, and Heilmann-Clausen 1985, respectively).

 Dapsilidinium pastielsii was described from the Lower Eocene of southeastern England (Davey and Williams 1966) and had its inception in the Early Paleocene or before. Living cysts equated with this fossil-species have been incubated to yield a motile stage belonging to an as-yet-unnamed non-fossil species and genus (Mertens et al. 2014). Following the practice of dual nomenclature, and pending further study, this non-fossil species will be formally described as new, based on all aspects of its life cycle and molecular characterization, and typified by a motile cell or its illustration. It will bear a new name and be assigned to a non-fossil genus. *Dapsilidinium pastielsii* will then be considered equivalent to, but not conspecific with, this new non-fossil species.

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Page 27 of 108

Palynology

Palynology

 As a non-fossil, this species at the time of publication was required to have a Latin diagnosis, and because it was not provided by Wall (1965) the name was not validly published. In addition, Reid (1977) did not provide a Latin diagnosis for his *Brigantedinium* although this was required for a non-fossil genus. In fact, *Brigantedinium* and *Brigantedinium simplex* were not validly published until Lentin and Williams (1993, p. 67) provided Latin diagnoses and complete citations for them (Fensome et al. 2019). It remains that both the name of the genus *Brigantedinium* and that of its holotype species, *Brigantedinium simplex*, are defined by a non-fossil type specimen. Seven fossil-species have since been assigned to *Brigantedinium* (Fensome et al. 2019), representing another category of hybridized names (see Subsection 6.4). *Brigantedinium simplex* has been identified by excystment studies as the cyst of the non-fossil species *Protoperidinium conicoides* (Wall and Dale 1968; Head 1996). Because both names are defined by non-fossil types, they compete for priority and *Protoperidinium conicoides* becomes the senior heterotypic synonym. The genus *Brigantedinium* then becomes a junior heterotypic synonym of *Protoperidinium*. The complication is that *Brigantedinium* is an ecologically important Quaternary cyst genus (de Vernal et al. 2020) represented by eight species including *Brigantedinium simplex* (Mertens et al. 2020)*.* Of these, seven are typified by specimens from ocean-floor sediment and are treated as fossils. Hence a situation emerges where fossil-defined species are assigned to a non-fossil defined genus that is now a junior heterotypic

synonym and therefore unavailable.

 The least disruptive solution *prima facie* would be for the generic name *Brigantedinium* and that of its holotype species, *Brigantedinium simplex*, to be conserved

Page 31 of 108

Palynology

 and phylogenetic outlier, would appropriately be transferred to a new fossil-genus. In practical terms, most *Brigantedinium* species are distinguished from one another primarily by the archeopyle shape, which is often obscured in palynological preparations; except for *Brigantedinium simplex* which can be identified also by additional traces of tabulation. The useful term *Brigantedinium* spp. would therefore be sustained. Meanwhile, as a practical solution for routine counting, where critical details of the archeopyle are often not discernible, we recommend use of the informal collective term "round brown cysts" as this will include all species presently assignable to the genus *Brigantedinium*. The cyst-defined genus *Echinidinium* and its holotype species *Echinidinium granulatum* were not validly published by Zonneveld (1997) because Latin diagnoses had not been provided. This was necessary at the time because the holotype of *Echinidinium granulatum* had been recovered from a sediment trap suspended in the water column and, with doubtful stratigraphic relations (Art. 13.3), could not therefore be considered a fossil

(Head 2003). Head et al. (2001) validated both the genus *Echinidinium* and its holotype

 species, *E. granulatum*, by providing Latin diagnoses. Eight validly published cyst-defined species have been assigned to the genus *Echinidinium*, of which seven are

typified by specimens from ocean floor sediment and are therefore treated as fossils.

Hence, as with *Brigantedinium*, the genus *Echinidinium* is a widely reported non-fossil

cyst genus, proposed with the intention of being a fossil-genus, and to which fossil-

species have been assigned. Cysts of *Echinidinium granulatum* have been incubated and

genetic sequencing performed, allowing attribution to a species not previously described

and close to *Protoperidinium monovelum* (KNM unpublished data). If *Echinidinium*

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Palynology

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

 non-fossil species *Protoperidinium tricingulatum*, which had been diagnosed using both thecal and cyst characteristics (Kawami et al. 2009), to the genus *Islandinium*. This decision was supported at the time by molecular phylogeny showing *Protoperidinium tricingulatum* closely related to *Islandinium minutum* (Potvin et al. 2013). In doing so, Potvin et al. (2013) emended the genus *Islandinium* to include cysts with apical archeopyles that can be theropylic, as in *Protoperidinium tricingulatum*, as well as saphopylic.

 There are presently no extinct species assigned to *Islandinium*, but were this to happen, such species would not fully satisfy the circumscription of this genus as emended by Potvin et al. (2013) because information on the motile stage would not be known, or indeed, be knowable. It is a matter of taxonomic choice whether to accept the emendation of Potvin et al. (2013), although in maintaining dual nomenclature we advocate the retention of *Islandinium* in its status as a fossil-genus. A proposal to erect an equivalent non-fossil genus is in preparation.

 A further issue exists. *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* was established by Potvin et al. (2018) to accommodate cysts that have pronounced barbs on the processes; *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *minutum* (autonym) by default represents morphotypes with smooth to minutely ornamented process surfaces. *Islandinium pacificum* was similarly erected by Gurdebeke et al. (2019) for cysts with pronounced barbs on their processes, differing only from *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* in having a smooth rather than faintly granulate central body surface. Both *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* and *Islandinium pacificum* are typified by holotypes that are empty cysts from ocean

Page 35 of 108

Palynology

 sediments and so can be treated as fossils. Both are diagnosed exclusively on cyst morphology.

 Islandinium minutum subsp. *barbatum* was not successfully germinated, but molecular phylogeny performed on the cysts gave results that were largely indistinguishable from *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *minutum*. This supported the decision to erect *barbatum* as a subspecies rather than a separate species. The theca of *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* would presumably therefore conform with that of *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *minutum* as documented by Potvin et al. (2013), although this has yet to be confirmed. *Islandinium pacificum* was, in contrast, successfully incubated and the emergent theca identified as *Protoperidinium mutsuense*. The thecal morphology of *Protoperidinium mutsuense* differs from that of *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *minutum* in specific details but according to Gurdebeke et al. (2019) broadly conforms to the thecal morphology attributed to the genus *Islandinium* by Potvin et al. (2013). Both *Protoperidinium mutsuense* and *Islandinium minutum* are assignable to the *Americanum* subclade of the *Monovela* clade of the genus *Protoperidinium* (Gurdebeke et al. 2019). Detailed comparative research is needed to establish whether *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* and *Islandinium pacificum* can be distinguished from one another in routine palynological analysis. If they can, then both names stand. If they cannot, but can be routinely separated from *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *minutum*, then the name *Islandinium pacificum* should be used – even though *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* (Potvin et al. 2018) was published before *Islandinium pacificum* (Gurdebeke et al. 2019), "a name has no priority outside the rank at which it is published"

(Art. 11.2). Either way, this need not affect the application of dual nomenclature,

> although it is possible that *Islandinium pacificum* if synonymized with *Islandinium minutum* subsp. *barbatum* will then represent two non-fossil species. The fossil-genus *Lingulodinium* is typified by the holotype of *Lingulodinium machaerophorum* from the Miocene of Balcombe Bay, Australia (Deflandre and Cookson 1955). The genus name refers to the "small tongue" (lingula) formed on the epicyst after the release of precingular plates during archeopyle formation. The equivalent theca- defined non-fossil species is *Gonyaulax polyedra* (Wall and Dale 1966, 1967, 1968), described from the Baltic Sea off Kiel, Germany by von Stein (1883) and since restudied from the type locality (Tillman et al. 2021). Dodge (1989) emended *Lingulodinium* to include thecal characteristics and transferred *Gonyaulax polyedra* to it, as *Lingulodinium polyedra*, along with another non-fossil species *Gonyaulax milneri*, as *Lingulodinium milneri*. *Lingulodinium milneri* is not known to produce a cyst. No other non-fossil species have been assigned to the genus *Lingulodinium*. Thirteen fossil-species are attributed to this genus including the holotype species (Fensome et al. 2019), collectively extending the genus back to the Late Cretaceous. Since most of the fossil-defined species are extinct, determining whether their motile stages would have conformed to the emended diagnosis given by Dodge (1989) is practically impossible. Nonetheless, *Lingulodinium* is distinct from *Gonyaulax*, the holotype species of which is *Gonyaulax spinifera*, using both morphological (Dodge 1989) and molecular phylogenetic (e.g. Orr et al. 2012; Mertens et al. 2015, 2017a; Tillmann et al. 2021) criteria. The genus *Lingulodinium* is accordingly now placed in the family Lingulodiniaceae whereas *Gonyaulax* (as presently understood and including *Gonyaulax spinifera*) is placed in the
Page 37 of 108

Palynology

species. No Latin diagnosis was provided by Wall and Dale but this was not needed for a

Page 39 of 108

Palynology

6.5. A non-fossil theca-defined species assigned to a fossil-defined genus

 Protoperidinium stellatum was described, as *Peridinium stellatum*, from the plankton at Woods Hole, Massachusetts, U.S.A. (Wall in Wall and Dale 1968). A preserved motile 888 stage was chosen as the holotype (Wall in Wall and Dale 1968, pl. 3, fig. 16), this specimen having been incubated from a cyst collected from this plankton. The diagnosis is based on the morphology of both the cyst and the incubated motile stage. Bradford (1975) subsequently described the fossil-genus *Stelladinium* for species conforming to the general morphology of the cysts of *Protoperidinium stellatum*. He established

 Palynology

Page 43 of 108

Page 45 of 108

Palynology

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Palynology

 heterotypic synonym of the large non-fossil genus *Protoperidinium.* Moreover, the genus *Brigantedinium* is polyphyletic and *Brigantedinium simplex* a morphological outlier. Our preferred solution would be to conserve the name *Brigantedinium simplex* with a new (fossil) type and transfer to a new fossil-genus, and the name *Brigantedinium* conserved using as a new type the holotype of one of the fossil-species of *Brigantedinium*. With the exception of *Brigantedinium simplex*, this would allow *Brigantedinium* and all its fossil- species to continue being used as they are presently. The informal term "round brown cysts" would remain a useful collective label for all these cyst morphotypes.

 The cyst-defined *Echinidinium* is similarly a non-fossil genus because its type, the holotype of *Echinidinium granulatum*, is a non-fossil specimen. Incubation and genetic sequencing studies have linked *Echinidinium granulatum* to an undescribed species of *Protoperidinium.* Upon the publication of that new *Protoperidinium* species, the genus *Echinidinium* and its holotype species *Echinidinium granulatum* will become junior heterotypic synonyms unless these names are conserved with a new (fossil) type, which we recommend as it will then allow *Echinidinium* and all its species to be used as originally intended.

 Based on incubation studies, the fossil-genus *Islandinium* and its holotype species *Islandinium minutum* were emended by Potvin et al. (2013) to include characters of the motile cell. If an extinct species should be assigned to *Islandinium* an ambiguity will exist because its motile stage would be unknowable. Following the application of dual nomenclature, *Islandinium* is here treated as a fossil-genus as had been initially intended, and a proposal is being prepared to create an equivalent non-fossil genus. The fossil-genus *Lingulodinium* is typified by the holotype of *Lingulodinium*

Page 49 of 108

Palynology

 completed herein by designating one of these illustrations (fig. 2 in Mertens et al., 2015) 123 as the holotype.

 In order to improve taxonomic integration between extant fossilizable cyst morphotypes and those of deeper geological time, we advocate the establishment of equivalent fossil-defined names for *all* such extant morphotypes where practicable. The application of such names will benefit from the typification of a cyst as a holotype. This exercise, illustrated by the case of *Protoperidinium stellatum* cysts (above), should take advantage of molecular as well as other phylogenetic evidence when constructing such a taxonomy. Dual nomenclature in dinoflagellates should be consistently available for 1131 those who wish to use it. **Acknowledgements** Haifeng Gu is thanked for providing the basis for Figure 4. MJH acknowledges support from a Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada Discovery Grant. KNM was financially supported by the French National Research Agency (ANR) PhenoMap project, ANR-20-CE02-0025. RAF acknowledges the support of Natural Resources Canada; this is NRCan contribution number 20230058. We are most grateful to P.J. Mudie and the four journal reviewers, including V. Pospelova, all of whom provided helpful and positive comments. URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Page 53 of 108

Page 55 of 108

Palynology

 $\overline{2}$

I–V and 1751–1947.

Palynology

Page 65 of 108

Page 77 of 108

 $\overline{0}$

Page 83 of 108

Palynology

 Protoperidinium subinerme (its fossil-defined equivalent being *Selenopemphix nephroides*) has not yet been sequenced. The maximum likelihood (ML) bootstrap support values (ML) over 50 and Bayesian posterior probabilities (PP) over 0.7 are shown at the nodes (ML/PP), where an asterisk (*) indicates maximal support. Clades within the *Protoperidinium* sensu stricto clade are shown. The scale bar represents inferred evolutionary distance in changes/site. From fig. 3 of Mertens et al. (2017b). Figure 3. Conceptual foundation for dual nomenclature. Biological species concepts potentially incorporate all aspects of the life cycle as well as genetic and other molecular information on the living organism. The species is typified by a non-fossil specimen or illustration, and a single non-fossil species name applies to all parts of the life history and may include information from genome sequencing. The paleontological species concept is, with rare exception, confined to the morphology of the fossilized resting cyst wall, although the significance of morphological attributes may be informed by independent evidence of phylogeny (e.g. molecular) where species are extant. The species is typified by a fossil specimen, and a fossil-species name is applied. Living cysts provide the overlap between these two nomenclatural systems: dual nomenclature allows both names *Selenopemphix nephroides* and (the cyst of) *Protoperidinium subinerme* to be used for 2001 the illustrated cyst according to context and preference. The SEM illustration of *Protoperidinium subinerme* is from Hansen and Larson (1992) and the illustration of *Selenopemphix nephroides* is from modern sediments of the Gulf of Mexico (KNM, unpublished).

Table 21. Taxonomic-All taxonomic names cited in the text, with full authorial attributions. A (◉) indicates that the type is treated as a fossil for nomenclatural purposes.

Genus *Alexandrium* Halim 1960*

Alexandrium australiense Murray in John et al., 20914 *Alexandrium catenella* (Whedon and Kofoid 1936) Balech 1985 *Alexandrium mediterraneum* John in John et al. 2014 *Alexandrium pacificum* Litaker in John et al. 2014 *Alexandrium tamarense* (Lebour 1925) Balech 1995

Genus *Ataxiodinium* Reid 1974 (◉) *Ataxiodinium choane* Reid 1974 (◉)

Genus *Amylax* Meunier 1910

Genus *Bitectatodinium* Wilson 1973 (◉) *Bitectatodinium tepikiense* Wilson 1973 (◉)

Genus *Brigantedinium* Reid 1977 ex Lentin and Williams 1993 *Brigantedinium auranteum* Reid 1977 ex Lentin and Williams 1993 (◉) *Brigantedinium majusculum* Reid 1977 ex Lentin and Williams 1993 (◉) *Brigantedinium simplex* Wall 1965 ex Lentin and Williams 1993

Genus *Chytroeisphaeridia* (Sarjeant 1962) Downie and Sarjeant 1965 (◉) *Chytroeisphaeridia simplicia* Wall 1965 (now *Brigantedinium simplex*)

Genus *Dapsilidinium* Bujak et al. 1980 *Dapsilidinium pastielsii* (Davey and Williams 1966) Bujak et al. 1980 (●)

Genus *Desotodinium* De Schepper, Head and Louwye 2004 (◉) *Desotodinium wrennii* De Schepper, Head and Louwye 2004 (◉)

Genus *Diplopsalopsi*s Meunier 1910 *Diplopsalopsis orbicularis* (Paulsen 1907) Meunier 1910

Genus *Dubridinium* Reid 1977 (◉) *Dubridinium caperatum* Reid 1977 (◉) *Dubridinium cassiculum* Reid 1977 (◉) *Dubridinium cavatum* Reid 1977 (◉) *Dubridinium ulsterum* Reid 1977 (◉)

Genus *Echinidinium* Zonneveld 1997 ex Head, Harland and Matthiessen 2001 *Echinidinium granulatum* Zonneveld 1997 ex Head, Harland and Matthiessen 2001 *Echinidinium karaense* Head, Harland and Matthiessen 2001 (◉)

Genus *Goniodoma* Stein 1883

under the ICZN (see text for discussion), athough according to Wilson et al. (2023) the ICZN

commissioners will be asked to provide a ruling on this matter.

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Table 3. Summary of changes to the nomenclatural Codes that affect those fossil- and non-fossil algal taxa, as explained in the text, with reference to each International Botanical Congress (IBC) from 1950 and the published Code resulting from it.

- 55
- 56 57
- 58
- 59
- 60

Page 101 of 108

Palynology

Figure 1. Phylogeny of the fossil-genera Ataxiodinium, Bitectatodinium, Impagidinium, Spiniferites and Tectatodinium inferred from partial large subunit (LSU) rRNA gene sequences using Bayesian inference. These genera have all been linked by incubation studies to the non-fossil Gonyaulax spinifera and Gonyaulax polygramma complexes, and all are paraphlyetic. These genera nonetheless all include extinct species, and as presently circumscribed are needed in fossil cyst nomenclature. Branch lengths drawn to scale; scale bar indicates number of nucleotide substitutions per site. Numbers on branches are statistical support values to clusters on their right (left: Bayesian posterior probabilities; right: maximum likelihood (ML) bootstrap support values). Only Bayesian posterior probabilities above 0.9 and ML bootstrap support values above 50 are shown. An asterisk $(*)$ indicates maximal support (BI posterior probability = 1.0, ML bootstrap support = 100). The scale bar represents inferred evolutionary distance in changes/site. From fig. 77 of Gu et al. (2021).

172x151mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Page 102 of 108

Figure 2. Phylogeny of the Protoperidinium sensu stricto clade inferred from LSU rRNA gene sequences using Bayesian inference, and its taxonomic implications for the fossil-genera Selenopemphix and Multispinula. Selenopemphix undulata plots within the Tabulata clade whereas Protoperidinium conicum, to which Selenopemphix (formerly Multispinula) quanta has been attributed, groups within the Conica 2 clade, suggesting that Selenopemphix and Multispinula might be treated as separate fossil-genera. Protoperidinium subinerme (its fossil-defined equivalent being Selenopemphix nephroides) has not yet been sequenced. The maximum likelihood (ML) bootstrap support values (ML) over 50 and Bayesian posterior probabilities (PP) over 0.7 are shown at the nodes (ML/PP), where an asterisk (*) indicates maximal support. Clades within the Protoperidinium sensu stricto clade are shown. The scale bar represents inferred evolutionary distance in changes/site. From fig. 3 of Mertens et al. (2017b).

173x103mm (300 x 300 DPI)

 $\mathbf{1}$ $\overline{2}$ $\mathsf{3}$

-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-

Figure 3. Conceptual foundation for dual nomenclature. Biological species concepts potentially incorporate all aspects of the life cycle as well as genetic and other molecular information on the living organism. The species is typified by a non-fossil specimen or illustration, and a single non-fossil species name applies to all parts of the life history and may include information from genome sequencing. The paleontological species concept is, with rare exception, confined to the morphology of the fossilized resting cyst wall, although the significance of morphological attributes may be informed by independent evidence of phylogeny (e.g. molecular) where species are extant. The species is typified by a fossil specimen, and a fossil-species name is applied. Living cysts provide the overlap between these two nomenclatural systems: dual nomenclature allows both names Selenopemphix nephroides and (the cyst of) Protoperidinium subinerme to be used for the illustrated cyst according to context and preference. The SEM illustration of Protoperidinium subinerme is from Hansen and Larson (1992) and the illustration of Selenopemphix nephroides is from modern sediments of the Gulf of Mexico (KNM, unpublished).

88x74mm (300 x 300 DPI)

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Page 107 of 108

Palynology

URL: http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tpal

Figure 5. Lingulaulax polyedra (von Stein 1883) comb. nov. A, B, D, E, tracings of different motile stage cells from an SEM stub (strain K3-G8 isolated from the type locality off Kiel in the Baltic Sea) which serves as the epitype (from figs. 4B, 4G, 4D, and 4H respectively in Tillmann et al. 2021); ventral, apical, dorsal, and antapical views respectively. C and F, schematic representation of C, apical pore complex and surrounding plates (from fig. 6C in Tillmann et al. 2021), and F, mid-ventral area showing details of sulcus and surrounding plates (from fig. 6D in Tillmann et al. 2021). Solid green arrows indicate plate overlap, open green arrows indicate uncertain direction of plate overlap, and the red dashed line indicates line along which plates separate during cell division (from fig. 6 in Tillmann et al. 2021). Scale bars = 10 μ m. Modified kofoidian plate labeling includes: APC = apical pore complex, $vp = ventral pore$, $cp = cover plate$, po = pore plate, $X = X$ -plate; and the sulcal plates, as = anterior, ras = right accessory, ms = median, rs = right, $Is = left$, as = anterior. The first postcingular homologue $(*1'')$ is designated as such because it lies within the sulcus and may not contact the cingular plate series.

196x141mm (300 x 300 DPI)